



Strasbourg, 24 August 2012

CDL-JU-PV(2012)001*
Or. Engl.

EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW
(VENICE COMMISSION)

**11th meeting of the Joint Council on
Constitutional Justice**

Brno, Czech Republic

31 May - 1 June 2012

MEETING REPORT

**This document has been classified restricted on the date of issue. Unless the Venice Commission decides otherwise, it will be declassified a year after its issue according to the rules set up in Resolution CM/Res(2001)6 on access to Council of Europe documents.*

A. Training session

Ms Anne Rasson and Mr Rik Ryckeboer from the Constitutional Court of Belgium together with the Secretariat organised a training session in the morning of 31 May 2012. This session was held to acquaint new liaison officers with the preparation of *précis*, the IT-tools at their disposal with respect to their contributions for the Bulletin on Constitutional Law and the CODICES database and their participation in the Classic Venice Forum and the Newsgroup.

B. Joint Council meeting

The meeting of the Joint Council was opened by Mr Pavel Rychetsky, President of the Constitutional Court of the Czech Republic, who welcomed the Joint Council to his Court and praised its good work in increasing co-operation among constitutional courts and courts of equivalent jurisdiction.

Ms Juliane Alberini-Boillat, the Co-Chair of the Joint Council, agreed with Mr Rychetsky's comments on the good co-operation between these courts and the importance of the network of liaison officers from these courts. She thanked him for hosting the meeting of the Joint Council on the premises of the Constitutional Court of the Czech Republic.

1. Adoption of the Agenda

The Agenda was adopted without any changes.

2. Election of a Co-President on behalf of the liaison officers

Ms Anne Rasson was elected Co-President of the Joint Council on behalf of the liaison officers.

3. Communication by the Secretariat

Mr Dürr informed the participants about the appointment of new liaison officers: Ms Mateenah Hunter replacing Ms Calli Ferreira for the Constitutional Court of South Africa; Mr Hideaki Gunji replacing Mr Hiroyuki Minami for the Supreme Court of Japan; Mr Morten Juul Gjermundbo replacing Mr Nicolai Winther for the Supreme Court of Denmark; Ms Neola Ruço replacing Mr Ardit Hysa for the Constitutional Court of Albania; Ms Tina Prešeren replacing Ms Urska Umek for the Constitutional Court of Slovenia; Mr Richard McNamara replacing Mr Tom Daly for the Supreme Court of Ireland; Mr Luis Claudio Coni replacing Mr Joao Batista do Nascimento Magalhaes for the Supreme Court of Brazil, Ms Marieta Safta replacing Ms Ruxandra Sabareanu for the Constitutional Court of Romania and Ms Keren Azulay replacing Mr Yigal Mersel for the Supreme Court of Israel.

As regards the Secretariat of the Venice Commission, the participants were informed that Ms Charlotte de Broutelles had joined the Division of Constitutional Justice since the last meeting of the Joint Council. She could unfortunately not come to this meeting as she was dealing with a seminar that was taking place in Jordan regarding the establishment of a constitutional court in that country.

The participants were also informed that a new Division on Neighbourhood Policy was created within the Secretariat of the Venice Commission that deals mainly with countries of Central Asia and Arab countries.

4. Updating data on the participating courts

The participants shared their views on the personalised emails they receive from the Secretariat on a regular basis. In particular, they suggested that instead of having a webpage of the Venice Commission setting out the list of judges for each court, it would be easier to have a direct link to the webpage of the courts in question. This would ensure that the information was accurate and up-to-date.

The problems encountered during the process of resetting passwords for the restricted website were raised. Mr Dürr explained that these problems could not be resolved by the Secretariat as they were linked to the IT server of the Council of Europe.

The question was then raised whether the need for a password and a restricted site could be reconsidered since the information relating to the composition of the Courts was not restricted. Mr Dürr explained that although this may be true for some of the information on the site, this would create problems for the Classic Venice Forum as well as for the Newsgroup where liaison officers can share information about pending cases that should not be made public.

The liaison officers are invited to send the Secretariat the exact address of the link to the webpage that contains the list/composition of the judges of their respective courts.

5. Venice Forum

5.a “Classic” Venice Forum

Ms Tanja Gerwien congratulated the liaison officers for their very active use of the Venice Forum since the last meeting of the Joint Council in Ankara in June 2011. The Secretariat received 35 questions since then, from 18 courts to which 537 replies were sent so far.

Participants were informed that questions covered such issues as pension rights of judges, reverse discrimination, right to prior notice of dismissal, serving legal documents by email and the question of conscientious objection by civil servants (outside the military service).

Ms Gerwien thanked the liaison officers for their interesting requests and for taking time out of their busy schedules to answer the questions from other liaison officers.

Year	No. of questions received (in total)	No. of courts which sent questions	No. of answers received
2011	30	14	467
2012	5	4	70
TOTAL	35	18	537

Link: <http://www.venice.coe.int/JU/VeniceForum/>

5.b Forum Newsgroup

Mr Dürr reiterated that that this forum is open to liaison officers to post information regarding their courts (appointments of presidents, secretaries general, important decisions, conferences etc.). He informed the participants that recent news posted on the forum included, for example, the appointment of Mr Tayeb Belaiz as the new president of the Constitutional Court of Algeria, that Mr Asher Dan Grunis was appointed new Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of Israel and

that the Constitutional Courts of Andorra and Italy had joined the WCCJ as the 56th and 57th member respectively.

Liaison officers are invited to use this forum more actively. They can do so directly or they may send the information to the Secretariat who will then post it for them.

Link: <https://cwsml.coe.int/team21/veniceforum>

5.c. Venice-Monnet Forum

Mr Dürr informed the participants that this forum was not very active and that the idea behind its creation was to provide a platform for discussion for courts and academics. However, the feedback the Secretariat received was that its technical aspects (resetting the password etc.) were too complicated, putting people off from using it.

The other issue raised with respect to the lack of activity on this forum was that academics were under great pressure to publish their articles rather than just post them on a forum. The forum is therefore not fulfilling its purpose.

The participants decided to close the Venice-Monnet Forum.

6. Opinions and studies of the Venice Commission

The participants were informed about the opinions in the table below that were adopted by the Venice Commission on ordinary and constitutional justice since the last meeting of the Joint Council.

October 2011 – 88th Plenary Session of the Venice Commission

Opinions:

Bolivia	Opinion on the draft Code of Constitutional Procedure of Bolivia http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)038-e.pdf
Bosnia and Herzegovina	<i>Amicus Curiae</i> Brief for the Constitutional Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina on the Law of the Republika Srpska on the Status of State Property located on the Territory of the Republika Srpska and under the Disposal Ban http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)030-e.pdf
Montenegro	Joint Opinion on the Law on the Protector of Human Rights and Freedoms of Montenegro http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)034-e.pdf
Peru	<i>Amicus Curiae</i> Brief on the Case <i>Santiago Brysón De La Barra Et Al</i> (on crimes against humanity) for the Constitutional Court of Peru http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)041-e.pdf
Turkey	Opinion on the Law on the Establishment and Rules of Procedure of the Constitutional Court of Turkey http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)040-e.pdf
Ukraine	Joint Opinion with the Directorate of Justice and Human Dignity within the Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law (DGI) of the Council of Europe on the draft Law on the Bar and Practice of Law of Ukraine http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)039-e.pdf
	Joint Opinion on the draft Law Amending the Law on the Judiciary and the Status of Judges and other Legislative Acts of Ukraine http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)033-e.pdf

December 2011 – 89th Plenary Session of the Venice Commission

Opinions:

Armenia	Opinion on the draft Law on the Legal Regime of the State of Emergency of Armenia http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)049-e.pdf
Serbia	Opinion on draft amendments and additions to the Law on the Constitutional Court of Serbia http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2011/CDL-AD(2011)050-e.pdf

March 2012 – 90th Plenary Session of the Venice Commission

Opinions:

Hungary	Opinion on Act CLXII Of 2011 on the Legal Status and Remuneration of Judges and Act CLXI of 2011 on the organisation and administration of Courts of Hungary http://www.venice.coe.int/docs/2012/CDL-AD(2012)001-e.pdf
----------------	---

7. Co-operation activities

7.a. Co-operation with the Conference of European Constitutional Courts (CECC)¹

Ms Adamovich-Wagner informed the participants that a preparatory meeting for the XVIth Congress (Vienna, 2014) will be convened in Vienna on 10-11 September 2012 and that the Constitutional Court of Austria is responsible for the organisation of both events. The CECC's 40th anniversary will be celebrated in September 2012.

She informed the participants that invitations for the preparatory meeting were sent out the same week and that the Constitutional Court of Austria made a proposal in this invitation for the topic of the upcoming congress. The following topic was proposed: "Co-operation of Constitutional Courts in Europe – current situation and perspectives, 1) Constitutional Courts between constitutional law and European law, 2) Interaction between Constitutional Courts and 3) Interaction between European Courts."

Mr Dürr warmly welcomed this topic for the XVIth Congress, which is not final until adopted at the preparatory meeting in Vienna in September 2012. He explained that the sub-topics fell within the scope of the Joint Council's purpose to promote co-operation between the Courts.

He reminded the participants that since 1999, a tradition had developed for the Joint Council to produce working documents for the CECC's congresses and that a Special Bulletin was produced on the topic of each of the congresses, which consists of extracts from the CODICES database complemented by additional information provided by the liaison officers.

He proposed the preparation of a working document, followed by a Special Bulletin in 2014, on the topic that will be adopted at the preparatory meeting of the Circle of Presidents of the CECC in Vienna on 10-11 September 2012 (see item 10.b below).

¹ See the co-operation site: <http://www.venice.coe.int/CECC/>.

7.b Co-operation with the Association of Constitutional Courts using the French Language (ACCPUF)²

Mr Dürr informed the participants about the fruitful co-operation with ACCPUF, which was based on the Vaduz Agreement and its Djibouti Protocol.

The Secretariat attended the 6th Conference of Heads of Institution of ACCPUF on the "Status of the Constitutional Court judge" that took place in Niamey, Niger, on 2-4 November 2011.

Ms Hassouni informed the participants that the 6th Congress of ACCPUF will take place in Marrakech, Morocco on the "Citizen and the Constitutional Judge" on 3-5 July 2012. She is involved in organising this event.

2-4 November 2011	<i>Niamey, Niger</i> - the Venice Commission participated in the 6 th Conference of Heads of Institution of the Association of Constitutional Courts using the French Language (ACCPUF) on "the Status of the Constitutional Court Judge".
3-5 July 2012	<i>Marrakech, Morocco</i> – 6 th Congress of the Association of Constitutional Courts using the French Language (ACCPUF) on "The Citizen and the Constitutional Judge".

7.c Co-operation with the Southern African Chief Justices Forum (SACJF)³

Mr Dürr informed the participants about the co-operation between the Venice Commission and the Southern African Chief Justices Forum (SACJF) which started back in 1996 with voluntary contributions from Switzerland and later from Norway, Italy and Ireland.

Close co-operation was notably forged with the South African Constitutional Court, which hosted the first Congress of the World Conference on Constitutional Justice held in Cape Town, South Africa in January 2009.

An Annual Workshop and the General Assembly of the SACJF will take place in Maputo, Mozambique on 27-28 July 2012, to which the Venice Commission is invited.

26-28 July 2012	<i>Maputo, Mozambique</i> - Workshop for the Chief Justices and Conference on strengthening the rule of law through access to the courts, followed by the SACJF's annual general meeting.
-----------------	---

7.d Co-operation with the Conference of the Constitutional Control Organs of the Countries of New Democracy (CCCOCND)⁴

Mr Dürr informed the participants about the co-operation with the Conference of the Constitutional Control Organs of the Countries of New Democracy and the Venice Commission, which meets in Yerevan on an annual basis.

² See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/ACCPUF/>

³ See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/SACJF/>

⁴ See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/CCCOCND>

The CCCOCND's next conference will take place on 5-6 October 2012 in Yerevan on the topic "Interaction between the constitutional court and other institutions in ensuring the execution of constitutional judgments".

6-8 November 2011	Yerevan, Armenia – Yerevan Conference in co-operation with the Constitutional Court on "Legal Outcome of Constitutional Court decisions on strengthening the state's constitutional order" at the occasion of the 15th anniversary of the Constitutional Court of Armenia.
5-6 October 2012	Yerevan, Armenia - Conference in co-operation with the Constitutional Court of Armenia on the "Interaction between the constitutional court and other institutions in ensuring the execution of constitutional judgments".

7.e. Co-operation with the Association of Asian Constitutional Courts and Equivalent Institutions (AACC)⁵

Mr Sang-Hyeon Jeon from the Constitutional Court of Korea informed the participants about the co-operation with the Association of Asian Constitutional Courts and Equivalent Institutions (AACC) and the Venice Commission. He explained that seminars for Asian Constitutional Court judges took place since 2003 and in 2005 the idea to establish a formal association was born. That association was established in 2010.

The AACC now has 11 members from Indonesia, Korea, Malaysia, Mongolia, Pakistan, Philippines, Russia, Tajikistan, Thailand, Turkey and Uzbekistan.

The Venice Commission participated in the Inaugural Congress of the AACC in Seoul on 20-24 May 2012 and the next congress of the AACC will take place in Turkey in two years' time. A co-operation agreement had been concluded.

Ms Alberini-Boillat welcomed the establishment of this Association and encouraged this co-operation with the Venice Commission.

Mr Dürr invited the AACC's members to contribute to the CODICES database. He explained that like for all other regional and linguistic groups with respect to the contributions, there were two levels to take into account: one for all the courts represented in the Joint Council (courts from member and observer states of the Venice Commission, e.g. Korea), whose contributions would be published in English and in French in the Bulletin on Constitutional Case-Law and in CODICES and one for those courts that are linked to the Venice Commission through their co-operation agreements e.g. Mongolia, the decisions of which would be published in one language in CODICES.

20-24 May 2012	Seoul - Inaugural Congress of the Association of Asian Constitutional Courts and Equivalent Institutions on "Present and Future of Constitutional Justice in Asia" – conclusion of the co-operation agreement
----------------	---

7.f. Co-operation with the Ibero-American Conference of Constitutional Justice (CIJC)⁶

Mr Dürr informed the participants about the co-operation with the Ibero-American Conference of Constitutional Justice and his attendance at the meeting that was held in Cadiz, Spain on 16-19

⁵ See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/AACC/>

⁶ See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/CIJC/>

May 2012. This event had been the occasion to celebrate the bicentenary of the Constitution of Cadiz.

16-19 May 2012	<i>Cadiz, Spain</i> - IX th Ibero-American Conference of Constitutional Justice on "Presidentialism and parliamentarism in constitutional jurisprudence".
-------------------	--

7.g. Co-operation with the Union of Arab Constitutional Courts and Councils (UACCC)⁷

Mr Dürr informed the participants about the co-operation with the Union of Arab Constitutional Courts and Councils (UACCC) which started in 2006 with the Algerian Constitutional Council participating in a plenary session of the Commission as a representative of the Union. A co-operation agreement had been concluded in 2008. Due to the Arab Spring, the Venice Commission was asked by the Council of Europe and the European Union to assist Arab countries, particularly Tunisia and Morocco. In Tunisia, the Venice Commission worked with the ordinary judiciary and the National Constituent Assembly, which was likely to establish a Constitutional Council. Jordan has now also become active and is looking into setting up a Constitutional Court.

24-25 October 2011	<i>Beirut, Lebanon</i> - the Venice Commission participated in the 7th Colloquium of the Union of Arab Constitutional Courts and Councils on "Constitutional Justice and the Separation of Powers", hosted by the Constitutional Council of Lebanon.
-----------------------	--

7.h. Co-operation with the Conference of Constitutional Courts of Portuguese Speaking Countries (CJCPLP)⁸

Mr Dürr informed the participants about the co-operation with the Conference of Constitutional Courts of Portuguese Speaking Countries using the Portuguese Language (CCJCPL). This Conference was established at the initiative of the Portuguese Constitutional Court and Mozambique holds the presidency at the moment. A co-operation agreement had been concluded.

15-16 May 2012	<i>Maputo, Mozambique</i> - Conference of Constitutional Courts of Countries of Portuguese-Speaking Countries – conclusion of co-operation agreement.
-------------------	---

7.i. Co-operation with the Conference of Constitutional Jurisdictions of Africa (CCJA)⁹

Mr Moussa Laraba, the Deputy Secretary General of the Conference of Constitutional Jurisdictions of Africa (CCJA), thanked Mr Dürr for the invitation to the Joint Council and looked forward to the future co-operation between the Venice Commission and the CCJA. The conclusion of a co-operation agreement was envisaged.

8. World Conference on Constitutional Justice (WCCJ)¹⁰

Mr Dürr informed the participants that the Statute of the WCCJ entered into force on 24 September 2011, with the accession of 30 Constitutional Courts, Constitutional Councils and Supreme Courts exercising constitutional justice. He said that the 3rd Congress of the World

⁷ See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/UACCC>

⁸ See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/CJCPLP>

⁹ See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/CJCA>

¹⁰ See the co-operation page: <http://www.venice.coe.int/WCCJ>

Conference on Constitutional Justice will be hosted by the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Korea in Seoul, in September/October 2014¹¹.

A question was raised regarding the WCCJ's legal status and whether it had a legal personality. Mr Dürr explained that like the Conference of European Constitutional Courts, the World Conference does not have legal personality. Therefore, its budget is held by the Venice Commission on a special account within the Council of Europe.

He also informed the participants that the Bureau of the WCCJ will be meeting in Venice in the afternoon of 16 June 2012, following the 91st Plenary Session of the Venice Commission to discuss, *inter alia*, the financial report regarding the WCCJ members' contributions, the new scale of contributions for 2013, the preparation for the 3rd Congress of the WCCJ in Seoul and choosing a logo for the WCCJ.

Ms Alberini-Boillat encouraged the Courts that had not yet done so, to join the WCCJ.

16 June 2012	Venice, Italy – 6 th meeting of the Bureau of the World Conference on Constitutional Justice.
--------------	--

9. Seminars with Constitutional Courts (CoCoSem)

Mr Dürr informed the participants about the seminars held since the last Joint Council meeting as well as the programme for future CoCoSem seminars.

July 2011 onwards (since the last meeting of the Joint Council)

2011	
7-8 July	<i>Santa Cruz, Bolivia</i> - the Venice Commission organised, in co-operation with the Constitutional Court of Bolivia, a conference on main principles of constitutional justice, with a special focus on indigenous justice.
29-30 July	<i>Sofia, Bulgaria</i> - 20 th anniversary of the Constitutional Court of Bulgaria. The Commission participates in the conference on the "Classical and modern trends in Constitutional review", organised by the Constitutional Court.
8 September	<i>Santiago de Chile</i> - the President of the Venice Commission, Mr Gianni Buquicchio, participated at the event organised by the Constitutional Court of Chile for its 40 th anniversary.
15-17 September	<i>Kyiv, Ukraine</i> - Conference in co-operation with the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, on the occasion of the 15 th anniversary of the Court, on the "Protection of human rights by bodies of constitutional justice: possibilities and problems of individual access" in the framework of the Ukrainian Chairmanship in the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.
22 September	<i>Kyiv, Ukraine</i> - the Venice Commission participated in the Round table on the Role of the Supreme Court in the protection of human rights at national level.
29 September	<i>Riga, Latvia</i> – 15 th anniversary of the Constitutional Court of Latvia on the "Role of the Constitutional Court in the protection of constitutional values."
6 November	<i>Yerevan, Armenia</i> – XVI th Yerevan International Conference celebrating the 15 th anniversary of the Constitution of Armenia.
15-16 November	<i>Geneva, Switzerland</i> - the Venice Commission will participate in a workshop organised by the UN OHCHR on "A human-rights compliant framework for vetting of members of the security and justice sectors".

¹¹ At its meeting in Venice on 16 June 2012, the Bureau of the WCCJ decided to hold the 3rd Congress on 28 September-1 October 2014.

22-23 November	<i>Samara, Russia</i> - the Venice Commission participates in a round table on "Promoting independent national non-judicial mechanisms for the protection of human rights, especially for the prevention of torture", organised in the framework of the Joint European Union – Council Of Europe Programme "Peer-to-Peer II Project".
24-25 November	<i>St. Petersburg, Russia</i> - In co-operation with the Venice Commission, the Institute for Public Law and Policy organised a workshop / moot court on the problem of the study and teaching of comparative constitutional law in the Russian (and CIS) universities.
1-3 December	<i>Andorra la Vella, Andorra</i> - the Constitutional Court of Andorra will organise its 4 th international constitutional conference on "The Constitutional Courts and the Legal Community: what about dialogue?"
2012	
21-22 March	<i>Tunis, Tunisia</i> - the Venice Commission and the Department for the independence and efficiency of Justice of the Council of Europe organised in cooperation with the Trade union of the Tunisian judges and the Union of the administrative judges, a seminar on the independence of the judiciary.
13-14 April	<i>Yerevan, Armenia</i> – 5 th Conference of Secretaries General of Constitutional Courts or Courts with Equivalent Jurisdiction on two themes: (1) Procedural time-limits and (2) the reaction to the negative criticism of court judgments.

10. Publication of the *Bulletin on Constitutional Case-Law*

10.a Regular issues of the *Bulletin*

Participants were informed that Bulletin no. 2011/2 would soon be published. Discussions ensued about whether participants wanted to continue receiving a paper version of the Bulletin or whether they considered that the CD-ROM and the Internet versions were sufficient.

Although a number of liaison officers believed that a paper version was no longer needed, others thought that the publication of the Bulletin introduced a periodicity which would otherwise be lost and could lead to less contributions being made. In addition, some liaison officers pointed out that the Bulletin served as a "business card" of the Joint Council and added to its visibility that could be shown to the courts.

They concluded that the paper version was still useful but that the number of copies sent to each court should be revised.

Participants agreed that the paper version of the Bulletin should continue to be published. Liaison officers will be consulted by the Secretariat on how many copies, within a maximum of 5 copies, they need in English and/or in French, with the aim of reducing their demand.

10.b Special *Bulletins*

The participants were informed that the Special Bulletin on "State Powers", prepared for the XVth Congress of the CECC, will be published in July 2012.

The Secretariat proposed to prepare a working documents / special Bulletin also on the topic of the XVIth Congress of the CECC (see also above item 7.a).

The Secretariat would make a pre-selection of précis to be included from CODICES and submit it to the liaison officers. The liaison officers then could then (a) remove précis deemed not

relevant, (b) add existing précis from CODICES, (c) edit the précis selected or (d) - if necessary - add further précis, which had not yet been published in the Bulletin/CODICES. The deadline for liaison officers to provide additional précis information for the working document for the XVIth Congress would be June 2013. This information would then become a working document for the European Congress in May 2014 and then be published as a Special Bulletin along with the general report presented at the Congress.

Like in the past, in order to have enough time to prepare the working document, the contributions to the working document / special Bulletin unfortunately will have to be made before the national report for the Congress would be ready. The liaison officers should discuss with the person in charge of the national report, which decisions are likely to be presented in the national report.

Although this Special Bulletin is prepared for the CECC, all courts participating in the Joint Council are invited to make their contributions.

Mr Dürr explained that a Special Bulletin on Court Descriptions was published in 1999 and that this information was regularly updated in CODICES. The Secretariat proposed that this information be published in a Special Bulletin on Court Descriptions in 2013.

The participants approved the preparation of a working document / special Bulletin on the topic of the XVIth Congress of the CECC for 2014, the topic of which would be decided upon at the preparatory meeting of the CECC in September 2012. Liaison officers will be invited to verify the pre-selection of précis to be made by the Secretariat and to provide additional information to the Secretariat by the end of June 2013.

For 2013, a special Bulletin on Court Descriptions should be published.

11. CODICES database

A presentation of the CODICES data-base had taken place during the training session.

12. Updating constitutions, laws and descriptions in CODICES

Participants were informed about the progress made in updating constitutions, laws and descriptions of courts (CDL-JU(2012)011) and were invited to let the Secretariat know about any changes that should be taken into consideration.

13. Documentation Centre on Constitutional Justice / Library

Mr Dürr thanked the participating courts for providing their publications to the Documentation Centre. The list of documents is available at:

http://www.venice.coe.int/site/dynamics/N_CoCentre_ef.asp?L=E

14. Version 21 of the Systematic Thesaurus

Version 21 of Systematic Thesaurus will remain applicable (CDL-JU(2011)009).

15. Other business

No other business was discussed.

16. Date and place of the next meeting

Participants are looking forward to having next year's meeting of the Joint Council on Constitutional Justice in Venice, Italy. The Secretariat will get in touch with the participants in order to decide on a date for this meeting.

The Constitutional Court of Georgia has kindly proposed to host the Joint Council's meeting in Batumi in 2014.¹²

C. *Mini-conference*

A mini-conference on "The Rule of Law as a Practical Concept" was held on 1 June 2012. Reports presented are available at:

http://www.venice.coe.int/site/dynamics/N_Seminar_ef.asp?L=E&SID=286

¹² Following the meeting, the Constitutional Court of Germany has kindly offered to host the Joint Council in 2015.

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Ms Britta ADAMOVICH-WAGNER, Secretary General, Constitutional Court, VIENNA

AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN

Mr Kamran YUSIFOV, Senior Adviser, Constitutional Court, BAKU

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

Mme Anne RASSON ROLAND, Référendaire, Cour constitutionnelle, BRUXELLES,
Co-président du Conseil mixte sur la justice constitutionnelle / Co-President of the Joint Council on Constitutional Justice

M. Rik RYCKEBOER, Référendaire, Cour constitutionnelle, BRUXELLES

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZÉGOVINE

Ms Mira PEKMEZ, Deputy Secretary General, Constitutional Court, SARAJEVO Ms
Ermina DUMANJIC, Head of CEDIP, Constitutional Court, SARAJEVO

BRAZIL / BRAZIL

Mr Luis CONI, Chief Adviser for International Affairs, Federal Supreme Court,
BRASILIA

CHILE / CHILE

Mr Cristian GARCIA MECHSNER, Head of the Directorate of Studies and Research,
Tribunal Constitucional, SANTIAGO

CROATIA / CROATIE

Ms Mirjana STRESEC, Senior Adviser, Constitutional Court, ZAGREB

CZECH REPUBLIC / RÉPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE

Ms Katerina SIMACKOVA, Judge, Supreme Administrative Court, BRNO

Mr Tomas LANGASEK, Secretary General, Constitutional Court, BRNO

Mr Ivo POSPISIL, Head, Analytical Department, Constitutional Court, BRNO/

Ms Sona MATOCHOVA, Analyst, Analytical Department, Constitutional Court,
BRNO

Mr Vlastimil GOTTINGER, Head of Protocol, Adviser for Foreign Affairs,
Constitutional Court, BRNO

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Ms Gertrude LÜBBE-WOLFF, Justice, Federal Constitutional Court, KARLSRUHE

Ms Margret BÖCKEL, Chief of Protocol, Federal Constitutional Court, KARLSRUHE

GEORGIA / GÉORGIE

Ms Irina KHAKHUTAISHVILI, Chief Adviser, International Relations, Cabinet of the
President, Constitutional Court, BATUMI

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Ms Krisztina KOVACS, Senior Adviser, Constitutional Court, BUDAPEST

IRELAND / IRLANDE

Mr Richard MCNAMARA, Executive Legal Officer to the Chief Justice, Supreme Court, DUBLIN

ISRAEL / ISRAËL

Ms Keren AZULAY, Senior Legal Assistant, Supreme Court, JERUSALEM

KOREA / COREE

Mr Sang-Hyeon JEON, Research officer, Constitutional Court, SEOUL

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Ms Laila JURCENA, Adviser to the President, Constitutional Court, RIGA

LIECHTENSTEIN / LIECHTENSTEIN

Mr Ivo ELKUCH, Legal Adviser, State Court, VADUZ

LUXEMBOURG

M. Jean JENTGEN, Conseiller honoraire, Cour constitutionnelle, LUXEMBOURG
Mme Lily WAMPACH, Secrétaire général, Cour constitutionnelle, LUXEMBOURG

MOLDOVA / MOLDOVA

Mme Valéria STERBET, Juge, Cour constitutionnelle, CHISINAU

MONTENEGRO / MONTÉNÉGRO

Mrs Jadranka NOVAKOVIĆ, Adviser, Constitutional Court, PODGORICA
Ms Nerma DOBARDŽIĆ, Adviser, Constitutional Court, PODGORICA

MOROCCO / MAROC

Mme Amina HASSOUNI, Chef de service de la documentation et de la coopération, Conseil constitutionnel, RABAT

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Ms Marjolein VAN ROOSMALEN, Legal Adviser, Council of State, THE HAGUE

NORWAY / NORVÈGE

Ms Kjersti BUUN NYGAARD, Deputy Secretary General, Supreme Court, OSLO

POLAND / POLOGNE

Mr Marcin NOWAK, Adviser, Department of Jurisprudence and Studies, Constitutional Tribunal, WARSAW

PORTUGAL / PORTUGAL

Ms Manuela BAPTISTA LOPES, Senior Legal Adviser, Tribunal constitutionnel, LISBOA

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Ms Marieta SAFTA, First Assistant-Magistrate, Constitutional Court, BUCHAREST

SERBIA / SERBIE

Ms Verica JAKOVLJEVIC, Senior Adviser, Constitutional Court, BELGRADE

SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

Ms Tina PRESEREN, Analysis and International Co-operation Department, Constitutional Court, LJUBLJANA

SLOVAKIA / SLOVAQUIE

Mr Jan STIAVNICKY, Legal Adviser, Constitutional Court, KOSICE

SPAIN / ESPAGNE

Mr Luis POMED SANCHEZ, Head of Division, Tribunal constitucional, MADRID

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

M. Paul TSCHÜMPERLIN, Secrétaire Général, Tribunal fédéral, LAUSANNE :
Mme Juliane ALBERINI-BOILLAT, Chef du Service de documentation, Tribunal fédéral, LAUSANNE, **Co-président du Conseil mixte sur la justice constitutionnelle / Co-President of the Joint Council on Constitutional Justice**

«THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA» / «L'EX-RÉPUBLIQUE YUGOSLAVE DE MACÉDOINE»

Ms Milica NIKOLOVSKA, Secretary General, Constitutional Court, SKOPJE
Ms Tatjana JANJIC-TODOROVA, State Adviser for International Co-operation, Constitutional Court, SKOPJE

COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION / COUR DE JUSTICE DE L'UNION EUROPEENNE

M. Philippe SINGER, Chef de Service, Cour de justice de l'Union européenne, LUXEMBOURG

CONFERENCE OF CONSTITUTIONAL JURISDICTIONS OF AFRICA / CONFERENCE OF CONFERENCE DES JURIDICTIONS CONSTITUTIONNELLES AFRICAINES

M. Issac Yankhoba NDIAYE, Secrétaire général CJCA, Vice-Président, Conseil constitutionnel, DAKAR
M. Moussa LARABA, Secrétaire général adjoint, Conférence des juridictions constitutionnelles africaines, ALGER

SECRETARIAT

VENICE COMMISSION / COMMISSION DE VENISE

Mr Schnutz Rudolf DÜRR
Ms Tanja GERWIEN
Ms Ana GOREY

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES

Ms Corinne MC GEORGE
Ms Claudine PIERSON