



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



EVENT:

CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL: A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE

Mexico City

November 29, 30, and December 1st, 2022



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



INDEX

1. PROGRAM	2
2. CONCEPT NOTE	7
3. HIGH CHAMBER, ELECTORAL TRIBUNAL OF THE FEDERAL JUDICARY PROFILES.....	10
4. PARTICIPANT PROFILES	14



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



1. PROGRAM

TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 29	
9:30 - 11:15	OPENING SESSION AND PANEL 1. COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL IN LATIN AMERICA AND EUROPE
<p>Objective: Welcome participants to the event and learn about the importance of conventionality control for the protection of political-electoral rights in Latin America and Europe. In this session, the evolution of conventionality control and its impact on electoral justice will be analyzed.</p> <p>Format: 10 minutes per speaker.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Justices of the High Chamber of Mexico's Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary • Simona Granata-Menghini, Director/Secretary of the Venice Commission (<i>virtual</i>) • Katherine Ellena, Vice-President for Programs, International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES) • José Thompson, Executive Director of the Inter-American Institute of Human Rights and Director of the Center for Electoral Promotion and Assistance (IIDH/CAPEL) (<i>tbc</i>) 	
11:15 - 11:30	RECESS
11:30 - 13:00	PANEL 2. PRESENTATION OF THE GUIDE OF THE OBSERVATORY ON GENDER EQUALITY
<p>Objective: Present the deliverable of the Observatory on Gender Equality of the Global Network on Electoral Justice: "Guide for Judging with a Gender Perspective in Electoral Matters" and analyze how it contributes to standardize practices in the region and worldwide.</p> <p>Format: 15 minutes of introductory remarks by the panel presidency, 8 minutes per speaker, and 25 minutes for discussion (3 minutes per statement).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pierre Garrone, Chief of the Elections and Political Parties Division, Venice Commission (<i>virtual</i>) • Ann Ravel, Professor of Law at the University of California at Berkeley • Adriana Gutiérrez, Specialist in the Secretariat for the Strengthening of Democracy, Organization of American States (OAS) • María Noel Vaeza, Regional Director for the Americas and the Caribbean, UN Women (<i>virtual</i>) • Isabel Torres García, Consultant in Democratic Governance, Political Participation and Gender Equality, Regional Hub for Latin America and the Caribbean, United Nations Development Program (UNDP) <p>Panel presided by: Mónica Aralí Soto Fregoso, Justice of the High Chamber of Mexico's Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary and President of the Board of the GNEJ's Observatory on Gender Equality</p>	
13:00 - 13:15	BREAK



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



13:15 - 14:45	PANEL 3. THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN LATIN AMERICA AND EUROPE: THE <i>PRO PERSONA</i> PRINCIPLE IN ELECTORAL PROCESSES
<p>Objective: Explore the harmonious interpretation of constitutions and international treaties (conventionality control) in Latin America and Europe, as well as the obligation of electoral jurisdictional bodies to guarantee the effectiveness of human rights.</p> <p>Format: 15 minutes of introductory remarks by the panel presidency, 15 minutes per speaker, and 20 minutes for discussion (3 minutes per statement).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ann Ravel, Professor of Law at the University of California at Berkeley • Amaya Úbeda de Torres, Legal Senior Officer of the Department of the European Social Charter, Council of Europe • Katherine Ellena, Vice-President for Programs, International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES) • Carlos Ernesto Camargo Assis, Ombudsman of Colombia <p>Panel presided by: José Luis Vargas Valdez, Justice of the High Chamber of Mexico's Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary</p>	
14:45 - 17:00	LUNCH
END OF DAY 1	



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 30	
09:30 - 11:00	PANEL 4. RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DOMESTIC CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW
<p>Objective: Share the importance of the protection of human rights, understood in a broad sense, specifically during electoral processes. The importance of conventionality control in electoral dispute bodies—and how this contributes to an electoral justice system that strengthens the rule of law in general, and with examples of specific rulings in which this figure has been used—will also be analyzed.</p> <p>Format: 15 minutes of introductory remarks by the panel presidency, 15 minutes per speaker, and 25 minutes for discussion (3 minutes per statement).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jean-Philippe Derosier, Professor of Public Law at the Legal Research Center of the University of Lille • Wilfredo Penco, Electoral Expert, Uruguay (<i>virtual</i>) • Jesús Orozco Henríquez, Ph.D. /Researcher at the Institute for Legal Research at the National Autonomous University of Mexico (UNAM) <p>Panel presided by: Janine M. Otálora Malassis, Justice of the High Chamber of Mexico's TEPJF</p>	
11:00 – 11:15	RECESS
11:15 - 12:45	PANEL 5. INTERNATIONAL TREATIES AND JURISPRUDENCE: MODELS OF INTERPRETATION AND APPLICATION
<p>Objective: Examine models of interpretation and application in a comparative perspective—with the aim of maximizing the protection of human rights—and share standards and good practices recognized by international organizations.</p> <p>Format: 15 minutes of introductory remarks by the panel presidency, 15 minutes per speaker, and 20 minutes for discussion (3 minutes per statement).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carmen Gloria Valladares, Reporting Secretary of Chile's Election Certification Tribunal • José Thompson, Executive Director of the Inter-American Institute of Human Rights and Director of the Center for Electoral Promotion and Assistance (IIDH/CAPEL) • René Abelardo Molina Osorio, Alternate Magistrate, Supreme Electoral Tribunal, El Salvador. • Patrick Sensburg, Director of the Master of Public Management (MPM), University of Police and Public Administration, President of the Board of Directors, and President of the Board of the GNEJ's Observatory on Social Media (<i>virtual</i>) <p>Panel presided by: Rafael Rubio, Professor of Constitutional Law at the Complutense University of Madrid</p>	
12:45 - 15:00	LUNCH



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



END OF DAY 2

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 1

10:00 - 11:30

PANEL 6: APPLIED SOLUTIONS OF THE GLOBAL NETWORK ON ELECTORAL JUSTICE

Objective: Discuss the work of the observatories of the Global Electoral Network on Electoral Justice, mainly their deliverables, and analyze how this type of document contributes to the comparative study of cases. In addition, a discussion will be promoted on how the work of the GNEJ has contributed to consolidate electoral justice mechanisms and electoral processes in different regions.

Format: 15 minutes of introductory remarks by the panel presidency, 15 minutes per speaker, and 25 minutes for discussion (3 minutes per statement).

- **Manuel Delgado-Iribarren**, Director of the Technical Secretariat of the Central Electoral Board of Spain, on behalf of President of the Board of the GNEJ's Observatory on Judicial Independence
- **Katherine Ellena**, Vice-President for Programs, International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES)
- **Michael Freitas Mohallem**, Professor of Law at the Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro (*virtual*)

Panel presided by: Fritz Edward Siregar, Electoral expert and Constitutional Law Lecturer at Indonesia Jentera School of Law

11:30 - 11:45

RECESS

11:45 - 13:15

PANEL 7. JURISDICTIONAL INTERPRETATION TO FULFILL AND GUARANTEE RIGHTS FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL

Objective: Foster dialogue on the application of international norms and treaties to fulfill and guarantee political-electoral rights in the framework of conventionality control. The information will be evaluated from a comparative perspective, considering the powers and nature of jurisdictional electoral bodies in the region, with examples from the electoral justice in Brazil, Colombia and Spain.

Format: 15 minutes of introductory remarks by the panel presidency, 15 minutes per speaker, and 20 minutes for discussion (3 minutes per statement). At the end of the panel, a final message will be given on the work carried out during the sessions.

- **Hernán Penagos Giraldo**, Electoral Expert, Colombia
- **Carlos Vidal Prado**, Professor of Constitutional Law, National University of Distance Education (UNED)



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



- **María Fernanda Rangel Esparza**, Delegate Ombudswoman for Women's Rights and Gender Affairs, Ombudsman's Office of Colombia

Panel presided by: Alberto Guevara Castro, Director General of International Relations Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary of Mexico

13:15 - 16:00

LUNCH

END OF THE EVENT



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



2. CONCEPT NOTE

Dates: November 29, 30, and December 1st, 2022

Duration: Three days

Format: Hybrid

- On-Site: High Chamber (José Luis de la Peza Auditorium)
- Platform: Zoom

Audience:

- Justices, staff of the High Chamber's Justices' offices, and representatives of the Administration Commission's members, members of the Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ) and sectors of the public and specialists.

Language: Spanish, French, and English (simultaneous translation)

Objective of the event: Learn about other countries' experiences in the administration of electoral justice, as well as the international principles that are applied both in Latin America and Europe when conventionality control is carried out in rulings, to enrich the legal argumentation of Mexico's Electoral Tribunal (TEPJF) staff. Furthermore, as an additional activity related to the GNEJ's current state and prospects, a space for reflection and follow-up comments will be opened for the members of the Global Network's Scientific Committee and its three observatories.

Dynamic: The event will last two and a half days (including the activities of the GNEJ) and will be conducted in seven sessions of one-hour-and-a-half each. There will be an exchange between the speakers, who will also respond to comments and questions from the audience - both from the jurisdictional staff on-site and from people following the event online.

Background:

One of the constant recommendations that jurisdictional election observation missions have made to Mexico's Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary (TEPJF) during electoral processes has been to enrich its argumentation using international jurisprudence and principles. In addition, the TEPJF has been recommended to strengthen its methodology for applying conventionality control.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



Furthermore, this issue has been on the TEPJF's international agenda for several years. In 2018, within the framework of a project carried out in collaboration with IIHR/CAPEL,¹ a conventionality control workshop called "2018 Mexico Elections: A Comparative Jurisdictional Perspective of Latin America" was held. In it, Mexico's 2017-2018 federal electoral process was analyzed and contrasted with other Latin American experiences and international standards.

Conventionality control is the mechanism that is exercised to verify that the laws, regulations, or actions of state authorities comply with the norms, principles, and obligations of the American Convention on Human Rights and other international treaties. This can be done on two levels: 1) at the international level, by the Inter-American Court, which oversees concentrated control, and 2) at the national level, by justice operators in each state when analyzing the compatibility of internal regulations as a diffuse control (Bustillo Marín, 2016).²

In conventionality control, the provision that implies greater protection of the human right in question must apply, since, if found in the conventional sphere, said regulation prevails over constitutional provisions (Becerra Ramírez, 2016).³

Since its incorporation into the Judiciary in 1996, the Electoral Tribunal has been responsible for exercising legal and constitutional control in the matter. It has issued several rulings in which conventionality control is exercised, either by invoking international treaties in matters of human rights as the normative framework, adopting international criteria, or, ultimately, disapplying unconventional norms.

In the European case, the relationship between internal constitutional law and international law responds to a double structure. There is, on one side, the Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU), which includes its 27 member states, and, on the other, the European Court of Human Rights (ECHR), made up of 47 states, and the European Convention on Human Rights. This structure applies a conventionality control—or "community control"—that establishes that the relations of priority or prevalence between European Community law and European standards

¹ Inter-American Institute of Human Rights/Center for Electoral Promotion and Assistance.

² See https://www.te.gob.mx/ccje/Archivos/Control_de_Convencionalidad.pdf.

³ See <https://www.corteidh.or.cr/tablas/r34721.pdf>. In the case of Mexico, the inclusion of conventionality control as a concept, and how it operates within the internal regulatory framework, has various precedents and institutional efforts. However, the breaking point in the matter occurred due to compliance with the ruling of the Inter-American Court in the case of Radilla Pacheco v. Mexico.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



on human rights, with regard to national or internal rights, are not to be considered as a matter of priority or prevalence (Pedro Sagües, 2011).⁴

In the exercise of the electoral jurisdictional function, conventionality control is a necessary and constantly developing mechanism. For this reason, the jurisprudence must consider the argumentation of European and inter-American jurisprudence, as well as the most important international principles for the effective protection of political-electoral rights, in every matter submitted to jurisdictional authorities.

In this regard, the participating members of the Global Network on Electoral Justice⁵ will help to find answers to these shared challenges with the presentation of their three Observatories deliverables: Gender Equality, Social Media and Judicial Independence. With the aim of strengthening the interpretative statements in TEPJF rulings and find answers in the spheres of electoral justice and the rule of law. The event will allow the sharing of best practices in the field and will help strengthen knowledge regarding the most important international rulings, norms, and principles for the protection of political-electoral rights.

⁴ See <https://www.corteidh.or.cr/tablas/r27778.pdf>.

⁵ Collaborative forum, created in 2017, for collective and multidisciplinary reflection on electoral justice. The GNEJ has enabled dynamic communication and has developed global strategies through a direct exchange of experiences, good practices, and relevant work among its members. The Technical Secretariat is held by the TEPJF.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



3. HIGH CHAMBER, ELECTORAL TRIBUNAL OF THE FEDERAL JUDICIARY PROFILES

Justices of the High Chamber of the TEPJF

- **Chief Justice Reyes Rodríguez Mondragón**



Has a degree in Law by Mexico's Autonomous Institute of Technology (ITAM), as well as a master's degree in Public Policies and Administration by the Center for Economic Research and Teaching (CIDE) and a master's in Law and Society by the International Institute for Sociology of Law.

He has been a professor in different institutions and was director of the degree in Law of the CIDE. He is the author of several articles and academic publications. He has held different positions in the three public powers and in autonomous bodies, such as: The Presidency and the Senate of the Republic, the Ministry of the Interior, the Supreme Court of Justice of the Nation and the Federal Electoral Institute.

He was an electoral magistrate in the Monterrey Regional Chamber until the end of November 2016, when he was appointed Justice in the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary. In both positions he has worked for an open justice by promoting and implementing a new model of citizen-oriented rulings, using more didactic media (such as infographics) and training on the subject to various officials of the electoral authorities throughout the republic.

- **Justice Felipe Alfredo Fuentes Barrera**



Has a Degree in Law from the National Autonomous University of Mexico and a Judicial specialization from the Supreme Court of Justice of the Nation (SCJN). He also holds a master's degree in Amparo Law from the Legal Science Graduate School, and a master's degree in Constitutional Law and Amparo from the University of del Valle Toluca.

Author of several articles and academic publications. One of his great passions is teaching: he has taught at the Law Schools of the Xalapa University, Guadalajara University, Autonomous University of the State of Mexico and at the Institute of the Federal Judiciary, Tabasco division.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



Justice of the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary (TEPJF) since November 2016. During the period from January 2019 to November 2020 he was Chief Justice.

- **Justice Janine Madeline Otálora Malassis**



She is a Mexican lawyer, with more than 40 years of professional experience, currently serving as Justice of the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary (TEPJF).

After being proposed by the Supreme Court of Justice of the Nation (SCJN), on October 19, 2016 the Senate of the Republic appointed her as an electoral justice for a nine-year term. She was the Chief Justice, by unanimous vote of the members of the High Chamber, from October 19, 2016 to January 22, 2019.

In her work as a justice, she has distinguished herself by issuing relevant rulings on gender equality, the rights of communities and indigenous peoples, and the protection of the political-electoral rights of citizens.

- **Justice Indalfer Infante Gonzales**



his degree in Law from the Autonomous University of Guerrero, a Master in Amparo Law, and a PhD in Criminal Sciences from the Institute of Higher Studies in Legal Sciences.

Has worked as Judicial court official assigned to the Second District Court of the State of Guerrero; Secretary of the Second District Court in Guerrero State; Court resolution draftsman of the Second Collegiate Court of the Twenty First Circuit, based in Chilpancingo, Guerrero and Court Resolution Draftsman of the Fourth Unitary Court of the First Circuit based in Mexico City.

He worked as Briefing attorney in the First Chamber of the Supreme Court of Justice of the Nation (SCJN); Third District Judge in the State of Tabasco, among others.

At the proposal of the Supreme Court of Justice of the Nation (SCJN), the Senate of the Republic elected him as Electoral Justice of the Superior Chamber of the Electoral Court of the Federal Judicial Branch for a 7 years' period, starting his administration as of November 4 of the same year.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



- **Justice Felipe de la Mata Pizaña**



Has a degree in Law from the Escuela Libre de Derecho (Free School of Law), master's degree in law from the Ibero-American University, J.D in Law from the Pan-American University, and a J.D in Law and Recognized Constitutional Freedoms from the Castilla La Mancha University.

Assistant Secretary to the Law Clerk of the Regional Electoral Justice (1997); Instructor Secretary and Briefing Attorney of the High Chamber of the TEPJF (1998-2007); Chief of Staff of the TEPJF (2011-2013); Secretary General of the High Chamber of the TEPJF (2013-2014); Justice of the Regional Specialized Chamber of the TEPJF (2014-2016).

He has been Professor of various undergraduate and postgraduate subjects in the Pan-American University, Ibero-American University and the Faculty of Law at the National Autonomous University of Mexico.

Upon recommendation of the Supreme Court of Justice of the Nation (SCJN), the Senate of the Republic elected him as Justice of the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary for a 9-year term, starting his administration as of November 4th, 2016.

- **Justice Mónica Aralí Soto Fregoso**



Has a bachelor's degree in Law by the Autonomous University of Guadalajara (UAG), a master's degree in Education and Teaching by the International University of la Paz and is specialized in Electoral Justice and has a diploma in Electoral Law by the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary; as well as a certification in Public Policy and Gender, offered by the Latin American Faculty of Social Sciences (FLACSO).

She has been a Justice of the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary (TEPJF) since November 2016, and has 25 years of experience in electoral matters, 12 of which have been as a justice; she also stands out for protecting the political-electoral rights of women and building criteria that have allowed women to access more elected positions.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



She has held several positions in the Federal Electoral Institute (IFE), in Baja California Sur, Jalisco and Campeche, from 1994 to 2007. Was appointed by the Congress of the State of Baja California Sur as Numerary Justice of the State Electoral Tribunal of such entity (2007). In March 2013, she was appointed Justice of the Guadalajara Regional Chamber of the TEPJF, of which she was the first female President, until March 2016.

Professor at the Autonomous University of Baja California Sur, and Coordinator of the subject of Gender in the Third Generation of the Specialization in Electoral Justice of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary, among others.

At the proposal of the Supreme Court of Justice of the Nation, the Senate of the Republic elected her as an Electoral Justice of the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary, for a period of 9 years, beginning her term on November 4, 2016.

- **Justice José Luis Vargas Valdez**



Has a bachelor's degree in Law by the Autonomous Technological Institute of Mexico (ITAM, in Spanish), and a master's degree in Public Law by the Pompeu Fabra University in Barcelona, Spain. He is a PhD candidate in Public Law with a specialty in Constitutional Law at the same institution.

On November 4, 2016, he was appointed Justice of the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary, where, in addition to his jurisdictional work, he is responsible for promoting and strengthening the international cooperation of the TEPJF and the academic programs of the Electoral Judicial School. From November 2020 to September 2021, he was Chief Justice of the High Chamber of the Electoral Tribunal.

In the international arena, he was Senior Consultant on electoral crimes and legal dispute resolution for the Organization of American States and has participated in several electoral observation missions. In addition, as a Justice of the High Chamber of the TEPJF, he founded the Global Network on Electoral Justice and is a member of the Venice Commission of the Council of Europe, in which he has participated as rapporteur in several studies and opinions, such as the "Manual of Good Practices in Social Media and Democracy".



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



4. PARTICIPANT PROFILES

PANEL 1: INAUGURATION AND COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL IN LATIN AMERICA AND EUROPE

SIMONA GRANATA MENGHINI (VIRTUAL)		
	Current Position	Director/Secretary of the Venice Commission of the Council of Europe.
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Diploma in Comparative Law from the Faculty of Comparative Law in Strasbourg. • Lawyer from Milan State University.
	Areas of expertise	Human Rights, Constitutional Law.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deputy Secretary of the Venice Commission of the Council of Europe. • Head of the Constitutional Cooperation Division of the Venice Commission. • Lawyer at the Secretariat of the European Court of Human Rights. • Deputy Human Rights Defender in Bosnia and Herzegovina. • Lawyer at the European Commission on Human Rights.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



KATHERINE ELLENA



Current position

Vice-President for Programs, International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES)

Member of the Scientific Committee, Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ)

Education

- Master of Laws, University of Canterbury
- BA in Philosophy, University of Canterbury.

Areas of expertise

Electoral Legal Frameworks, Electoral Conflict Resolution and Electoral Integrity.

Professional experience

- Senior Global Legal Advisor and Director of the Center for Anti-Corruption and Democratic Trust, International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES).
- Manager of the IFES Program in Europe and Asia, responsible for the reform of the electoral programs in Afghanistan, Fiji and Pakistan.
- Acting Vice President of the US-New Zealand Council.
- Faculty Associate with the U.S. Department of Defense Naval Postgraduate School.
- Foreign Policy Officer, New Zealand Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



JOSÉ THOMPSON



Current position

Executive Director, Inter-American Institute of Human Rights (IIDH)
Director, Center for Electoral Assistance and Promotion (CAPEL)
Vice-Dean, School of Law, University of Costa Rica

Education

- Postgraduate studies and the *Università degli Studi di Perugia*, Italy.
- Lawyer, University of Costa Rica.

Areas of expertise

Justice, Democracy, Electoral Systems, Human Rights and International Law.

Professional experience

- Professor, School of Law, University of Costa Rica.
- Deputy Director, Center for Electoral Assistance and Promotion (CAPEL).
- International Observer.
- Professor of International Public Law and Human Rights, School of Law, University of Costa Rica (since 1984).
- *Chargé d'Affaires* a.i., Embassy of Costa Rica to the United States of America.
- Minister Counselor and Consul General, Embassy of Costa Rica to the United States of America.




CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



PANEL 2: PRESENTATION OF THE GUIDE OF THE OBSERVATORY ON GENDER EQUALITY

ANN M. RAVEL

	<p>Current position</p>	<p>Professor of Law, University of California at Berkeley, United States</p> <p>Member of the Scientific Committee, Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ)</p> <p>Scientific Leader, Observatory on Gender Equality board, Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ)</p> <p>Attorney and Counselor at Law as an Expert Witness in Electoral and Campaign Finance Law and Mediator</p>
	<p>Education</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law. • Bachelor's degree, University of California, Berkeley.
	<p>Areas of expertise</p>	<p>Campaign finance regulation, lobbying registration and reporting, ethics, conflicts of interest related to public officials and employees, government law.</p>
	<p>Professional experience</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chair, Federal Election Commission (FEC). • Vice Chair, Federal Election Commission (FEC). • Chair, California Fair Political Practices Commission (FPPC). • Deputy Assistant Attorney General for Torts and Consumer Litigation in the Civil Division, U.S. Department of Justice. • Attorney, Santa Clara County Counsel's Office • Governor-Elect, Board of Governors of the State Bar of California. • Member, Judicial Council of the State of California • Chair, Judicial Candidate Evaluation Commission.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



ADRIANA GUTIÉRREZ CANCINO

	Current position	Specialist, Secretary for Strengthening Democracy at the Organization of American States (OAS)
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master's degree in Global Politics from the School of Advanced International Studies (SAIS), Johns Hopkins University. • Bachelor's degree in Government and International Relations from the Universidad Externado de Colombia.
	Areas of expertise	International affairs, public policy, government and democracy, project design and management, technical cooperation in political processes and institutional strengthening.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Advisor to the Office of the High Commissioner for Peace, Colombia. • Advisor to the Presidential Human Rights Program, Colombia. • Officer of the Inter-American Drug Abuse Control Commission. • Specialist, Department of Conferences and Meetings Management, OAS. • Coordinator of the OAS Internship Program.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



MARÍA NOEL VAEZA (VIRTUAL)

	Current position	Regional Director for the Americas and the Caribbean, UN Women
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PhD in Law and Social Sciences from the University of the Republic of Uruguay. • Master in Public Policy from John Hopkins University in Washington DC.
	Areas of expertise	Women's Rights, International Development.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Director, Program Division, UN Women, New York. • Director, Global Portfolio Services Office, UN Women, UNOPS, Copenhagen. • Regional Director, UNOPS for Latin America and the Caribbean. • Senior Advisor, Deputy Resident Representative in Paraguay and Manager of the Recovery, Reconciliation and Reform Program, United Nations Development Program-UNDP. • Political Counselor at the Uruguayan Embassy in Washington DC, delegate to the United Nations General Assembly, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Uruguay. • Alternate Representative of Uruguay, Board of Governors, World Bank.




CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



ISABEL TORRES GARCÍA

	Current position	Consultant Specialist in Democratic Governance, Political Participation and Gender Equality, Regional Office for Latin America and the Caribbean, United Nations Development Programme-UNDP
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MA in International Relations and Diplomacy, Universidad Nacional (UNA), Costa Rica. • Postgraduate degree in Social Sciences with specialization in International Relations from the Latin American Faculty of Social Sciences (FLACSO) of Costa Rica. • Degree in Sociology with specialization in Social Planning from the Central American University of Nicaragua.
	Areas of expertise	Human Rights, Women's Rights and their international protection, Democracy and Electoral Systems, Political Rights, Violence against Women (including violence in politics), Gender Equality.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Advisor and consultant for various agencies of the United Nations System and international organizations with 25 years of experience in their areas of expertise. • Coordinator (9 years), Women's Human Rights Program, Inter-American Institute of Human Rights, Costa Rica. • Guest lecturer at various international forums and universities. • Author, co-author, academic coordinator and editor of more than 40 articles and publications on human rights.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



PIERRE GARRONE (VIRTUAL)



Current Position	Chief of the Elections and Political Parties Division, Venice Commission
Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doctorate in Law from the University of Geneva. • Degree in Advanced European Studies from the College of Europe.
Areas of expertise	Venice Commission, Electoral law, Political Parties, Swiss Constitutional Law, Comparative Constitutional Law, European Union Law, European Internal Market Freedoms.
Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Head of the Elections and Political Parties Division, Venice Commission, Council of Europe. • President, Electoral Office of the Council of Europe for 13 years. • Director of the Elections and Referendums Division of the Venice Commission.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



PANEL 3: THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN LATIN AMERICA AND EUROPE: THE *PRO PERSONA* PRINCIPLE IN ELECTORAL PROCESSES

AMAYA ÚBEDA DE TORRES



Current position

Legal Senior Officer of the Department of the European Social Charter, Council of Europe

Education

- PhD in Law from the Complutense University of Madrid and Robert Schuman University of Strasbourg.

Areas of expertise

International Humanitarian Law in Europe and Latin America, Judicial Dialogue issues, Inter-American Court of Human Rights jurisprudence, Relations between Human Rights and Democracy.

Professional experience

- Professor in international law and human rights, IE University of Madrid and in the Master of the University of Navarra.
- Professor and researcher at numerous universities, such as the Free University of Brussels, the London School of Economics and the University College of London.
- Lecturer, Columbia University and the University of Costa Rica.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



CARLOS ERNESTO CAMARGO ASSIS

	Current position	Ombudsman, Republic of Colombia
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Studied Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law at the American University in Washington D.C. • Lawyer, Master and Doctor in Administrative Law from Universidad Sergio Arboleda.
	Areas of expertise	Promotion, exercise and dissemination of human rights of the inhabitants of the Colombian territory, Administrative Law.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • President, Global Alliance of International Human Rights Institutions – GANHRI. • Executive Director, National Federation of Departments-FND. • Magistrate and President, National Electoral Council-CNE. • Secretary General, Delegate Registrar for Civil Registry and Identification. • Head, Legal Office, National Electoral Council-CNE. • Professor, Universidad Sergio Arboleda.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



PANEL 4: RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DOMESTIC CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

JEAN-PHILIPPE DEROSIER



Current Position

Professor in Public Law, Law Department, University of Lille, France

Member, French University Institute

Member, Scientific Committee of the Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ)

Education

- PhD in Law, University of Paris I - Panthéon-Sorbonne
- Diploma in Advanced Studies (DEA) in Comparative Public Law of European States, University of Paris I- Pantheon-Sorbonne.
- Master, University of Paris X Nanterre

Areas of expertise

Constitutional, Comparative, Administrative, Public, International and European Law.

Professional experience

- Head of ForInCIP, the International Forum on the Constitution and Political Institutions
- Scientific Director of the Journal *Jurisdoctrina*



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



WILFREDO PENCO (VIRTUAL)

	Current Position	Electoral Expert
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doctor in Law and Social Sciences, Universidad de la República.
	Areas of expertise	Public and electoral law.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • President, National Academy of Letters of Uruguay. • Justice, Electoral Court of Uruguay. • Observer, chief and general coordinator of international missions in Latin American countries, for UNIORE, UNASUR, OAS and CEELA. • Co-founder, Council of Electoral Experts of Latin America-CEELA and of the Electoral Council of the Union of South American Nations-UNASUR. • Senator in Uruguay. • Secretary General, Departmental Government of Montevideo. • Honorary Professor, Ricardo Palma University, Peru.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



JOSÉ DE JESÚS OROZCO



**Current
Position**

Researcher, Instituto de Investigaciones Jurídicas-IIJ,
National Autonomous University of Mexico-UNAM

Professor, School of Law, National Autonomous
University of Mexico

Education

- Law Degree and PhD in Law from the National Autonomous University of Mexico-UNAM.

**Areas of
expertise**

Electoral Processes, Electoral Justice, Ethics and
Electoral Law, Political and Electoral Reforms.

**Professional
experience**

- Member, Advisory Council, National Human Rights Commission (Comisión Nacional de los Derechos Humanos-CNDH).
- President, Inter-American Commission on Human Rights-CIDH.
- Counselor, National Commission of Medical Arbitration.
- Justice, High Chamber, Electoral Tribunal of the Judiciary of the Federation.
- Commissioner, Inter-American Commission on Human Rights-IACHR.
- Researcher level III of the National System of Researchers.
- Member, Board of Governors, UNAM.
- First Rapporteur, Inter-American Commission on Judicial Independence.




CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



PANEL 5: INTERNATIONAL TREATIES AND JURISPRUDENCE: MODELS OF INTERPRETATION AND APPLICATION

CARMEN GLORIA VALLADARES

	Current Position	Secretary-Rapporteur, Qualifying Tribunal of Elections, Chile Member, Association of Women Magistrates of the Americas-AMEA
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Postgraduate degree in Constitutional Law from Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile. • B.A. from the Pontifical Catholic University of Chile.
	Areas of expertise	Electoral Justice, Constitutional Law.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Acting President, Constitutional Convention of the Republic of Chile. • Member of international electoral observation missions in several Latin American countries.

RENE ABELARDO MOLINA OSORIO

	Current Position	Alternate Magistrate, Supreme Electoral Tribunal, El Salvador.
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Degree in Law from Central American University "Dr. José Simeón Cañas".
	Areas of expertise	Administrative Law, Public Law and Governance.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • General Legal and Administrative Attorney, Jomi SA. de CV. and S y M. Laboratories. • Legal Collaborator, Chamber of Transit, First Section of the Center. • Advisor of different companies dedicated to international commerce. • Professor, Universidad Panamericana. • Legal Office "Ramirez y Molina Asociados". • Delegate of Duicentro. San Vicente, National Registry of Natural Persons.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



RAFAEL RUBIO



Current Position

Professor of Constitutional Law, Complutense University of Madrid, Spain

Councilor, Council of Transparency and Participation, Community of Madrid

Member of the Scientific Committee, Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ)

Scientific Leader, Observatory on Social Media, Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ)

Education

- Doctor in Constitutional Law from the Complutense University of Madrid.

Areas of expertise

Constitutional law, impact of technology on the configuration of fundamental rights (electoral rights, freedom of expression, hate crimes), open government, transparency.

Professional experience

- Member, Venice Commission, Council of Europe.
- Director, Research Group on Participation and New Technologies (i+dem), UCM.
- Member, Open Government Forum, Corresponding Academician, Royal Academy of Jurisprudence and Legislation.
- Deputy Director, Center for Political and Constitutional Studies (Ministry of the Presidency of the Government of Spain).
- Visiting Professor, University of Navarra.
- Visiting Researcher, Universities of Georgetown, Harvard, George Washington and *Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna*.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



PATRICK SENSBURG (VIRTUAL)



Current position

Director, Master of Public Management (MPM), University of Police and Public Administration, Germany

Professor of European Law, University of Vienna, Austria

Member, G10-Kommission, German Parliament

President, Observatory on Social Media Board, Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ)

Education

- Ph.D. in Law.
- State exams in Law.
- Master's degree in political science.

Areas of expertise

European Law, Electoral Law, Political Science.

Professional experience

- President, Committee on Scrutiny of Elections, Immunity and the Rules of Procedure, German Parliament.
- Member, Parliamentary Oversight Panel and member of the Council of Elders.
- Chair, Subcommittee on European Law.
- Member, Committee on Legal Affairs, German Parliament.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



PANEL 6: GLOBAL NETWORK ON ELECTORAL JUSTICE APPLIED SOLUTIONS

MANUEL DELGADO-IRIBARREN GARCÍA-CAMPERO		
	Current position	Legal Counsel to the Spanish Parliament and Director of the Technical Secretariat, Central Electoral Commission, Spain
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Law Degree from the Faculty of Law of the Complutense University of Madrid
	Areas of expertise	European Constitutional and European Community Law, Electoral Law.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lawyer, Spanish Parliament, Joint Commission for the European Union. • Associate Professor of Constitutional Law, Complutense University of Madrid. • Professor of Constitutional and European Community Law, Carlos III, Rey Juan Carlos and San Pablo-CEU Universities. • Deputy Secretary General, Congress of Deputies. • International Consultant, Inter-American Development Bank (IDB). • Election observer in several electoral processes.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



MICHAEL MOHALLEM (VIRTUAL)



Current Position

Professor of Law, Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro

Head, Anticorruption Knowledge Center, Transparency International, Brazil chapter

Education

- Master and Ph. D. in Public Law and Human Rights, University College London
- Postgraduate studies in Political Science, University of Brasilia
- Bachelor's degree in Law, Catholic Pontific University of Sao Paolo

Areas of expertise

Public law, human rights, electoral campaigns, comparative constitutional law, anti-corruption.

Professional experience

- Member, Scientific Committee, Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ).
- Professor of Human Rights and Coordinator of the Center for Justice and Society of the Getulio Vargas Foundation, Rio de Janeiro chapter.
- Consultant for Transparency International, Brazil chapter.
- Director of campaigns in Brazil for *Avaaz.org*.
- Researcher of the project Oxford Reports on International Law and Domestic Courts.
- Senior Legal Adviser, National Secretariat of Legislative Affairs, Ministry of Justice of Brazil.
- Parliamentary Adviser on Government Leadership in the Federal Senate of Brazil.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



PANEL 7: JURISDICTIONAL INTERPRETATION TO FULFILL AND GUARANTEE RIGHTS FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL

HERNÁN PENAGOS GIRALDO



Current position

Election expert, Colombia

Education

- Master in Constitutional Justice and Human Rights. University of Bologna, Italy.
- Specialist in Administrative Law. University of Caldas.
- Specialization in Domestic Public Services, Universidad Externado de Colombia.
- Diploma in University Teaching. University of Caldas.
- Law Degree.

Areas of expertise

Public administration, transitional justice, administrative law.

Professional experience

- Chief Justice, National Electoral Council (CNE), Colombia.
- Magistrate, National Electoral Council (CNE), Colombia.
- President, House of Representatives, Colombia.
- Co-Chairman, Peace Commission, Congress of Colombia.
- Representative, Chamber of the Republic of Colombia.
- Deputy and President, Assembly of the Department of Caldas.
- University Professor in the field of Administrative Law and Electoral Law.
- Speaker coordinator, bills related to the Peace Agreement signed between the Republic of Colombia and the FARC - EP.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



CARLOS JOSÉ VIDAL PRADO



Current position

Professor of Constitutional Law, National University of Distance Education (UNED)

Member, Central Electoral Commission, Spain

Lecturer in Doctoral Courses, University of Verona

Member, Advisory Board, Faculty of Law, University of Verona

Postgraduate Professor, University of Alcalá de Henares.

Academician, Royal Academy of Jurisprudence and Legislation of Spain

Education

- PhD and Law Degree from the University of Navarra, Spain.

Areas of expertise

Constitutional Law, Academic Freedom and Freedom of Education, Public Law, Educational Law, Comparative Constitutional Law, European and Comparative Law, Electoral Systems, Representative Democracy.

Professional experience

- Professor of Constitutional Law, University of Navarra.
- Deputy Secretary General and Deputy Vice-Rector for European Space, UNED.
- Director (Vice-Rector), UNED in the Community of Madrid.
- Secretary, Political Law Review.



CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



MARÍA FERNANDA RANGEL ESPARZA

	Current position	Delegate Ombudsman for Women's Rights and Gender Affairs, Ombudsman's Office of the Republic of Colombia
	Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master in Government and Public Administration from the Complutense University of Madrid. • Specialist in Public Management from University of the Andes. • Specialist in State Contracting from the Externado University of Colombia. • Law degree from the Externado University of Colombia.
	Areas of expertise	Public Management, State Contracting.
	Professional experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Director of Information, Analysis and Immediate Reaction-DIARI, Office of the Comptroller General of the Nation, Colombia. • Secretary General, Ministry of the Interior. • Office Advisor, Attorney General's Office, Colombia. • Contractor, Senate of the Republic. • Counsel, Ministry of Justice and Law. • Contractor, <i>Fiduciaria la Previsora S.A.</i> • Advisor, Administrative Department, Presidency of the Republic.




CONVENTIONALITY CONTROL:

A DIALOGUE BETWEEN THE AMERICAS AND EUROPE



ALBERTO GUEVARA CASTRO

	<p>Current position</p>	<p>General Director of International Relations, Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary (TEPJF), Mexico</p> <p>Technical Secretary, Global Network on Electoral Justice (GNEJ)</p>
	<p>Education</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master's degree in Public Policy and Public Administration from the University of York, United Kingdom. • Master's degree in International Relations, <i>Institut Barcelona d'Estudis Internacionals</i>, Spain. • Bachelor's degree in Political Science from the Ibero-American University, Mexico.
	<p>Areas of expertise</p>	<p>Political Analysis, Transparency and Access To Information and Electoral systems.</p>
	<p>Professional experience</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coordinator, Relations with Electoral Bodies, Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary (TEPJF). • General Director of Relations with Electoral Bodies, TEPJF. • Head of the International Affairs Unit, Coordination of Relations with Electoral Bodies, TEPJF. • Advisor on communications, prospective scenarios and political analysis, Specialized Prosecutor's Office for Electoral Crimes of Mexico (FEPADE). • Member of the Secretariat, Global Commission on Elections, Democracy and Security, of International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (International IDEA) and Kofi Annan Foundation.