



Strasbourg, 23 December 1999
<cdl\doc\1999\cdl-di\4rev.e> **Avis N° 091/1999**

Restricted
CDL-DI (99) 4 rev.
Or. Fr.

EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW

(VENICE COMMISSION)

FEDERATED AND REGIONAL ENTITIES AND INTERNATIONAL TREATIES

Summary table of the replies to the questionnaire

COMPARATIVE TABLE OF REPLIES TO THE QUESTIONNAIRE ON FEDERATED AND REGIONAL ENTITIES AND INTERNATIONAL TREATIES

- Column A State (federal/regional/containing an autonomous entity)
- Column B Power of the entities to conclude treaties in the field of international relations (question 1.a)
- Column C Source of this power (question 1.b)
- Column D Apportionment of treaty-making powers between the central state and the entities (questions 1.c and 1.d)
- Column E Potential contracting parties of the entities (question 1.e)
- Column F Possibility for entities to accede to multilateral treaties (question 1.f)
- Column G Apportionment between the central state and the entities of procedural responsibilities concerning treaties concluded by the entities need for the central state's approval (question 2)
- Column H Settlement of disputes concerning the interpretation of treaties concluded by the entities (question 3.b)
- Column I Consultation of the entities before conclusion of a treaty by the central state/participation of the entities in treaty negotiations (questions 4.a 4.d)
- Column J Possibility of delegating the central state's treaty-making powers to the entities (question 4.e)
- Column K Apportionment of powers between the central state and the entities with regard to the introduction and implementation of treaties concluded by the central state or the entities/possibility of the central state taking over this responsibility from the entities (questions 3.a and 5)
- Column L Practical application of the entities' treaty-making powers (question 6)
- Column M Representation of the entities within international organisations/role of the entities in the formulation of state policy within international organisations (question 7.a)
- Column N Representation of the entities within the Council of the European Union/role of the entities in the formulation of state policy within the European Union (question 7.b)

| A | В | С | D | E |
|-----------|---------------------------|--|--|--|
| State | Power of entities (Q.1.a) | Source of power (Q.1.b) | Apportionment of powers (Q.1.c-d) | Other potential contracting parties (Q.1.e) |
| Argentina | Yes | Constitution | Similar to the apportionment of powers at domestic level; treaties concluded by the provinces must not be incompatible with national foreign policy or impinge on national interests | Any state, entity or international organisation |
| Austria | Yes | Constitution | Federation: general powers; <i>Länder</i> : powers within their internal sphere of competence | Neighbouring states or entities |
| Belgium | Yes | Constitution: 1990 special law on institutional reforms; co- operation agreements between the federal state, the regions and the communities | Powers to conclude international treaties corresponds to domestic legislative powers | General right to conclude treaties (ius tractati): states; international organisations; entities within states |

| A | В | C | D | E |
|---|--|--|---|---|
| State | Power of entities (Q.1.a) | Source of power (Q.1.b) | Apportionment of powers (Q.1.c-d) | Other potential contracting parties (Q.1.e) |
| Bosnia and Herzegovina | Yes | Constitution | State: foreign policy; entities: special bilateral relations with neighbouring states with due regard to the sovereignty and territorial integrity of Bosnia and Herzegovina; other agreements with the (general or special) permission of the Parliamentary Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina | Special bilateral relations: neighbouring states; other states, international organisations: with the (general or special) permission of the Parliamentary Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina |
| Canada | In principle, no | N/A (Not applicable) | General power is vested in the central state. Although the provinces are unable to conclude treaties, the Franco-Canadian Cultural Agreement enables them to conclude agreements with France | See column D |
| Denmark (Faeroe Islands and Greenland) | In conjunction with the central state and for administrative arrangements (technical side) | Laws on the autonomy of the Faeroe Islands and Greenland | General power is vested in the central state. The entities can only take part in international negotiations concerning matters within their jurisdiction | In principle, no restrictions, but in general, Nordic countries |
| Finland (Åland Islands) | No | N/A | Only the central state has treaty-making powers | N/A |

| A | В | С | D | E |
|-------------------------------------|--|-------------------------|--|--|
| State | Power of entities (Q.1.a) | Source of power (Q.1.b) | Apportionment of powers (Q.1.c-d) | Other potential contracting parties (Q.1.e) |
| Germany | Yes | Constitution | The Länder may conclude treaties within their internal sphere of legislative competence; there is some dispute as to whether the Federation has treaty-making powers in matters within the exclusive jurisdiction of the Länder; under the Lindau agreement, the Federation must request the consent of the Länder if it wishes to conclude a treaty in a matter within the exclusive jurisdiction of the Länder | All states, entities or international organisations; treaties on the transfer of sovereignty to transfrontier institutions may only be concluded with institutions of border regions |
| Italy | No, but the regions may undertake development initiatives abroad | N/A | Only the central state has treaty-making powers | N/A |
| Portugal (Azores and Madeira) | No | N/A | Only the central state has treaty-making powers | N/A |
| Switzerland | Yes | Constitution | Confederation: general powers; cantons: within their sphere of competence, provided that the Confederation itself has not already concluded a treaty in the field in question | No restrictions (states, territorial authorities, international organisations, etc.) |

| A | В | С | D | E |
|---------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------|---|---|
| State | Power of entities (Q.1.a) | Source of power (Q.1.b) | Apportionment of powers (Q.1.c-d) | Other potential contracting parties (Q.1.e) |
| Ukraine (Crimea) | No | N/A | Only the central state has treaty-making powers | N/A |
| United States | No | N/A | The central state has general treaty making powers; States may conclude agreements / compacts | States are allowed to make compacts or agreements with foreign countries |

| A | F | G | H |
|-----------|---|--|--------------------------------|
| State | Multilateral treaties (Q.1.f) | Procedural responsibilities (Q.2) | Settlement of disputes (Q.3.b) |
| Argentina | No actual cases, but the possibility exists | Province: Congress is simply informed | Province |
| Austria | Possible | The Land governor; must inform the federal government before beginning negotiations; must request federal government's permission before concluding the treaty; full powers to negotiate and conclude the treaty are conferred by the President of the Republic on the proposal and with the countersignature of the governor; the President of the Republic may delegate this power to the regional government; the Land must denounce the treaty at the request of the federal government; if the Land does not do so, power to denounce the treaty passes to the Federation | No specific procedure |
| Belgium | Yes | A) Treaties concluded exclusively by communities or regions: the communities or regions themselves (with the approval of their respective councils); the King must be informed; the Council of Ministers may suspend the procedure; if the federal state and the entities fail to reach an agreement, the King may confirm suspension of the procedure only in exceptional cases – B) "joint" treaties (involving the federal state): negotiation, signature and approval by the relevant parliamentary assemblies: the federal state and the entities; ratification: the King | The federal state |

| A | F | G | Н |
|---|---|--|--|
| State | Multilateral treaties (Q.1.f) | Procedural responsibilities (Q.2) | Settlement of disputes (Q.3.b) |
| Bosnia and Herzegovina | Yes, with the special or general permission of the Parliamentary Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina | President of the entity, with the consent of the Parliamentary Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina; the Parliamentary Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina may demand the denunciation of a treaty by an entity | |
| Canada | No | N/A | N/A |
| Denmark (Faeroe Islands and Greenland) | No, but some agreements are concluded on behalf of the entities | Negotiation and signature: central state and entities; ratification: central state; administrative arrangements: the entities may act on their own initiative | Cf. powers for negotiating and concluding treaties |
| Finland (Åland Islands) | No | N/A | N/A |

| A | F | G | Н |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|---|
| State | Multilateral treaties (Q.1.f) | Procedural responsibilities (Q.2) | Settlement of disputes (Q.3.b) |
| Germany | Yes | The Länder; treaties are subject to federal government approval | The party bound by international obligations (Federation or Länder; there is some dispute as to whether treaties concluded by Länder are binding on the Federation) |
| Italy | No | N/A | N/A |
| Portugal (Azores and Madeira) | No | N/A | N/A |
| Switzerland | Yes | Confederation (Federal Council); cantons may, however, conclude treaties directly with lower-level authorities in foreign countries; such treaties must be approved by the Federal Council and, if necessary, the Federal Assembly | The authority responsible for concluding the treaty (column G) |

| A | F | G | Н |
|---------------------|-------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------|
| State | Multilateral treaties (Q.1.f) | Procedural responsibilities (Q.2) | Settlement of disputes (Q.3.b) |
| Ukraine (Crimea) | No | N/A | N/A |
| United States | N/A | N/A for treaties; for agreements/compacts: the state, with the consent of Congress (which may be implied) | N/A |

| A | I | J | K | L |
|-----------|---|------------------------------------|---|--|
| State | Consultation/ participation in negotiations (Q.4.a-4.d) | Delegation of powers (Q.4.e) | Introduction and implementation of treaties (Q.3.a + 5) | Treaties concluded by the entities (Q.6) |
| Argentina | No | No | According to apportionment of treaty-making powers | Mostly treaties with entities of other states (Brazil, Italy) |
| Austria | The Länder must be consulted before the conclusion of any treaty which affects their interests or which entails carrying out measures by them | No | Cf. general domestic jurisdiction; if a Land fails to act, responsibility passes temporarily to the Federation | No examples; transfrontier cooperation has often taken place without any formal treaties being concluded; treaties have been concluded between the Federation and the Länder |
| Belgium | Treaties concluded exclusively by the federal state: the community and regional governments are simply informed; "joint" treaties: see column G | No | Cf. domestic and external jurisdiction; the state may temporarily take over responsibility from entities failing to act, so as to ensure compliance with the country's international or supranational obligations | Numerous examples of treaties concluded exclusively by the entities and, in particular, "joint" treaties |

| A | I | J | K | L |
|---|---|--|---|--|
| State | Consultation/ participation in negotiations (Q.4.a-4.d) | Delegation of powers (Q.4.e) | Introduction and implementation of treaties (Q.3.a + 5) | Treaties concluded by the entities (Q.6) |
| Bosnia and Herzegovina | | Yes, by decree of the central state | | Numerous examples |
| Canada | No legal obligation, but in practice, before signing treaties that may impinge on the powers of the provinces, the central authority consults them and allows them to take part in negotiations | No | Introduction: central state; implementation: cf. domestic jurisdiction (dualistic system); the central state may not take over responsibility from the entities | No |
| Denmark (Faeroe Islands and Greenland) | In principle, the government of the entity is consulted if the treaty is intended to apply to the entity; if need be, a territorial reservation is entered | Yes, the negotiation and conclusion of treaties by the entities takes place on behalf of the central state | Cf. Domestic jurisdiction; if an entity fails to implement a treaty, the matter is settled through discussion between central government and the entity | Numerous examples of fishing agreements; trade agreements |
| Finland (Åland Islands) | Consultation if the treaty concerns a matter within the jurisdiction of the autonomous authorities of the Åland Islands or is of particular importance to the Åland Islands (in principle); the Åland Islands may take part in the negotiations if there are special grounds for doing so | No; the Åland Islands are only empowered to make proposals | According to domestic jurisdiction (dualistic system); the central state may not take over responsibility from the Åland Islands | No |

| A | I | J | K | L |
|---------|--|------------------------------------|---|--|
| State | Consultation/ participation in negotiations (Q.4.a-4.d) | Delegation of powers (Q.4.e) | Introduction and implementation of treaties (Q.3.a + 5) | Treaties concluded by the entities (Q.6) |
| Germany | The agreement of the Länder is only needed in the event of territory being ceded to a neighbouring state (plebiscite); Länder are consulted before the conclusion of a treaty affecting their own position | No | Treaties concluded by the Federation: introduction: central State; implementation according to apportionment of powers at domestic level; the <i>Länder</i> must implement federal treaties and the Federation enjoys supervisory powers; treaties concluded by <i>Länder</i> : the <i>Länder</i> | Many practical examples over the years |
| Italy | Consultation of two regions with special status is compulsory in the conclusion of certain trade agreements; occasional consultation of other regions | No | In general, the state; the regions, where new regulations are to be issued in fields within the regions' jurisdiction, unless national interests are at stake or coordination of initiatives is needed; the state may take over responsibility from regions failing to act | No |

| A | I | J | K | L |
|-------------------------------------|--|------------------------------------|--|---|
| State | Consultation/ participation in negotiations (Q.4.a-4.d) | Delegation of powers (Q.4.e) | Introduction and implementation of treaties (Q.3.a + 5) | Treaties concluded by the entities (Q.6) |
| Portugal (Azores and Madeira) | Participation in the negotiation of international treaties and agreements which directly concern the entities; consultation on other international treaties and agreements that affect the autonomous regions | No | Introduction: central state; implementation: according to the apportionment of powers at domestic level | No |
| Switzerland | The cantons are involved in formulating foreign policy decisions impinging on their powers or fundamental interests; they are informed and consulted; they are involved in international negotiations in matters impinging on their powers | | According to the apportionment of powers at domestic level; if treaties are not implemented, the Confederation may take over responsibility from the cantons, even in the case of cantonal treaties | Numerous examples, particularly concerning border cantons |
| Ukraine (Crimea) | No; Crimea may, however, make proposals concerning the conclusion of international treaties | No | The central state; Crimea, with the consent of the Ukrainian Minister of Justice, may make proposals concerning the legislation governing implementation of an international treaty | No |
| United States | Consultation: no legal obligation but happens in practice | No | The Union has the power to implement treaties that it has concluded | No; but there are several agreements/ compacts |

| A | M | N |
|-----------|--|---|
| State | Representation of entities within international organisations (Q.7.a) | Representation of entities within the European Union (Q.7.b) |
| Argentina | No, but observers are sometimes sent | N/A |
| Austria | No | The Länder must be informed when European Union bodies propose initiatives that impinge on Länder powers; if a common position is adopted by the Länder, the association of municipalities and the association of towns, it is normally binding on the Federation; in such matters, the Federation may delegate a representative of the regions to represent the Federation on European Union bodies, with the consent of the Federation representative |
| Belgium | A representative of the entities may be included in the country's delegation to an international organisation; each level of authority concerned may be represented on the Belgian delegation; the delegation is chaired by a representative of the level of authority most affected by the particular issue | Matters within the exclusive jurisdiction of the communities or regions: the regional or community minister, depending on the particular case; matters falling within the joint jurisdiction of two (or more) levels of authority: Belgium is represented by a federal, community or regional minister depending on the particular case, supported by an "assistant" minister representing the other level of authority; in both cases, the communities and the regions are represented on a rota basis; permanent co-ordination takes place within the Ministry of Foreign Affairs |

| A | M | N |
|---|--|--|
| State | Representation of entities within international organisations (Q.7.a) | Representation of entities within the European Union (Q.7.b) |
| Bosnia and Herzegovina | No | N/A |
| Canada | Quebec and New Brunswick are members of the Agency for Cultural and Technical Co- operation ("Francophonie"); in other cases, a province may be represented on the Canadian delegation | N/A |
| Denmark (Faeroe Islands and Greenland) | Separate representation within the Nordic Council; representation on Danish delegations, depending on the particular issue and the interests of the entities' respective governments | N/A; the Faeroe Islands and Greenland are not part of the European Union |
| Finland (Åland Islands) | Yes: Nordic Council (Parliamentary Council; Council of Ministers, without voting rights) | The Åland Islands government formulates Finland's position in common policies applicable to the Åland Islands; it is informed about, and helps formulate, Finland's position in matters within its domestic jurisdiction |

| A | M | N |
|-------------------------------------|--|--|
| State | Representation of entities within international organisations (Q.7.a) | Representation of entities within the European Union (Q.7.b) |
| Germany | Possible | No, but <i>Länder</i> governments are involved, through the <i>Bundesrat</i> , in the decision-making process at European level (to the same extent as in the decision-making process at domestic level) |
| Italy | No | The State/Regions Conference is responsible for appointing the regions' representatives within the Italian Permanent Representation to the European Union; it coordinates central government policy on European affairs falling within the regions' jurisdiction |
| Portugal (Azores and Madeira) | Participation in the permanent national delegation of some international organisations | Participation in the interministerial Commission for the European Community (preparation of the Portuguese position and technical implementation thereof); participation in the decision-making process of the Community when matters of specific interest to the regions are at stake |
| Switzerland | No; consultative role before the central state formulates its own position | N/A |

| A | M | N |
|---------------------|---|--|
| State | Representation of entities within international organisations (Q.7.a) | Representation of entities within the European Union (Q.7.b) |
| Ukraine (Crimea) | No | N/A |
| United States | No | N/A |