





CDL-INF(2023)009

Or. En.

EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW (VENICE COMMISSION)

in cooperation with

THE MINISTRY OF DIGITAL TRANSITION AND ADMINISTRATIVE **REFORM OF THE KINGDOM OF MOROCCO**

Regional seminar for senior civil servants

17th UniDem Med

DIGITAL TRANSFORMATION AND ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE: RULES AND APPLICATIONS "

hybrid format (online and in Rabat, Morocco)

21-22 November 2023

PROPORTIONALITY AND TRANSPARENCY OF MEASURES TAKEN BY PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN THE CONTEXT OF DIGITAL TRANSFORMATION AND **CITIZENS' RIGHT TO APPEAL**

by Mr Holger SPERLICH (Government Director, Permanent Representation of the Federal Republic of Germany to the European Union)

> Co-funded by the European Union





Co-funded and implemented by the Council of Europe

The UniDem Med project is implemented in the framework of the joint European Union/Council of Europe programme "Protecting human rights, the rule of law and democracy through shared standards in the Southern Mediterranean" (South Programme V)

> Venice Commission - Council of Europe Commission de Venise - Conseil de l'Europe F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex Tel +33 (0) 3 88 41 38 23 Fax +33 (0) 3 88 41 37 38 E-mail: venice@coe.int Web site: www.venice.coe.int







Regional seminar for senior civil servants, 17th UniDem Med "DIGITAL TRANSFORMATION AND ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE: RULES AND APPLICATIONS" Rabat/Morocco, 21-22 November 2023

<u>Third session:</u> Proportionality and transparency of measures taken by public administration in the context of digital transformation and citizens' right to appeal

Holger Sperlich, Government Director

Potential benefits of use of AI in public administration



- Automation of administrative processes
- Faster analysis of documents
- Interaction with citizens in form of digital assistance systems (e.g. chatbots)
- Detection of anomalies in administrative processes
- Assistance in decision-making processes

Citizens' right to application of AI in public administration?



 Article 41 Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union: Right to good administration

 \rightarrow not legally binding for EU MS authorities in purely national situations

→ However, if algorithms can carry out certain administrative tasks easier, faster and better, shouldn't they also be used in national administrations to ensure efficient public administration?

Basic considerations for the application of AI in public administration



- Al covers very different systems and technologies.
- Technologies differ, for example, in terms of degree of automation and complexity → different potential effects on people.
- Al must be embedded in solid digitalisation processes and concepts.
- Pilot projects with careful evaluation are helpful.

Forms of use of AI in public administration



• Automated decision making (ADM)

only on explicit legal basis

cf. Section 35a Administrative Procedure Act in Germany

"Completely automated issuance of an administrative act

An automated act may be issued entirely by automated means, provided this is permitted by law and there is no discretion or margin of judgement."

• Decision support systems (DSS)

International legal safeguards for use of AI in public administration







- Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
- European Convention on Human Rights
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 1948
- Human Rights Treaties of the UN
- Data protection rules of the EU (GDPR)
- Non-discrimination rules of the EU

Fundamental rights to be taken into account when using AI in public administration

- Right to protection of privacy
- Right to protection of personal data
- Right to freedom from discrimination
- Right to effective remedies and access to justice
- Right to human dignity





Pending international legal instruments on Al

- EU AI Act
 - proposed by EU COM in April 2021
 - risk-based approach
 - ongoing trilogue EP Council
- Al Convention of the Council of Europe
 - under negotiation since January 2022
 - to be adopted by the Committee of Ministers of CoE

Key elements for reasonable use of AI in public administration

- Impact and risk assessments, not only with regard to possible technical problems, but also with regard to affected fundamental rights
- Persons concerned need to know that AI has been used.
- Public administrations must be able to explain their AI systems and the decisions based on them.
- Right of the person concerned to complain about/challenge the decision made
- Good data quality to avoid bias



Quality management by participation of stakeholders and general public



- Important both for internal and external use of AI in public administration
- Involving persons concerned makes it possible to use their knowledge and experience to improve AI applications.
- Strengthening the acceptance of the application of AI in public administration by public participation

"Al is neither good not evil. It`s a tool. The choice of how it gets deployed is ours."



Oren Etzioni, Founding CEO of the Allen Institute for Al

Thank you for your attention!



