



Strasbourg, 2 November 2021

CDL-PI(2021)017

Or.Engl.

# EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW (VENICE COMMISSION)

# CO-OPERATION BETWEEN THE VENICE COMMISSION AND ITS PARTNERS OUTSIDE EUROPE

# **Table of Contents**

l.	Introduction	3
II.	Co-operation with non-European partners in the field of constitutional justice	4
III.	Co-operation with Southern Mediterranean countries	5
IV.	Co-operation with countries of Central Asia	8
V.	Co-operation with Mongolia	10
	Accompanying constitutional and electoral reforms in Latin America: increasing of	
for th	he Venice Commission support	10
VII.	Appendix I	17
VIII.	Appendix II	18
	Appendix III	

#### I. Introduction

- 1. The Commission created in 1990 as a Partial Agreement was transformed into an Enlarged one in 2002. Since this date several non-European countries became full members of the Commission.
- 2. Since its establishment in 1990, the Venice Commission saw cooperation with constitutional courts as essential in promoting constitutionalism, understood as the idea that all action by the state should be confined to the limits set by the constitution. Constitutional courts and equivalent bodies (constitutional councils and supreme courts exercising such jurisdiction) are pivotal in ensuring that all branches of power respect the constitution.
- 3. While the Venice Commission is a European institution, it also extends some of these services notably the CODICES database and the Venice Forum to constitutional courts beyond Europe and its Member States. The Venice Commission cooperates closely with regional and language-based groups of constitutional courts (European, African, Southern African, Asian, Ibero-American, Eurasian, Arab, French-speaking, Portuguese-speaking, Commonwealth/Common Law). Cooperation with these groups grew into the World Conference on Constitutional Justice, for which the Venice Commission acts as the Secretariat.
- 4. In the last twenty years the new statute and the financial support provided by the European Union and several member-States of the Council of Europe gave a possibility to develop full-scale co-operation programmes with Central Asia, Southern Mediterranean and Latin America.
- 5. In Central Asia the Venice Commission developed several bilateral and regional projects in such fields as constitutional assistance, constitutional justice, reform of the judiciary and electoral legislation and practice. National authorities in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan engaged in a constructive dialogue with the Commission and the number of concrete actions has been constantly increasing in the past twenty years.
- 6. The Commission also actively co-operates with countries of Southern Mediterranean region. It established contacts with Arab countries even before the Arab Awakening and this farsightedness proved very useful. After the Arab spring the Commission established a very good co-operation with Morocco and Tunisia. Successful projects in these countries helped to establish and to develop a dialogue with other countries of the region such as Algeria, Egypt, Jordan, Lebanon and Libya. In this respect 2013 was a crucial year since it provided the basis for exploring new possibilities for the Venice Commission's assistance to countries of Maghreb and Middle East.
- 7. Latin American countries have been always interested in sharing experiences and best practices in such fields as democratic transition, constitution-building, constitutional justice, and electoral legislation and practice with Europe. The Venice Commission became crucial for making such dialogue possible. In recent years the Commission and with its partners in Brazil, Chile, Mexico, and Peru prepared and successfully carried out activities and projects in the above-mentioned fields.
- 8. This action of the Commission in Central Asia, Southern Mediterranean and Latin America was possible thanks to the financial support received by the Commission from the European Union<sup>1</sup> and voluntary contributions from Finland, France, Italy, Malta, Mexico, Norway, Spain, and Turkey.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The list of different projects appears in Appendix I.

- 9. The Venice Commission organises different activities outside Europe in close co-operation with other international and regional organisations such as UN, OSCE, OAS, IDEA, IFES and others.
- 10. In 2020 2021 the Commission had to face new condition for co-operation with its partners due to the COVID-19 pandemic. Most activities shifted to on-line format of exchanges; however, the volume and the quality of its assistance remained at the expected level. Moreover, the Commission received requests for co-operation from new non-European countries.

# II. Co-operation with non-European partners in the field of constitutional justice

- 11. In order to steer cooperation between the constitutional courts and the Venice Commission, the Venice Commission established the Joint Council on Constitutional Justice (JCCJ), which is composed of members of the Venice Commission and the liaison officers, appointed by the constitutional courts. The JCCJ has a double presidency, which means that its meetings are cochaired. One of the chairs is a member of the Venice Commission, elected by the Commission at a plenary session and the other is a liaison officer, elected by the liaison officers during the meetings of the JCCJ. The mandates of the two co-chairs run for two years each.
- 12. The geographical scope of the Joint Council covers the Venice Commission Member States, associate Member States, observer states and states or entities with a special cooperation status equivalent to that of an observer state (South Africa, Palestinian National Authority). Within the JCCJ, all participating courts whether from member or observer states benefit from the same type of cooperation. The European Court of Human Rights, the Court of Justice of the European Union and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights participate in the JCCJ as well.
- 13. Since 1996, the Venice Commission has established cooperation with a number of regional or language based groups of constitutional courts, in particular the Conference of European Constitutional Courts, the Association of Francophone Constitutional Courts, the Southern African Chief Justices Forum, the Eurasian Association of Constitutional Review Bodies, the Association of Asian Constitutional Courts and Equivalent Institutions, the Union of Arab Constitutional Courts and Councils, the Ibero-American Conference of Constitutional Justice, the Conference of Constitutional Jurisdictions of Africa and the Conference of Constitutional Jurisdiction of the Portuguese Speaking Countries. The purpose of this cooperation is to strengthen the court members of the groups in their task of safeguarding the supremacy of their constitutions.
- 14. By virtue of cooperation agreements with the Venice Commission, court members of these groups can contribute their case-law to the CODICES<sup>2</sup> database and the groups are represented in the JCCJ. Membership in these groups as well as direct participation in the work of the JCCJ entitles the courts to become members of the World Conference on Constitutional Justice.<sup>3</sup>
- 15. The World Conference on Constitutional Justice unites 118 Constitutional Courts and Councils and Supreme Courts in Africa, the Americas, Asia, Australia/Oceania and Europe. It promotes constitutional justice understood as constitutional review including human rights case-law as a key element for democracy, the protection of human rights and the rule of law (Article 1.2 of the Statute). The Venice Commission acts as the Secretariat of the World Conference.<sup>4</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For more detailed information please refer to : <a href="http://www.codices.coe.int/">http://www.codices.coe.int/</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Bilateral co-operation with bodies of constitutional justice will be examined under the chapters on countries.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For more detailed information please refer to : <a href="www.venice.coe.int/WebForms/pages/?p=02">www.venice.coe.int/WebForms/pages/?p=02</a> WCCJ&lang=EN .

# III. Co-operation with Southern Mediterranean countries

- 16. Co-operation between the Venice Commission and Southern Mediterranean countries started long before the Arab spring. Algeria and Morocco became full members of the Venice Commission in 2007, and Tunisia in 2010.
- 17. The Arab Spring gave new impetus to the co-operation between the Venice Commission and the countries of the Southern Mediterranean. Since then, cooperation with countries of the region has steadily increased. The main co-operation areas include democratic institutions and fundamental rights; constitutional justice and ordinary justice; and elections, referendums and political parties.
- 18. Co-operation may take many forms, such as requests for opinions; contributions to or co-organisation of conferences, seminars, workshops or other events; and exchanges of views or contacts with authorities, institutions or independent bodies. Co-operation may be bilateral or multilateral. In the framework of different projects in the region the Venice Commission actively co-operates with other international and regional organisations such as UNDP, the Union of the Arab Constitutional Councils and Courts (UACCC), the Arab Union of Administrative Judiciary and the Arab Ligue. Different actions are also co-ordinated on a regular basis with EU Delegations.
- 19. Activities for the Southern Mediterranean countries are organised with voluntary contributions from France, Italy, Malta, Norway and Turkey, and with the financial support of the European Union, in particular, within the framework of the Joint EU/Council of Europe South Programme. This programme, funded by the European Union and implemented by the Council of Europe, was launched in 2012 and stepped up several times: in 2015, 2017 and 2020.
  - a. Opinions on draft legislation
- 20. Several countries in Southern Mediterranean region requested legal opinions of the Venice Commission on different pieces of their draft legislation.
- 21. Tunisia was the most active partner to seek this type of assistance. In 2013, at the request of the Constituent Assembly, the Venice Commission had adopted an opinion on the final draft Constitution of Tunisia<sup>5</sup>. After two years of close and fruitful co-operation with the National Constituent Assembly of Tunisia, the new Constitution was adopted on 27 January 2014 and the Venice Commission was invited to participate in the official adoption of the Constitution, which contains many Commission's recommendations. Further co-operation activities focused on the implementation of the new Constitution. The Venice Commission provided opinions on other draft legislation such as the draft institutional law on the Constitutional Court of Tunisia requested on 7 August 2015 by the Tunisian Foreign Ministry. The preliminary opinion was published on 14 August 2015 and its final version adopted by the Venice Commission at its 104th Session (Venice, 23-24 October 2015). The Commission also prepared an interim opinion on the institutional aspects of the draft law on special procedures concerning reconciliation in the economic and financial fields in Tunisia requested in July 2015 by the Truth and Dignity Body of Tunisia. It was adopted by the Venice Commission at its 104th Session (23-24 October 2015). In 2018, the Venice Commission adopted an opinion on the draft organic law on the organisation of political parties and their funding. In June 2019, the Venice Commission adopted

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Document CDL-AD (2013)032

an opinion on the draft organic law on the Independent authority on sustainable development and the rights of future generations.6

22. There are other examples of requests to the Venice Commission for opinions from other countries of the Southern Mediterranean region. In 2013, the Venice Commission adopted an Interim Opinion on the Draft Law on Civic Work Organisations of Egypt.<sup>7</sup> In September 2021, the Minister of justice of Lebanon requested an opinion on the draft law on the judiciary.

#### b. Multilateral activities

- 23. The Venice Commission regularly contributes to or co-organises conferences, seminars, dialogues and other events in the countries of the Southern Mediterranean region dealing with subjects such as constitutional reform, judicial reform, electoral reform, human rights and fundamental freedoms, and the functioning of parliament.
- 24. One of the most successful examples of such cooperation is the UniDem (University for Democracy) Campus for the Southern Mediterranean. The co-operation between the Venice Commission and the Ministry of Public Service and Modernisation of the Administration of the Kingdom of Morocco led to the launching of the UniDem Campus for the Southern Mediterranean countries, a legal capacity-development project for high level civil servants in the MENA region (Algeria, Egypt, Jordan, Lebanon, Libya, Mauritania, Morocco, Palestinian National Authority and Tunisia). The first UniDem Med seminar, which focused on "Human Rights and public service", was held in Rabat in September 2015. The latest 13th seminar organised in co-operation with the General Personnel Council of Palestine<sup>8</sup> in a hybrid format took place on 5-6 October 2021.9
- 25. Another example of such co-operation is the Venice Commission's co-operation with the Office of the Mediator of Morocco, in which the Venice Commission supports training sessions for the staff of the Ombudsmen. Other examples include participation in conferences or meetings on the subjects of justice and constitutional justice (Tunisia, Morocco, Jordan and Lebanon); electoral issues (Tunisia and Lebanon); human rights and fundamental freedoms (Tunisia and Morocco); and the functioning of parliament (Morocco).
- 26. Co-operation in this area also included other Human rights defenders in the region. The National Council for Human Rights of Egypt, in cooperation with the Commission, organised an introductory seminar on "Open Government" on 25-26 February 2020 in Cairo, Egypt. The event was attended by some 60 participants from ten countries as well as the Vice-President of the Commission and members on behalf of Bulgaria and Cyprus. Ombudsmen from Morocco and Tunisia were among the participants in the conference.
- 27. The Venice Commission is regularly asked to contribute to dialogues in the region that focus on subjects that are important for democracies. The intercultural workshops on democracy were launched by the Venice Commission in 2012. Seven workshops have been organised so far, which enabled lawyers, politicians and academics from different Arab countries and their European colleagues to hold fruitful exchanges of views on subjects such as constitutional reforms and their implementation as well as freedom of association and political parties. Representatives from Algeria, Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Lebanon, Libya, Mauritania, Morocco,

<sup>8</sup> This designation shall not be construed as recognition of a State of Palestine and is without prejudice to the individual positions of Council of Europe and European Union member States on this issue.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The texts of these opinions are available on the webpage of the Venice Commission :  $\frac{www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/?country=127\&year=all}{^7 \ Document \ CDL-AD(2013)023} \ .$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> More detailed information is available on the web-page of the Venice Commission on : www.venice.coe.int/WebForms/pages/?p=03 Campus UniDem List&lang=EN.

Palestine, Tunisia and Yemen have participated in these activities. The latest 7<sup>th</sup> workshop was organised by the Venice Commission, in co-operation with the Consultative Council of European Judges (CCJE) and the European Commission for the efficiency of Justice (CEPEJ) in Strasbourg on 28-29 October 2019. This event took place in the framework of the presidency of France at the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe and was dedicated to the topic of the High Councils of the Judiciary and the Independence of Justice.<sup>10</sup>

- 28. The success of the intercultural workshops on democracy shows the importance of providing a forum for new democracies to share their common experience. These workshops enable lawyers, politicians, and academics from different Arab countries and European colleagues to hold fruitful exchanges of views on a wide range of topics.
- 29. In the context of regional co-operation, the Venice Commission's co-operation with the Organization of Arabic Speaking Electoral Management Bodies (ArabEMBs) is another important regional project. On 24 October 2015, the Venice Commission and the Organization of Arabic Speaking Electoral Bodies signed a Memorandum of Understanding setting out the terms and conditions for their cooperation. Since the establishment of the Arab EMBs, the Venice Commission in co-operation with the UNDP regional project has assisted this organisation in creating the regional network of electoral administrations, to identify its main areas of intervention and to launch several projects.
- 30. Another regional organisation that requested co-operation with the Venice Commission was the Arab Union of Administrative Judiciary. On 8 and 9 October 2018, The Egyptian Council of State organised in collaboration with the Venice Commission of the Council of Europe and the Arab Union of Administrative Judiciary an international conference entitled "Voting in Elections and Referendums between Right and Duty". This event gathered judges and academia from Egypt, other countries from the region and European experts. The participants discussed such issues as guarantees of voters' participation in elections, measures to enhance participation in elections and issues related to compulsory voting and international standards in the electoral field.
  - c. Projects aimed at promoting bilateral co-operation with Tunisia
- 31. The Venice Commission strengthened its co-operation with Tunisia after 2011 by supporting with its expertise the process of transition and democratic consolidation on the basis of the Council of Europe main pillars human rights, Rule of law and democracy. Since 2010, Tunisia had become a full member of the Venice Commission. As such, it associated the Commission in 2012 with the reflections of the National Constituent Assembly on the new Tunisian Constitution which was adopted in January 2014 following an opinion by the Venice Commission.
- 32. After the adoption of the Tunisian Constitution of 2014, the Venice Commission continued to be very closely associated with the work on guarantees of independence, on the standards common to its bodies, and this, in the elaboration of a framework law, but also on electoral standards, in cooperation with the Independent High Authority for elections (ISIE). This work is based on the tripartite collaboration between the Tunisian independent bodies, the European Union and the Council of Europe, within the framework of the project to support the Tunisian independent bodies. Launched for the period 2019 2021, 13 this project is funded by the European Union and the Council of Europe and implemented by the Council of Europe. Within

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> For more information, see: <a href="www.venice.coe.int/WebForms/pages/?p=03\_04\_IWD&lang=EN">www.venice.coe.int/WebForms/pages/?p=03\_04\_IWD&lang=EN</a> .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> The text is available on: www.venice.coe.int/files/2015 10 24 MoU Arab EMBs.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See <a href="www.venice.coe.int/WebForms/pages/?p=03\_05\_Arab\_EMBs&lang=EN">www.venice.coe.int/WebForms/pages/?p=03\_05\_Arab\_EMBs&lang=EN</a> .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Currently negotiations are under way to extend the PAII-T and AP-Just projects until 2022.

the framework of the PAII-T project, the Venice Commission prepared a diagnosis on the current situation and the problems encountered by the authorities. Several practical workshops covering fields as diverse as strategic communication, the budget or the regulatory framework were organised for the authorities and an opinion on the organic law relating to the Authority for Sustainable Development and the Rights of Future Generations was adopted by the Venice Commission at its 119th session (19-21 June 2019). The Venice Commission also supported the activities of the League of Independent Instances to strengthen the synergies between the authorities, to facilitate the resolution of possible conflicts of jurisdiction and to identify common concerns.

- 33. The Venice Commission is also part of the "Improving the functioning, performance and access to justice in Tunisia (AP-JUST).
  - d. Assistance to the working group on electoral legislation in Libya organised by United Nations Support Mission in Libya (UNSMIL)
- 34. In 2018 at the request of the EU Delegation to Libya, a Venice Commission expert, Mr Peter Wardle, was involved in the working group in charge of the preparation of the draft laws on referendum, parliamentary and presidential elections put in place by UNSMIL. Mr Wardle participated in 7 meetings of the Working group organised between January and July 2018. The substantial contribution of the Venice Commission's expert to the process was highly praised by the EU Delegation, UNSMIL and representatives of Libya.
- 35. Initial drafts of the three laws had been prepared with the direct involvement of Mr Wardle and later shared with the Libyan authorities. In Autumn 2018 the expert advised the working group on such issues as election observation, accreditation mechanisms and training of national observers from NGOs.

#### IV. Co-operation with countries of Central Asia

- 36. Since 2007, the Venice Commission has established an excellent level of co-operation with national institutions of Kazakhstan, <sup>14</sup> Kyrgyzstan, <sup>15</sup> Tajikistan and Uzbekistan, in various fields with funding provided by the European Union as well as by some Council of Europe member states.
  - a. Targeted co-operation projects based on demand
- 37. The Venice Commission was one of the first organisations to start targeted co-operation on rule of law issues with the countries of Central Asia. Based on its reputation as an independent and impartial instrument of legal co-operation, the Venice Commission managed to build very good working relations with different State institutions in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan. Although at a lesser level, representatives of Turkmenistan were involved in several multilateral activities of the Venice Commission since 2012.
  - b. Opinions on draft legislation
- 38. In 2010 2021 the Venice Commission has prepared several opinions upon requests from national authorities of Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan. For example, the Commission adopted opinions on the draft Constitutional Law on the Constitutional Court of Tajikistan (2014), amendments to the Constitution of Kyrgyzstan (2016), on the amendments to the Constitution of Kazakhstan (2017), on the Reform of the High Judicial Council of Kazakhstan (2018), the Administrative Procedure and Justice Code of Kazakhstan (2018), the draft Election

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Member of the Venice Commission since 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Member of the Venice Commission since 2004.

Code of Uzbekistan (2018), the draft Law "On freedom of conscience and religious organisations in Uzbekistan (2020), an Urgent amicus curiae brief relating to the postponement of elections motivated by constitutional reform (2020), on the Concept paper for improving the legal framework of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2021) and on the Joint Opinion of the OSCE/ODIHR and the Venice Commission on the Draft Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic (2021).<sup>16</sup>

c. Regional projects: the Venice Commission takes part in the EU funded Central Asia Rule of Law Initiative

- 39. In 2009 the Venice Commission carried out a co-operation programme with five Central Asian countries with the financial support of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Germany. Based on its success in December 2009 the Council of Europe and the European Commission signed an agreement for a joint action in the framework of the "EU – Central Asia Rule of Law Initiative". The two-year programme covered the following Central Asian countries: Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan and it aimed at contributing to the development of the judicial system, law enforcement and modernisation of legislation. It offered tools for countries from the region to further develop the rule of law, comprising assistance to judicial systems and legal professions, as well as advisory services and regional exchange in the field of legislation. Some of the aspects of the Programme were further development of constitutional mechanisms aimed at strengthening the principles of rule of law, separation of powers and legal certainty through reform of the existing legislation and its effective implementation; enhancing efficiency and independence of judiciary in general and Constitutional Councils and Courts in particular; assistance to the reform of the institution of public prosecution and other investigative bodies; further integration of international law into national legal systems and assistance to the reform of electoral systems and improvement of election administration.
- 40. The successful co-operation on this first project ensured the on-going involvement of the Commission in different co-operation projects in Central Asia from 2012 to 2018. Since 2019 a new project "Promote efficient functioning of state institutions and public administration" aims to promote efficient functioning of state institutions and public administration in accordance with European and other international standards in the Central Asia partner countries (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan). Venice Commission is implementing the project in the framework of the Joint EU/Council of Europe Central Asia Rule of Law Programme which aims to help the targeted countries to reinforce human rights, rule of law and democracy in accordance with European and other international standards by offering assistance to reform processes, based on a demand-driven approach.
- 41. Since the official start of this regional project, the Venice Commission organised and participated in a number of events in the field of constitutional justice and reforms of the judiciary, notably, an on-line conference on the use of digital technologies in the process of selection, assessment, and promotion of judges (Nur-Sultan, 25 November 2020); the Samarkand Human Rights Web Forum (Tashkent, 2020); international round table on the referral of the decisions to the Constitutional Council by ordinary courts (Nur-Sultan, 21 February 2021); meeting of the Donors' Partners Coordination Council on the opinion of the Venice Commission on the draft constitution of Kyrgyzstan (Bishkek, 6 April 2021); the "Tashkent Law Spring" International Legal Forum (Tashkent, 22 23 April, 2021); and the International online Seminar "Execution of the decisions of the Constitutionals Courts and equivalent bodies theory and practice" (Nur-Sultan, 25 June 2021).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The full list of Venice Commission's opinions on legislation of countries of Central Asia and other non-European countries appears in Appendix II.

- d. Bilateral co-operation: support to the electoral and constitutional justice reforms in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan
- 42. Following positive results of the Joint EU/CoE Venice Commission Regional Rule of Law programme in Central Asia (2010-2014), authorities of Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan expressed their wish to continue working with the Venice Commission.
- 43. These requests allowed the Commission to develop separate bilateral projects with Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. In 2011-2012 the Venice Commission developed co-operation with the authorities of Kazakhstan in the framework of the EU-funded project "Support to the electoral process in Kazakhstan" and in 2013 2015 with Kyrgyzstan in the framework of another EU-sponsored action "Support to the Kyrgyz authorities in improving the quality and efficiency of the Kyrgyz Constitutional justice system". In February 2017, the Venice Commission started the implementation of a new project in the electoral field in Kyrgyzstan. This two-year project (2017-2018) was aimed at helping the country's authorities in the elaboration of a comprehensive strategy and in the process of reform of the electoral legislation and practice in accordance with international standards by making tools and expertise available to national institutions involved in the electoral reform.

# V. Co-operation with Mongolia

- 44. On 6-7 June 2019, The Constitutional Court of Mongolia and the Venice Commission organised a conference on "Separation of powers and the Constitutional Court" in Ulaanbaatar. Representatives of constitutional courts and international experts focused on such issues as relations of Constitutional courts with executive, legislative powers and the judiciary. The discussion enabled exchanges on possible ways of ensuring the independence of constitutional justice. The President of the Venice Commission, Mr Gianni Buquicchio, participated in the event. On the side-lines of the conference organised with the Constitutional Court, Mr Buquicchio met with the Speaker of Parliament, Mr Gombojavyn Zandanshatar and the President of Mongolia, Mr Khaltmaagiyn Battulga and discussed the proposed reforms in the field of the judiciary and elections.
- 45. Representatives of the Constitutional court of Mongolia participate on a regular basis in multilateral events in the field of constitutional justice of the Venice Commission.

# VI. Accompanying constitutional and electoral reforms in Latin America: increasing demand for the Venice Commission support

- 46. In 2002 the Venice Commission became an enlarged agreement allowing for the accession of non-European countries. Brazil, Chile, Costa-Rica, Mexico and Peru joined the Commission as full members and Argentina and Uruguay as observer states. Due to the growing number of activities in the Americas, co-operation has been stepped up between the Commission and regional organisations in the Americas, institutions and mechanisms of the Ibero-American system, as well as with individual countries of the region seeking Commission's assistance.
- 47. Since 2013, the Venice Commission has developed fruitful co-operation with countries from the region through its Sub-Commission on Latin America, which met in 2013 in Mexico City, for its first ever meeting outside Venice. The 2014, 2015 and 2016 meetings of the Sub-Commission were hosted respectively by Brazil, Chile and Peru. As a result of the growing interest in co-operation in the Americas, the Venice Commission received several requests from the authorities asking to assess draft legislation and adopted several opinions on requested by the authorities of Bolivia, Mexico and Peru.
- 48. Active exchanges have been developed with such regional organisations as the Organisation of American States (OAS), the Interamerican Court of Human Rights, the Interamerican Union of

the Electoral bodies (UNIORE) and the Ibero-American Conference of Constitutional Justice (CIJC). It is important to highlight the close co-operation relationship between the Venice Commission and the Organisation of American States, with which a Co-operation Agreement on advancement and realisation of exchange, co-operation and technical assistance actions related to the further development of the principles of rule of law and separation of powers in Latin America was signed in 2020.<sup>17</sup>

- 49. One of the latest examples concerns co-operation between the Venice Commission and the Centre for Constitutional and Political Studies of the Kingdom of Spain (CEPC). On 19 December 2020, the Director of the Centre, Ms Yolanda Gómez Sanchez, and the Director, Secretary of the Venice Commission, Ms Simona Granata-Menghini, signed a Memorandum of understanding aimed at establishing the terms for co-operation and technical assistance on issues related of the rule of law and the separation of powers, as well as fundamental rights, constitutional justice, political systems and representative democracy. The parties confirmed their intention to strengthen their co-operation on issues related to countries of Latin America. Spain seconded a lawyer with a task to work on the project on Support to reforms of electoral legislation and practice and regional Human Rights instruments and mechanisms in countries of Latin America, Central Asia and Mongolia.
- 50. During the visit of the President and the Secretary of the Venice Commission to Madrid in June 2021, fruitful exchanges of views were held with the Ibero-American Secretary General and relevant interlocutors of Rule of Law mechanisms of the Ibero-American system. The Venice Commission delegation also met with the Secretary General and Deputy Secretary General of the Ibero-American Justice Ministers Conference (COMJIB), the National Coordinator of the Ibero-American Judicial Summit, the Permanent Secretary of the Ibero-American Conference of Presidents of Constitutional Courts and the Secretary General of the Ibero-American Federation of Ombudsmen Conference, as well as with the Director of the CEPC. As a follow-up to the visit several activities are being prepared by the Venice Commission in co-operation with the Ibero-American partners and the CEPC.
- 51. With a difference of Southern Mediterranean and Central Asia, the Venice Commission had only two EU-financed projects in the region: the 2009 2012 Council of Europe-European Union joint programme targeting the implementation of the new Constitution in Bolivia (2009 2012) and the on-going thematic project on support to reforms of electoral legislation and practice and regional Human Rights instruments and mechanisms in countries of Latin America, Central Asia and Mongolia (2019 2022). Several co-operation activities were possible since they were financed through the voluntary contributions from Spain and Mexico.
- 52. Some major standard-setting documents of the Commission have also been translated into Spanish with the support of its Latin American members and the Spanish Centre of political and constitutional studies.<sup>18</sup>

# a. Opinions on draft legislation

53. The first opinion on Latin American countries was prepared upon request from the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe in 2005 and concerned the constitutional reforms relating to the disappearance and murder of a great number of women and girls in Mexico. After this first request the Commission prepared several opinions upon request from the authorities of Latin American countries. In 2011 the Commission prepared two opinions upon request from Bolivian authorities on the Draft Organic Law of the Public Prosecutor's Office and on the draft code of constitutional procedure; Amicus Curiae Brief on the case Santiago Bryson de la Barra et

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> See: Venice Commission - AOS on Vimeo.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Please refer to the specific page of the Venice Commission's website: <u>www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/?Language=19&year=all</u>.

al (on crimes against humanity) for the Constitutional Court of Peru (2011); in 2013 on the electoral legislation in Mexico; and on linking constitutional amendments to the question of confidence requested by the Congress of Peru in 2019.

54. Article 3 para 2 of its revised Statute of the Venice Commission provides that it "may supply, within its mandate, opinions upon request submitted by the Committee of Ministers, the Parliamentary Assembly, the Congress of Local and Regional authorities of Europe, the Secretary General, by a state or international organisation or body participating in the work of the Commission."19 This provision of the Statute gave the Commission a possibility to prepare opinions upon requests from different regional organisations such as, for example, OSCE and OAS. In 2017, following the request from the Secretary General of OAS, and based on the the Venice Commission adopted an opinion on the legal issues raised by Decree 2878 of 23 May 2017 of the President of the Republic of Venezuela on calling elections to a national constituent Assembly. In 2019, the Venice Commission adopted a report about the term limits for Presidents (part I) Members of Parliament, Representatives elected at Sub National and local level and executive officials elected at sub national and local level (part II). The report had also been prepared upon the request from the Secretary General of the Organisation of American States (OAS). In October 2017 he invited the Venice Commission to undertake a study on the right to re-election, against the background of a recently observed bad practice of modification of presidential terms through a decision of constitutional courts rather than through a reform process.

#### b. Multilateral activities

- Regional networks and co-operation with regional organisations

55. The Venice Commission developed a very fruitful co-operation with different international and regional organisations working in Latin America. Active exchanges have been developed with such regional organisations as the Organisation of American States (OAS), the Interamerican Court of Human Rights, the Interamerican Union of the Electoral bodies (UNIORE) and the Ibero-American Conference of Constitutional Justice (CIJC). Several memorandums of understanding were signed allowing to engage in active dialogue and working together on issues of common interest in Latin American countries, for example, with the Organisation of American States in June 2020.

- 56. Most activities concern either constitutional justice, human rights protection mechanisms and standards or cooperation in the electoral field. Among the most recent events, the Venice Commission organised in cooperation with the Ibero-American Federation of Ombudsmen (FIO) an online Conference on "The Venice Principles and Ombudsman Institutions in the protection of Human Rights in Latin America and Europe" (11 12 May 2021).
- 57. Since 2018, the Venice Commission actively co-operates with the Global Network on Electoral Justice. A delegation of the Venice Commission participated in the 3rd Plenary Assembly of the Global Network of Electoral Justice on 6-8 November 2019 in Los Cabos, Mexico, debating on mechanisms of representation, equal access to electoral justice and democracy and corruption. The event was attended by 105 experts, representing 39 electoral authorities from 33 countries, as well as 12 international organisations, 8 academic institutes, 7 private actors, 7 independent experts and 1 observer. This conference aimed to strengthen the synergies within the Network, update the global agenda on electoral justice in accordance with the current challenges to democracy, and identify new and shared strategies. On 9 September 2020 representatives of the Venice Commission participated in the Webinar of the Global Network entitled "Digital Electoral

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> See the Statute of the Venice Commission : www.venice.coe.int/WebForms/documents/?pdf=CDL(2002)027-e&lang=EN .

Justice and COVID-19: Challenges, Opportunities, and Implications of Incorporating New Technologies".

- 58. In the framework of its co-operation with the OAS, representatives of the Commission take part in the annual Inter-American Meetings of Electoral Authorities, organised by the Department of Electoral Cooperation and Observation (DECO) of the Organization of American States (OAS). Representatives of the OAS and Latin American electoral administrations attend the meetings of the European Conference of the electoral management bodies.
  - Co-operation with individual countries of Latin America in organizing international and regional events

# **Argentina**

59. In May 2017 Venice Commission representatives attended an international seminar, organised in Buenos Aires by the National Electoral Chamber and Council for International Relations of Argentina in co-operation with UNDP, which served to discuss best practices in the electoral field, participation of women in political process, use of IT technologies in electoral process and financing of political parties and electoral campaigns.

#### **Bolivia**

- 60. On 8-9 February 2012, The Venice Commission and the Public Prosecution Office of Bolivia co-organised an international seminar on "Human Rights in the Work of the Public Prosecution Office in Bolivia" (La Paz, 8-9 February 2012). The seminar gathered prosecutors and judges from all levels and served to discuss the application of international and constitutional human rights in the work of prosecutors. The Venice Commission experts made several presentations, including an explanation of the Inter-American Human Rights system and the subsequent obligations for Bolivia, the standards of proof and the respect for human rights inside and outside the criminal procedures. The participants had an opportunity to learn about the experiences of various European countries in integrating international standards. Over 100 participants from different regions of Bolivia attended this event, which was organised in the framework of the Council of Europe-European Union joint programme targeting the implementation of the new Constitution in Bolivia.
- 61. On 11 and 12 November 2020 representatives of the Venice Commission participated in the "IVth National Seminars: Evidential reasoning, fundamental rights and constitutional interpretation" organised by the Plurinational Constitutional Court of Bolivia on 9 12 November 2020. The purpose of the seminar was to discuss the issues of evidential reasoning, fundamental rights and constitutional interpretation important concepts for the application of the Constitutional Procedural Law. The working sessions focused on exchange of experiences in the resolution of constitutional issues based on the identification of constitutional interpretation applicable to the area; and on the application of different models to concrete practical cases.

#### Brazil

62. On 5-6 May 2014, the Supreme Court of Brazil and the Venice Commission co-organised a Conference on cross-cutting effects of the economic crisis in different countries, the impact of the crisis on fundamental rights and, more specifically, on the protection of economic, social and cultural rights and the role of the judges guaranteeing these rights (Ouro Preto, Brazil). Several members of the Venice Commission participated as well as experts from the European Court of Human Rights, the European Social Charter and of the United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and Judges of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights. Judges from several Latin American countries, including Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, Mexico, Nicaragua, Peru, Uruguay and Venezuela also addressed the conference.

#### Chile

63. On 4-5 December 2015, the Venice Commission, in cooperation with the Constitutional Court of Chile, organized a conference in Santiago de Chile on judicial dialogue in the area of constitutional protection of vulnerable groups. Several experts from the European Court of Human Rights, Judges of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, members and experts of the Venice Commission, as well as judges from several Latin American countries (Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, Mexico, Nicaragua, Paraguay, Peru and Uruguay). Similar issues in terms of "vulnerability" in both Europe and Latin America allow for cross-cutting dialogue and a comparative approach. The conference promoted a double judicial dialogue by presenting on the one hand the jurisprudence of the Inter-American Court compared to that of the European Court of Human Rights. The findings highlighted the problems of defining vulnerability and categorising rights. In order to strengthen the protection of internationally recognised fundamental rights at the national level, participants called for greater use of "monitoring of conventionality" and strengthened judicial dialogue for the establishment of more advanced standards in the field of human rights.

#### Mexico

- 64. Mexico is one of the most active partners of the Venice Commission in Latin America. Since Mexico's accession to the Commission in 2012, an active dialogue was engaged with different national institutions, in particular with the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary and National Electoral Institute (INE).
- 65. In 2019 the Venice Commission and the National Electoral Institute of Mexico signed a Memorandum of Understanding that will enable more active exchanges between the two organisations. The two institutions have been co-operating since 2005 and successfully promote international standards and best practices in the field of elections.
  - i. Co-operation with the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary of Mexico
- 66. One of the joint projects between the Tribunal and the Commission concerns the "Vota database". "VOTA" database was created in 2004 and contains electoral legislation texts of Venice Commission member states as well as from states participating in the Venice Commission works. In October 2013, the Commission concluded a specific co-operation agreement with the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary of Mexico aimed at modernising and designing the "VOTA" database to facilitate the access to and the efficiency of the system. Among other improvements, the database included the electoral legislation of Latin American countries in English and in Spanish.<sup>20</sup> The database became an important tool for specialists and academics in different countries.
- 67. Co-operation with the Tribunal also includes several other activities. In 2013 the Tribunal and the Commission co-organised a Congress on the Implementation of international human rights treaties in national legislation, focusing in particular on electoral rights. More than 900 people attended this event, including representatives of political parties and the civil society, students and other actors. A new study on the implementation of international treaties on human rights in domestic law was launched during the Congress, which was produced in co-operation with the Venice Commission. The Congress also served to promote the European Constitutional Heritage and in deepening the debate between different democratic traditions.
- 68. On 3 5 September 2015, The Venice Commission participated in a conference organised in Mexico by the Tribunal and International IDEA, on the relationship between money and politics. The contribution of the Commission focused on the issue of public financing and different methods

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> See the website of the Vota database: <a href="www.te.gob.mx/vota\_elections/">www.te.gob.mx/vota\_elections/</a>.

of encouraging a balanced participation in elections, as well as effective tools to design and implement effective sanctions.

69. On 29-30 November 2018, the Tribunal and the Commission co-organised an international Congress "The guarantees of democratic processes: international standards and constitutional principles in a comparative perspective". This exchange of views included representatives of different authorities, national NGOs, academia and international and regional organisations. Among other issues the participants discussed the role of international standards in strengthening electoral integrity at the local level; the main threats that the rule of law faces in modern democracies; rule of law and equality and national cultural and political traditions and the rule of law. The event was followed by a meeting of the Sub-Commission on Latin America.

# ii. Co-operation with INE

- 70. The Venice Commission has been co-operating with INE for a number of years. This co-operation included not only exchanges on different topics in the framework of conferences and seminars on electoral issues, but also co-operation on expert assistance to other electoral management bodies in different regions of the world. Experts from INE participate on a regular basis in regional events organised by the Venice Commission in Southern Mediterranean (notably, in activities of ArabEMBs and ISIE in Tunisia) and in conferences of the European electoral management bodies.
- 71. Since 2018, the President of the Venice Commission and members of the Commission participate in the Forum of Latin American democracy. IX Forum of Latin American democracy "Challenges of politics and democracy in the digital age" took place on 4 5 April 2019. The President of the Venice Commission, Mr Gianni Buquicchio, co-opened the IX edition of the event. T the topic of the forum was "Challenges for politics and democracy in the digital age". The Forum is organised by the National Electoral Institute of Mexico. Many international organisations such as OAS, International IDEA, IFES, IIDH as well as prominent representatives of Latin American countries are also involved in this project. The 2021 Forum will focus on the role of the Electoral Bodies in democratic governance.
- 72. In 2020-21 co-operation between INE and the Venice Commission focused on issues related to the protection of electoral rights in the time of pandemic. On 30 October the National Electoral Institute of Mexico and the Venice Commission organised an online conference entitled "COVID-19. States of emergency and democratic values. New contribution to the debate reports of the Venice Commission. "This event was organised in the framework of the Memorandum of Understanding signed between the Venice Commission of the Council of Europe and the National Electoral Institute on March 16, 2019, which indicates the commitment of both institutions to organise and develop international forums aimed at promoting good practices in the field of electoral legislation and practice. In 2021 members and experts of the Venice Commission participated in several on-line discussions concerning the operation of national electoral administrations during the on-going pandemic.

# Peru

73. On 30-31 May 2013, a Venice Commission delegation participated in the International Conference on Individual Access to Constitutional Justice, held in Arequipa, Peru. Constitutional Courts and/or Supreme Courts of Argentina, Brazil, Bolivia, Chile, Colombia, the Dominican Republic, Ecuador, Guatemala, Paraguay, Peru, Uruguay and Venezuela took part in the exchanges. The Venice Commission Report on Individual access to Constitutional Justice (CDL-AD(2010)039rev) was used to open the conference and as a feedback for the discussions. The most debated topics concerned the types of remedies at the constitutional level; vulnerable groups and constitutional justice; complying with international standards and the International Human Rights Courts case-law and effects of constitutional judgments.

74. On 24 – 25 October 2016, the Venice Commission, organised in cooperation with the Constitutional Court of Peru, an international conference entitled "Constitutional reform and democratic stability: the role of Constitutional Courts". It was attended by the President and members of the Venice Commission, along with judges and other representatives of more than ten Latin American countries. The Conference was followed by a meeting of the Sub-Commission on Latin America of the Venice Commission, which was also attended by the President of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights.

# VII. Appendix I

# List of projects implemented by the Venice Commission in non-European countries

#### **Central Asia**

- 2020 2023 Joint EU/Council of Europe Central Asia Rule of Law Programme
- 2017 2018 "Support to strengthening democracy through electoral reform in the Kyrgyz Republic" (funded by EU)
- 2013 2015 "Support to the Kyrgyz authorities in improving the quality and efficiency of the Kyrgyz Constitutional justice system" (funded by EU)
- 2012 2014 "Equal before law: access to justice for vulnerable groups" (funded by Finland)
- 2012 2014 "Supporting constitutional justice, access to justice and electoral reform in the countries of Central Asia" (funded by EU)
- 2011 2012 "Support to the electoral process in Kazakhstan" (funded by EU)
- 2010 2011- "Assistance to the authorities in reforming the legislation of Kyrgyzstan following the 2010 constitutional referendum" (funded by EU)
- 2009 2011 "Rule of law project" (funded by EU and Germany)

# **South Mediterranean**

- 2020 2022 South Programme IV<sup>21</sup>
- 2019 2022 The European Union/Council of Europe joint project to Support Independent Bodies in Tunisia (PAII-T)
- 2019 2021 The European Union/Council of Europe joint project "Improving the functioning, performance and access to justice in Tunisia (AP-JUST)
- 2018 2020 South Programme III
- 2015 2017 South Programme II
- 2012 2014 South Programme I

#### Latin América and the rest of the world

- 2019 2022 Support to reforms of electoral legislation and practice and regional Human Rights instruments and mechanisms in countries of Latin America, Central Asia and Mongolia
- 2009 2012 Council of Europe-European Union joint programme targeting the implementation of the new Constitution in Bolivia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> For more detailed information, please see : <a href="https://www.coe.int/en/web/programmes/south-programme">www.coe.int/en/web/programmes/south-programme</a> .

# VIII. Appendix II

List of general reports opinions prepared upon request from countries of Central Asia and Latin America

# **General reports**

CDL-AD(2019)007 Report on Term Limits; Part II, Members of Parliament, and Part III, Representatives elected at Sub National and local level and executive officials elected at sub national and local level, adopted by the Venice Commission at its 118th Plenary (Venice, 15-16 March 2019)

CDL-AD(2018)010 Report on Term Limits - Part I - Presidents, adopted by the Venice Commission at its 114th Plenary Session, Venice, 16-17 March 2018

#### **Central Asia**

#### Kazakhstan

- 1056/2021 Kazakhstan Opinion on the draft law on the Commissioner for Human Rights
- <u>1023/2021 Kazakhstan Opinion on the Concept paper for improving the legal framework of the</u> Constitutional Council
- 938/2018 Kazakhstan Concept Paper on the High Judicial Council
- 931/2018 Kazakhstan Opinion on the "Draft Code of Administrative Procedures"
- 882/2017 Kazakhstan Opinion on draft amendments to the Constitution of Kazakhstan
- 871/2017 Kazakhstan Opinion on draft law "On Administrative procedures"
- 841/2016 Republic of Kazakhstan Opinion on the Draft Code of Judicial Ethics
- <u>629/2011 Joint Opinion on the constitutional law on the judicial system and status of judges of Kazakhstan</u>
- <u>557/2009</u> Amicus Curiae Brief on the Interpretation of the Kazakh Constitution concerning the participation in the Customs Union within the Euro-Asian Economic Community for the Constitutional Council of Kazakhstan
- •425/2007 Opinion on the possible reform of the Ombudsman Institution in Kazakhstan

# **Kyrgyzstan**

- <u>1021/2021</u> Kyrgyzstan Joint Opinion of the Venice Commission and the OSCE/ODIHR on the draft Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic
- <u>1007/2020 Kyrgyzstan Amicus Curiae Brief on the postponement of the Parliamentary elections motivated by carrying out a constitutional reform</u>
- <u>982/2020</u> Kyrgyzstan Opinion on the amendments to some legislative acts of the Kyrgyz Republic related to sanctions for violation of electoral legislation

- •863/2016 Kyrgyz Republic: draft law "on introduction of amendments and changes to the Constitution"
- •821/2015 Draft Rules of Procedure of the Constitutional Chamber of Kyrgyzstan
- •809/2015 Draft amendments to the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic
- •771/2014 Draft constitutional Law "On introducing amendments and additions to the Constitutional Law 'On the Constitutional Chamber of the Supreme Court of the Kyrgyz Republic"
- •770/2014 Joint opinion Venice Commission and OSCE/ODIHR on the draft amendments to the legal framework on the disciplinary responsibility of judges in the Kyrgyz Republic
- •767/2014 Draft Electoral Code of Kyrgyzstan
- •738/2013 Draft Law amending the Law on non-commercial organisations and other legislative acts of the Kyrgyz Republic
- •625/2011 Joint opinion on the draft law on presidential and parliamentary elections, the draft law on elections to local governments and the draft law on the formation of election commissions of the Kyrgyz Republic
- •624/2011 Opinion on the draft law on the council for the selection of judges of Kyrgyzstan
- •623/2011 Opinion on the introduction of changes to the constitutional law on the status of judges of Kyrgyzstan
- •622/2011 Opinion on the draft constitutional law on the constitutional chamber of the Supreme Court of Kyrgyzstan
- •602/2010 Joint opinion on the draft law on peaceful assemblies of the Kyrgyz Republic
- •582/2010 Opinion on the Draft Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic
- •542/2009 Joint Opinion on the Draft Law on Political Parties of the Kyrgyz Republic
- •525/2009 Joint Opinion on the Draft Law on Assemblies of the Kyrgyz Republic
- •496/2008 Joint Opinion on Freedom of Conscience and Religious Organizations in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan
- •487/2008 Opinion on the draft amendments to the law on freedom of assembly of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan
- •481/2008 Constitutional Court of Kyrgyzstan
- •480/2008 Opinion on the Draft Amendments to the Constitutional Law on the Supreme Court and Local Courts of Kyrgyzstan
- •457/2007 Opinion on the Constitutional situation in the Kyrgyz Republic
- •383/2006 Preliminary Comments on Three Drafts for a revised Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic
- •342/2005 Opinion on Constitutional Reform in the Kyrgyz Republic

•229/2002 - Opinion on the Draft Amendments to the Constitution of Kyrgyzstan

# **Tajikistan**

•

- 765/2014 Draft Constitutional Law "on the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Tajikistan"
- •739/2013 Draft Code of Judicial Ethics of Tajikistan

#### Uzbekistan

- •998/2020 Uzbekistan Opinion on the draft Law on "freedom of conscience and religious organizations"
- •933/2018 Uzbekistan Joint opinion on the draft election code
- •693/2012 Joint Opinion on the Draft amendments and addenda to the law "on elections to the Oliy Majlis of the Republic of Uzbekistan" and "on elections to the regional, district and city councils (Kengesh) of people's deputies of Uzbekistan"

#### **Latin America**

#### **Bolivia**

- •645/2011 Opinion on the draft code of constitutional procedure of Bolivia
- •615/2011 Opinion on the Draft Organic Law of the Public Prosecutor's Office of Bolivia

#### Mexico

- •680/2012 Opinion on the electoral legislation of Mexico
- •330/2004 Opinion on Constitutional Reforms relating to the disappearance and murder of a great number of women and girls in Mexico

#### Peru

- 964/2019 Peru Linking Constitutional Amendments to the Question of Confidence
- •634/2011 Amicus Curiae Brief on the case Santiago Bryson de la Barra et Al (on crimes against humanity) for the Constitutional Court of Peru

#### Venezuela

•894/2017 - Venezuela - Opinion on the legal issues raised by the Decree No. 2878 of 23 May 2017 of the President of the Republic on calling elections to a National Constituent Assembly

# IX. Appendix III

List of activities organised by partners of the Venice Commission with participation of its President, members and experts (2016 – 2021).

#### 2016

#### Egypt:

Alexandria, 27-30 May 2016 - Regional Youth Exchange Programme «Do we need a gender (female representation) agenda for politics?" organised by the Swedish Alexandria University and by the Danish Egyptian Dialogue Institute.

#### Jordan:

Amman, 28 February 2016 – Conference "Arab Constitutional Courts and Councils: possible reforms and challenges in light of regional changes" organised by the Constitutional Court of Jordan and the Konrad Adenauer Foundation.

Amman, 30 May 2016 – Conference on "Parliamentary Democracy: political parties and parliament" organised by the Parliamentary assembly of the Council of Europe and the House of Representatives of the Parliament of Jordan.

#### Morocco:

Rabat, 19 February 2016 - Parliamentary forum for social justice on the theme: "Promoting human dignity for living in unity" organised by the House of Councillors of Morocco.

#### Mexico:

Mexico City, 5 May 2016 - Forum on "Financing of political parties and electoral campaigns", organised by the Mexican National Electoral Institute.

Mexico City, 26-27 May 2016 - International conference on the role of courts and the protection of political rights, organised by the Mexican National Electoral Tribunal.

Mexico City, 24-26 August 2016 - Conference on electoral justice, organised on the occasion of the 20th anniversary of the Mexican Electoral Tribunal.

# Kazakhstan:

Astana, 29-30 August 2016 - Conference on "Constitution - a basis for the dynamic development of society and state", organised by the Constitutional Council of Kazakhstan

# Uzbekistan

Tashkent, 20 - 21 October 2016 - Conference dedicated to the 20th anniversary of the establishment of national human rights institutions of Uzbekistan on «National system for ensuring reliable protection of human rights and freedoms in Uzbekistan: achievements over the years of independence», organised 53 by the National Centre for Human Rights.

#### 2017

# Argentina

Buenos Aires, 29 -31 May 2017 – International seminar on "Best practices in the electoral field" organised by the National Electoral Chamber and Council for International Relations of Argentina in co-operation with UNDP.

#### Mexico

Mexico City, 5-6 December 2017 – International seminar on "Financing of political life and electoral campaign" organised by the National Electoral Institute of Mexico.

#### Kazakhstan

Astana, 29-30 August 2017 – Conference on "Constitution and modernisation of Society and State", organised by the Constitutional Council of Kazakhstan.

#### USA

Washington, 13–14 December 2017 – 12th Implementation Meeting of the Declaration of Principles for International Election Observation, organised by the OAS.

#### 2018

#### Dominican Republic

Santo Domingo, 7-9 November 2018 – XIIIth Inter-American Meeting of Electoral Authorities, organised by the Department of Electoral Cooperation and Observation (DECO) of the Organization of American States (OAS).

#### **Egypt**

Cairo, 8-9 January 2018 – 1st International Conference organised by the Arab Union of Administrative Justice on the "Role of administrative courts in electoral disputes";

Cairo, 13-14 November 2018 – 2nd Forum of Electoral Management Bodies in Arab States, organised by the League of Arab States and the United Nations.

# Kazakhstan

Astana, 28-29 August 2018 - International conference "A Constitution: the embodiment of the values of the rule of law, civil society and the modern state", dedicated to the Day of the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the meeting of the Conference of Constitutional Control Organs of the Countries of New Democracy (CCCOCND).

#### Mexico

Cancun, 3 – 5 December 2018 –2nd Plenary Assembly of the Global Network on Electoral Justice, organised by the Electoral Tribunal of the Federal Judiciary of Mexico (TEPJF).

#### Morocco

Rabat, 5 July 2018 - Regional Conference on "Women in politics: how to progress towards equality?" organised by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE) and the Parliament of Morocco.

#### 2019

#### Tunisia

Tunis, on 24 – 25 January 2019 the President of the commission Mr Gianni Buquicchio and the Deputy Secretary of the Commission attended the ceremony of the 5th anniversary of the adoption of the Tunisian Constitution.

# Germany/Malaysia

Berlin, 2 April 2019 a representative of the Venice Commission presented the Venice Commission's work in the field of elections, referendums and political parties to a Delegation from the Electoral Reform Committee of Malaysia during their study visit to Germany 30 March - 4 April 2019.

#### Uzbekistan

Tashkent, on 25 April 2019 the Vice-President of the Venice Commission, Mr M. Frendo took part in the Tashkent Law Spring Forum organised by the Ministry of Justice of Uzbekistan.

#### Panama

Panama, 13 – 14 November 2019 the Venice Commission was invited to participate in the XIVth Inter- American Meeting of Electoral Management Bodies. The event was co-organised by the Electoral Tribunal of Panama and the Organisation of American States. Please see Chapter VI.

#### 2020

(On-line meetings)

#### Kazakhstan

On 24 April 2020 the President of the Venice Commission, Gianni Buquicchio, participated in a video conference on "Presidential government. Constitutional practice and political practices" organised by the Foundation of the 1st President of Kazakhstan, the Constitutional Council and the Ministry of Justice of Kazakhstan.

#### Mexico

On 30 April, Mr Josep Maria Castella Andreu, member in respect of Spain, Mr Rafael Rubio Nunez, substitute member in respect of Spain, Mr José Luis Vargas Valdez, substitute member in respect of Mexico, and the Deputy Secretary of the Commission, Ms Simona Granata-Menghini, participated in the Fifth Scientific Committee Meeting of the Global Network on Electoral Justice held online.

#### Argentina

On 7 May 2020 the President of the Commission participated in the virtual seminar on "Evaluation of the first mandatory presidential debate and its implementation", organised by the Cámara Nacional Electoral of Argentina.

#### Uzbekistan

On 12 August 2020 the President of the Venice Commission Mr Gianni Buquicchio participated at the opening of the Samarkand Human Rights Web Forum. The event was dedicated to the International Youth Day in the framework of the UN75 Initiative of the UN and was organised by the National Centre for Human Rights of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

#### 2021

(on-line meetings)

#### Indonesia

On 16 – 17 September 2021 The Venice Commission participated in the 2nd Conference of the Judicial Conference of Constitutional and Supreme Courts/Councils of the Member/Observer States of the Organisation of Islamic Cooperation (J-OIC).

#### Uzbekistan

The Vice-President of the Venice Commission, Mr P. Dimitrov, took part in the International conference "Uzbekistan: five years of reforms" organised on 5 October 2021 in Tashkent as a hybrid event. The conference focused on the reforms carried out by the Republic of Uzbekistan since the adoption of the Strategy of Actions 2017-2021.