

Strasbourg, 10 September 2012

Study No. 585 / 2010

CDL-REF(2012)025\* Engl. only

## EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW (VENICE COMMISSION)

## THE USE OF ADMINISTRATIVE RESOURCES DURING ELECTORAL CAMPAIGNS

COMPARATIVE TABLE

\*This document has been classified <u>restricted</u> on the date of issue. Unless the Venice Commission decides otherwise, it will be declassified a year after its issue according to the rules set up in Resolution CM/Res(2001)6 on access to Council of Europe documents.

## **Table of contents**

Albania	3
Algeria	3
Andorra	3
Armenia	3
Austria	3
Azerbaijan	3
Belgium	3
Bosnia and Herzegovina	
Bulgaria	
Canada	
Chile	
Croatia	
Cyprus	
Czech Republic	
Denmark	
Estonia	
Finland	
France	
Georgia	
Germany	
Greece	
Hungary	
Iceland	
Ireland	
Italy	
Korea	
Kyrgyzstan	
Latvia	
Liechtenstein	
Lithuania	6
Luxembourg	7
Malta	7
Morocco	7
Mexico	7
Moldova	7
Monaco	8
Montenegro	8
Netherlands	
Norway	8
Peru	
Poland	
Portugal	
Romania	
Serbia	
Slovakia	
Slovenia	
Spain	
Syeden	
Sweden	
"the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"	
Turkey	
Ukraine	
United Kingdom	10

Country	Electoral code / law	Other legal provisions	Other sources	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports (OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
Albania	No	No	-	Art.3.7- Electoral Code - It is prohibited to provide for the use of electoral subjects any means, funds or different materials that are public property, as well as human resources of the public administration Art.88 - Electoral Code - Prohibition of use of public resources in support of elective subjects	Art.132 - Electoral Code - equal space for public broadcasting	Parliamentary elections, June, 28, 2009 OSCE/ODIHR, p.2, 14 - allegations of misuse of administrative resource for campaign purposes PACE - Para.38 - misuse of administrative resources by some electoral candidates
Algeria						
Andorra	No	No	-	No provision		-
Armenia	Yes	Yes	-	<b>Art.22.1</b> - Election code - Prohibition of misusing administrative resources during electoral campaign by public authorities	Art.18, 20, 21, 22 - Election Code - Space on public broadcasting Art.26 - Law on political parties - Equal state assistance to parties	-
Austria	No	No	-	CODICES Constitutional Court 02/12/2000 Two public servants have conserved electoral files and they have modified them		-
Azerbaijan	Yes	Yes	-	<b>Art.55</b> - Election Code - Prohibition of misuse of administrative resources during campaign by public authorities	Art.77.1 - Election Code - Equal conditions of using public broadcasting for registered candidates	Presidential election, 15 October, 15, 2008 PACE - Para.30 - abuse of administrative resources
Belgium	Yes	Yes	-	<ul> <li>Art.182 - Electoral code - Prohibition of promising public jobs</li> <li>Art.187 - Electoral code and Art.227 - Order on the organisation of local and provincial elections - Prohibition for Publics charity to influence the vote of indigent</li> </ul>	Art.5.1 - Law on limitation and control of election expenses and the financing and open accounting of political parties [incurred for the elections to the federal] - 3 months before elections political parties and candidates and third parties who wish to make propaganda for political parties or candidates can not broadcast commercials to commercial radio, television and in movie theaters or premium text messages on the Internet	-
Bosnia and Herzegovina	No	No	_	No provision	Art.15.2 - Election Law - Space on public broadcasting	General elections, October, 01, 2006 OSCE/ODIHR, p.11 - abuse of administrative resources by some

Country	Electoral code / law	Other legal provisions	Other sources	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports (OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
						electoral contestants
Bulgaria	No	No	-	No provision	<b>Art.11</b> - Presidential election act - Equal space for public broadcasting	
Canada	No	No	-	<b>Art.92.2</b> - Electoral Law - Prohibition for candidate to accept gifts		Parliamentary elections, 23 January, 2006 OSCE - Federal funds misused in the referendum campaign in 1995
Chile						
Croatia	Yes	Yes	Yes	CODICES Constitutional Court 23/04/1997 Prohibition for representatives of local authorities to control electoral results in case of suspicion of vote rigging <b>Art.16.3</b> - The Political Activity and Electoral Campaign Financing Act -Prohibition of use funds from the central or local or regional budget, which are otherwise used by candidates as state or local officials in the performance of their duties <b>Art.16.4</b> - Prohibition of use the office premises, official vehicles and office equipment of governmental bodies and local and regional governmental units <b>Art.22.1</b> - Prohibition of financing of political parties, independent deputies, national minority deputies, independent members of the representative bodies of local and regional governmental units, independent slates and candidates by governmental bodies, public enterprises, legal persons vested with public authority etc <b>Art.22.2, 22.3</b> - Prohibition of donations anonymous donations and made through third parties	Political Activity and Electoral Campaign Financing Act 2011 (apply to all elections) <b>Art.12.2</b> - Political parties, independent slates and candidates are obliged to publicly disclose the amount of the price of media advertising <b>Art.12.4</b> - Obligation for companies providing media advertising services for election campaign to deliver their advertising rates to the State Elections Commission <b>Art.36.8</b> - Electronic Media Act - Coverage of all contestants under the equal conditions <b>Art.29 and 30</b> - Election of Representatives to the Croatian Parliament Act and Rules of Procedure for Electronic Media with National Concession in the Republic of Croatia during the Election Campaign - Coverage of all election contestants on an equal basis <b>Art.25</b> - Act on the Election of Municipal Perfects, Mayors, County Perfects and the Mayor of the City of Zagreb and <b>Art 23</b> - Act on Election of Members to Representative Bodies of Units of Local and Regional Self- Government - Coverage of all contestants under the equal conditions <b>Art.14</b> - Act on the Election of the President of the Republic of Croatia - Equal space on public broadcasting for all candidates	Parliamentary elections 2011, OSCE/DIHR, footnote 21 on page 10 - A potential misuse of administrative resources concerning an advertising discount
Cyprus	No	No	-			-

- 4 -

Country	Electoral code / law	Other legal provisions	Other sources	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports (OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
Czech Republic	No	No	-	In 2011 the Constitutional Court rejected the complaint of several political parties against a calculated change of electoral districts in Prague(Decision 52/10 - 29 March 2011). The Court stated that such a calculated change was not necessarily unlawful CODICES Constitutional Court 26/01/2005 Where a public authority defamed a candidate in an election campaign this meant that the election could not be presented as "honest"	Art.16.4 - Law on elections to the Parliament and Art.59.4 – Law on the Elections to the European Parliament - Equal space on public broadcasting for registered candidates	-
Denmark	No	No	-			-
Estonia	No	No	-	No provision		-
Finland	No	No	-	Art.185 - Electoral Act Breach of official duty		-
France				L52-8 - Election Code Prohibition to receive help from foreign state L106 - Election Code Prohibition to promise public jobs		
Georgia	Yes	Yes	Yes	Art.48 and Art.49 (as of December 27, 2011) - The Organic Law of Georgia Unified Election Code - Prohibition of misuse the administrative resources during the campaign by public authorities CEC - Explanatory note on some of provisions of the administrative resources (building, communications means, transporting means)	Art.50 and 51 (as of December 27, 2011) - Election Code - Space on broadcasting	Parliamentary elections, May, 21, 2008 OSCE/ODIHR, p.7 - Opposition alleging one electoral contestant misusing administrative resources PACE, Point 36 - Misuse of administrative resources by authorities
Germany	No	Yes	Yes	Federal Constitutional Court BVerfGE 44, 125 (March 1976) Office-holders are required to remain neutral in electoral campaigns as long as they act in the exercise of their duties	Art.5 - Political Parties Act - Principle of "gradual equality", which inter alia takes into account parties' past electoral performance, with regard to campaign - Related entitlements of parties	Parliamentary election of 27 September 2009, OSCE/ODIHR Election Assessment Mission; no objections regarding the use of administrative resources
Greece	Yes	Yes	Yes	Presidential decree 26/2012 Art. 12-119 contain special penal provisions concerning crimes committed in connection with the election of members of the Parliament. These include: a) The use of or the threat of use of violence against a voter and the commission of	Art.45.1 - Presidential Decree 26/2012 - Obligation for public and private radio and television stations to broadcast messages of political parties and coalitions Art.45.2 - Equal space on public broadcasting for political parties and coalitions	-

Country	Electoral code / law	Other legal provisions	Other sources	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports (OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
		provisions	Sources	a fraud against a voter, the infringement of the secrecy of voting, bribery towards a voter or from a voter during the pre-election period and until the end of voting, the disturbance of the voting procedure through various means, special electoral crimes of voters, special electoral crimes of public organs and other electoral crimes More detailed provisions on administrative resources may be found in Law 3023/2002	Art. 47.1 - Candidates for the Parliament are prohibited from presenting any messages by means of public and private radio and television stations. Broadcasting any kind of shows that are presented, directly or indirectly, by candidate MP's is also prohibited during the pre-election period Art.47.2 - Limit to appearance of a candidate MP on radio or television station Art.44 - Decree 26/2012 - Equal space on public broadcasting for political parties and coalitions	
Hungary	No	No	-	No provision		-
Iceland	No	No	-	Art.124 - Electoral Act Breach of official duty Art.126 - Electoral Act prohibition for civil servants to infringe the elections rules		-
Ireland	No	No	-	Art.144 - Electoral Act - prohibition for a returning officer to promote a political party		-
Italy	No	No	-	No provision		-
Korea	Yes	N/P	N/P	Public Official Election Act <b>Art.9</b> - Responsibilities of public officials for neutrality in election <b>Art.85</b> - Prohibition for public servants to participate in election campaign <b>Art.86</b> - Prohibition for public servants from acts of having effects on election	Public Official Election Act <b>Art.8</b> - Responsibilities of mass-media for fair election <b>Art.70</b> - Restriction on broadcast advertisement of electoral candidate <b>Art.137</b> - Restriction on mass-media advertisement of party platform and policies	
Kyrgyzstan	Yes	No	-	Art.30.13 - Electoral Code - Prohibition of use of administrative resources by public servants	Art.32 - Electoral Code - Space on public broadcasting	Presidential elections, July, 23, 2009 OSCE/ODIHR, p.1 - Misuse of administrative resources in support of the incumbent President
Latvia	No	No	-	No provision		-
Liechtenstein	No	No	-			-
Lithuania	No	No	-	Art.54 - Law on Elections to the Seimas, Art.47 - Law on Presidential Elections, Art.52 - Law on Elections to the European Parliament,	Art.51.1 - Law on Elections to the Seimas, Art.46.1 - Law on Presidential Elections, Art.50.1 - Law on Elections to the European	-

Country	Electoral code / law	Other legal provisions	Other sources	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports (OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
				Art.51 - Law on elections to Municipal Councils - Prohibition to Take Advantage of one's Official Position to Conduct Election Campaign Art.51.9 - Law on Elections to the Seimas, Art.46.8 - Law on Presidential Elections, Art.50.8 - Law on Elections to the European Parliament, Art.48.10 - Law on elections to Municipal Councils- Prohibition to install and communicate outdoor political advertising on the buildings occupied by state administration and other stat establishments, inside or outside the vehicles belonging to state or municipal enterprises etc	Parliament, Art.48.1 - Law on elections to Municipal Councils - Equal space for public broadcasting free of charge Art.46 - Law on Elections to the Seimas, Art.41 - Law on Presidential Elections, Art.45 - Law on Elections to the European Parliament, Art.43 - Law on elections to Municipal Councils - Equal right to speak at voters' meetings or any other meetings, gatherings, conferences as well as through the state mass media, and to announce their respective election programmes	
Luxembourg	No	No	-	Art.95 and 96 - Electoral Law - Prohibition to receive or give gifts		-
Malta	No	No	-	No provision		-
Morocco						
Mexico	Yes	Yes	Yes	<ul> <li>Art.134 - Constitution - Obligation to administer public resources effectively, efficiently, transparently and according to their purpose.</li> <li>Art.77.2.b - Electoral Code- Prohibition of administrative entities to finance political parties or candidates</li> <li>Art.407.3 - Criminal Code - Prohibition and Sanction of Public Officials to use administrative resources to finance political parties and candidates</li> </ul>	Art.41.3 - Constitution- Access of political parties to mass media. Arts 48,49,50,51 - Electoral Code - Access to radio and television and surveillance by Federal Electoral Institute of State - reserved time Art.59bis - Federal Law on Radio and Television - Obligation to broadcasters to reserve 48 minutes to the Federal Electoral Institute in the Electoral Process Art.64 - Obligation of Broadcasters to comply with what is established in the Electoral Code	
Moldova	Yes <sup>1</sup>	Yes	-	Electoral Code <b>Art.13</b> - Obligation for persons which hold position of high responsibility to suspend its activity in the position they hold since their registration as candidates <b>Art.46</b> - Equal right for electoral contestants in the use of mass media and equal opportunities for technical, material and financial support of the electoral campaign <b>Art.47</b> - Prohibition to use administrative	Art.64 - Electoral Code - Equal and non- discriminatory access to mass media Broadcasting Code Art.7 - Broadcasting Code - Obligation of broadcasters to reflect electoral campaigns in truthful, balanced and impartial manner	Early Parliamentary Elections, July, 29, 2009 OSCE/ODIHR p.9, 14 and PACE - Point 46 - Misuse of administrative resources

Country	Electoral code / law	Other legal provisions	Other sources	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports (OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
				resources and equal access to public goods or services		
Monaco	No	No	-	Art.61 - Electoral Law - Prohibition to use billboards for thanking voters Art.69 - Electoral Law - Prohibition to promise public jobs		-
Montenegro	No	Yes	-	<ul> <li>Art.22 - Law on election of the president - prohibition of the candidate for President to use administrative resources during the electoral campaign</li> <li>Art.40 - Law on election of the Mayor - penal provision incriminating individuals to provide illegal access of administrative resources to electoral contestants</li> </ul>		-
Netherlands	No	No	-	No provision		-
Norway	No	No	-			-
Peru						
Poland	No	No	-		Art.83.a - Law on election of the President - Equal space for public broadcasting	
Portugal	Yes	No	-	Art.57 - Electoral Act of Parliament - Prohibition on intervention bodies was the autirotes local public services directly or indirectly to a campaign	Art.153 - Electoral Law - Prohibition of misuse of public function for campaigning purposes	
Romania	No	No	-	No provision	Art.16 - Law on the election of the President - space on public broadcasting	
Russian Federation	No	No	-	Art.46 - Law on Elections of Deputies of the State Duma of the Russian Federation - a ban on the use of the benefits office or official position during the election campaign	Art.51, 53 - Law on election of the President - Equal space for public broadcasting	Presidential elections, March, 14, 2004 OSCE/ODIHR, p.10 - Credible allegations of misuse of administrative resources OSCE/ODIHR, p.15 - Impartiality of public broadcasters Presidential election, March, 2, 2008 PACE, Point 17 - Wide scale abuse of administrative resources for an electoral contestant

Country	Electoral code / law	Other legal provisions	Other sources	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports (OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
San Marino		•				
Serbia	No	No	-	No provision		-
Slovakia	No	No	-	No provision	Art.15 - Presidential Election Code - Equal access to mass-media Section 24.13 - Act on Election to the National Council - Equality on broadcasting of political advertisements and placing of election posters	-
Slovenia	No	No	-	No provision		-
Spain	Yes	Yes	-	Organic General Electoral Law Art.52 and 144.2 - Prohibition for members of the Armed Forces, Police (of the State, Autonomous Communities or Municipalities) judges, prosecutors and members of the election commissions to participate at electoral campaign Art.135-153 - Offences committed by public servants during election campaign, such as misconduct in public office and falsehood. Art.128.1 - Ban on public funds other than the election subsidies established in the Law Art.35 - Electoral Law: Definition public servants and public acts which are affected by prohibitions in the electoral law Art.139 - Electoral Law: Infractions committed by public servants during electoral campaign Art.140 - Electoral Law: publics servants misusing about their position to influence electoral campaign Art 153.1 - Electoral Law fine for public servants		-
Sweden	No	No	-			-
Switzerland	No	No	-	No provision		-
"the former Yugoslav Republic of	Yes	Yes	Yes	<b>Art.78.1,2</b> - Electoral Code - Election posters could be placed on an equal basis, free of charge at the space designed by the	Art.75 - Election Code - Equal space on public broadcasting Art.6 - Rulebook for equal Access to the	OSCE/ODIHR, Presidential and municipal elections, March, 22, and April, 05, 2009, p.13 - Claims made

Country	Electoral	Other legal	Other	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports
	code / law	provisions	sources			(OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
Macedonia"			sources	municipalities and the town of Skopje. The municipalities and Skopje are obligated to mark the authorised place for each submitter of candidate list <b>Art.82</b> - Pre-election public meetings cannot be held in military buildings, religious objects, hospitals, institutions for elderly persons, kinder-gardens and other public institutions. It can be held, if there is no other object, but only upon permission of the authorised organ of the institution and only under equal treatment of all organisers of election campaign <b>Art.82.4</b> - Prohibition to use the rooms, equipment or other kind of state or local means. Space of mentioned objects could be used if there is no other adequate space, but only under same conditions for all campaign organisers <b>Art.83.1</b> - Election campaign could not be financed by budget resources, with exception of those determined by Article 86.2, which guarantee compensation of election costs from the budget at last for three months after receiving the financial reports on party election spending, based on State Election Commission	Media Presentation during the Election Campaign- Broadcasters shall cover elections in a fair, balanced, and impartial manner. They must also provide equitable access. The coverage of electoral contestants is proportional to the number of electoral districts in which the contestant is running	by parties on misuse of resources by the Government; p.12, report of Min. of Interior on misuse of official position and authority OSCE/ODIHR Final Report on Early Parliamentary Elections from 5 June 2011stated misuse of state resources for campaign purposes, which detracted from the overall quality of the election process(Pag.2). It also says that " requirements that municipalities designate free space for placement of posters on an equal basis were inconsistently applied". Further, it is said that: " there were instances when the Minister of Internal Affairs , who was also a leading VMRO- DPMNE candidate, used the authority of her office for campaign purposes. The results of OSCE/ODIHR EOM media monitoring showed that MTV -1 coverage of the campaign favoured the governing parties, p.14
				Report		
Turkey	Yes	No	-	Art.63, 64, 65 - Law on Basic Provisions on Elections and Voter Registers - prohibition of misuse of administrative resources during the electoral campaign by public authorities		-
Ukraine	No	Yes	-	Art.61.4 and Art.74.1, 21 - Law of Ukraine on elections of people's deputies of Ukraine - Prohibition of misuse of administrative resources during campaign by public authorities	Art.71 - Law of Ukraine on elections of people's deputies of Ukraine -equal access to mass-media	OSCE/ODIHR, PACE - Presidential Election, 17 January and 7 February 2010, p.2, 14 - Reported misuse of administrative resources by some candidates
United Kingdom	No	No	-	Art.63 of Keeling Schedule for the Representation of the People Act 1983 as amended by the Electoral Administration Act 2006 Breach of official duty Art.101 of Keeling Schedule for the Representation of the People		-

Country	Electoral code / law	Other legal provisions	Other sources	Provisions on administrative resources	Provisions on mass-media	EOMs reports (OSCE/ODIHR, PACE) *
				Act 1983 as amended by the Electoral Administration Act 2006 no hiring of public vehicles to convey voters		

\* Reports on the latest Election Observation Missions conducted by OSCE/ODIHR and PACE, as of July, 02, 2010