



Strasbourg, 16 October 2016

CDL-REF(2016)062

Opinion No. 868 / 2016

Engl.Only

EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW
(VENICE COMMISSION)

ALBANIA

LAW¹

**ON THE TRANSITIONAL RE-EVALUATION
OF JUDGES AND PROSECUTORS**

¹ Translation provided by the Albanian authorities



REPUBLIKA E SHQIPËRIË

LAW no.84/2016

ON

***THE TRANSITIONAL RE-EVALUATION OF JUDGES AND PROSECUTORS IN THE
REPUBLIC OF ALBANIA***

Based on articles 81, 83 paragraph 1, and 179/b paragraph 10 of the Constitution, upon the proposal of one fifth of the members of the Assembly of the Republic of Albania,

D E C I D E D:

**CHAPTER I
GENERAL PROVISIONS**

**Article 1
Purpose**

The purpose of this law is to determine specific rules for the transitional re-evaluation of all assessees, in order to re-establish the proper function of rule of law and true independence of the judicial system, as well as the public trust and confidence in these institutions, according to the provisions of article 179/b of the Constitution.

**Article 2
Scope**

This law provides for:

1. the organization of the re-evaluation process in particular for all judges and prosecutors;
2. the methodology, procedure and standards of the re-evaluation process;
3. the organization and functioning of the re-evaluation institutions,
4. the role of the International Monitoring Operation, the other state organs, and of the public in the re-evaluation process;

Article 3 Definitions

For the purpose of this law, following terms shall have these meanings²:

1. "Day" implies calendar days, which are calculated according to the rules provided in article 56 of the Code of Administrative Procedure;
2. "Legal document" for the purpose of the proficiency assessment means any document prepared by the assessee in the course of the exercise of the professional duty, specifically a court decision, reports, indictments, lawsuits, legal opinions, and other acts that prove the person's professional capacities.
3. "HIDAACI" means the High Inspectorate for the Declaration and Audit of Assets and Conflict of Interest, organized and functioning according to Law "On declaration and audit of assets, financial obligations of elected persons and certain public officials".
4. "Institutions" shall imply the Commissions, the Appeal Chamber and Public Commissioners;
5. "Commission" means the Independent Qualification Commission provided in Art.179/b paragraph 5 of the Constitution.
6. "Inappropriate contact" shall mean even one meeting, telecommunication, or any other type of wilful contact which is not in compliance with the assumption of office, regardless whether a business as defined in no.11 of this article or any other relation is established for the assessee.
7. "Appeal Chamber" means the Specialized Chamber of the Constitutional Court provided in Art.179/b paragraph 5 of the Constitution.
8. "Organized crime, traffic and corruption" includes criminal charges provided in article 75/a of the Criminal Procedure Code which fall under the competences of the serious crime court and any other court which may substitute it in the exercise of these competences.
9. "Business relations" shall be any professional or commercial relationship, bearing a connection to the activities carried out by the entities of this law and their clients, which, at the moment of its establishment, is considered to be a sustainable relation or not a sustainable relation under the Law no "On prevention of money laundering and financing of terrorism";
10. "Proficiency assessment body" means the Inspectorate of the High Council of Justice organized and functioning according to Law no.8811/2001 "On organization and function of High Council of Justice", the relevant structure of the General Prosecution Office or the institutions that perform the professional evaluation according to the law;
11. "Asset" means all movable and immovable properties in Albania or abroad, including those provided by art. 4 of the Law "On the declaration and audit of assets, financial

² Alphabetical order according to the Albanian alphabet

obligations of elected persons and certain public officials”, which are in possession or use of the assessee;

12. “Re-evaluation period” means the period of the work of an assessee during which their ethical and professional performance is assessed according to this law;
13. “Related Persons” shall mean the circle of persons related to the assessee, commissioner, public commissioner or judge, consisting of the spouse, cohabitant, adult and minor child as well as any other person mentioned in the family certificate as provided by the office for civil registry to assessees, commissioners, public commissioners or judges for the period of re-evaluation.
14. “Other related persons” shall mean any natural or legal person who turns out to have or to have had ties of interest with the assessee, commissioner, public commissioner or judge, resulting from any property/asset interest or any business relation.
15. “Person involved in organized crime” shall mean any person that has been convicted or part of a criminal trial, whether in Albania or outside the territory of the Republic of Albania, on one of the criminal offences provided in paragraph 1 of Article 3 of the Law no. 10192, dated 3.12.2009 “Preventing and striking at organized crime, corruption and trafficking through preventive measures against assets”, as amended, except the case when he/she was declared not guilty by a final court decision. One shall be as involved in organized crime in the following circumstances too: a) A criminal case have been dismissed by the prosecuting organ because of the death of the person, or in cases when it was impossible to have him/her arrested or in the position of the defendant. b) he/she have been found not guilty by the court because the criminal offence was committed from a person that was impossible to have him/her arrested or in the position of the defendant;
16. “Assessee” means all persons re-evaluated as mentioned in Art.179/b of the Constitution of Republic of Albania.
17. The wording “has not held a political post in the public administration” shall mean he or she has not have been member of the Assembly, prime minister, deputy prime minister, minister, deputy minister or official employee in the cabinet of the President of the Republic, Speak of the Assembly, Prime minister, Deputy prime minister, or minister assuming the office of the cabinet director, advisor, assistant, spokesperson or personal secretary to the head of the cabinet³.
18. The wording “has not held a leadership position in a political party” means that he or she has not been member of steering organs in a political party according to the provisions of the statute of the party.
19. “Legitimate” income shall be considered the incomes of the assessee of the and his or her related persons according to the source of income provided in law “On tax income”;

³ Point 3, letter j) (pg.1- 13)

20. "Trust" is a fiduciary agreement where the property is held by the trustee for the account of the beneficiary, according to Article 2/19 of the Law 'On prevention of money laundering and financing the terrorism' as well as according to foreign legislation;
21. "International observers" mean persons assigned by the International Monitoring Operation and notified in accordance with article B of the Annex of the Constitution.

Article 4 **The object and principles of re-evaluation**

1. The re-evaluation process shall be carried out in three components:
 - (a) asset assessment,
 - (b) background assessment, and
 - (c) proficiency assessment.
2. The Commission and the Appeal Chamber are the institutions which decide on the final evaluation of the assessee. The decision shall be based on one or several components or based on an overall evaluation of all three components, and the overall assessment of the proceedings.
3. The re-evaluation process shall start automatically with the entry of this law into force. The re-evaluation institution shall take the decisions as quickly as possible, once a case is ready to be decided.
4. Cases on judges at the Constitutional Court, at the High Court and the General Prosecutor shall be treated as a matter of priority in time by the re-evaluation institutions.
5. The Commission and Appeal Chamber shall exercise their duties as independent and impartial institutions based on the principles of equality before the law, constitutionality and lawfulness, proportionality and other principles which guarantee the rights of assessees for a due legal process.
6. If it is the case, the re-evaluation institutions may apply also the procedures provided in the Code of Administrative Procedures, or Law "On the organization and functioning of administrative courts and adjudication of administrative disputes", if not provided differently in the Constitution or by this law.
7. The right to information provided for in Law "On the right for information" may be limited by complying with the principle of proportionality if giving the information causes an evident and grave damage to the administration of the re-evaluation process.

CHAPTER II **INSTITUTIONS**

Article 5 **Re-evaluation institutions**

1. The re-evaluation process of all assesses according to this law shall be carried out by the Commission, the Appeal Chamber and the Public Commissioner in collaboration with international observers.
2. The Appeal Chamber shall reviews appeals against decisions of the Commission.

3. The Appeal Chamber during the mandate of 9 years, in compliance with the Constitution, law "On organization and functioning of Constitutional Court", and the legislation that regulated the issues of governance of the justice system, shall have the jurisdiction to adjudicate:

- a) disciplinary misconducts of Constitutional Court judges, the members of High Judicial Council, the High Prosecutorial Council, the Prosecutor General, and the High Justice Inspector;
- b) appeals against decisions of the High Judicial Council, High Prosecutorial Council as well as High Justice Inspector, imposing disciplinary sanctions respectively against judges, prosecutors and other inspectors.

Article 6

Criteria on selection of members of the re-evaluation institutions

1. Member of the Commission and Appeal Chamber shall be appointed the Albanian citizen who fulfils the following conditions:

- a) has completed the second level of university law studies with the degree 'master in science' in Albania or law studies abroad and has obtained an equivalent degree according to the rules on equivalencing diplomas foreseen in the law;
- b) a professional experience of not less than 15 years as judge, prosecutors, advocate, professor of law, civil service employee at senior level or another recognised activity in the field of administrative law or in other fields of law;
- c) a high score for his or her professional and ethical skills and moral integrity, as long as he or she has been subject to previous evaluation;
- ç) has not held a political post in the public administration or a leadership position in a political party for the last 10 years;
- d) is not under criminal investigation and has not criminal record in connection with the commission of a crime, a criminal misdemeanour deliberately or has not been not subject of the limitations provided in the law on guarantee of the integrity of the elected, appointed persons or who exercise public functions;
- dh) has not been dismissed for disciplinary reasons or does not have any disciplinary measure in force under the law at the time of application;
- e) has not been a member, collaborator or favoured by the State Security before 1990 and has not been a collaborator in the meaning Law no.45/2015 "On the right of information to the documents of the former security service of the Popular Socialistic Republic of Albania;
- ë) has not been judge, prosecutor, legal advisor or legal assistant during the last two years prior to their nomination;
- f) has not been member of the High Level Experts of the ad hoc committee for the reform in the justice system, or expert appointed by the political parties and the Ministry of Justice;
- g) should not be older than 65 years;
- gj) very good knowledge of English language;

2. Compliance of the above mentioned criteria shall be taken into consideration in particular based on the dates mentioned above:

- a) academic grade in the field of law;

- b) special experience of the candidate in a certain field of law;
 - c) seniority in the profession;
 - ç) study experience and professional experience abroad;
 - d) having an average mark of not less than 8 in case it has completed the second level of university law studies with the degree 'master in science' in Albania or law studies abroad and has obtained an equivalent degree according to the rules on equivalent diplomas foreseen in the law;
3. Conditions and criteria provided in paragraph 1 of this article apply accordingly for the appointment of a Public Commissioner, with the exception of the years of experience which should be not less than 10 years.

Article 7

Presentation and review of applications for the positions of members of the re-evaluation institutions

1. The President of the Republic shall announce immediately the vacancies for positions of all members of the institutions on its website and in two newspapers of the highest circulation in the country. The call for application shall contain the deadline when the candidates have to submit the expression of interest, the post address where they shall be submitted and the accompanying documents.
2. The deadline for the submission of the expression of interests for application and the accompanying documents shall be 15 days.
3. The expression of interest of the candidates shall be registered in the protocol register of the President of the Republic. The applicant shall obtain a receipt with an application number, date and list of the filed documents.
4. The candidate, in its request refers to the vacancy position for which he or she is applying. If no position is mentioned the application is considered for all vacancies. Attached to the request, the candidate files two copies of the following documents:
 - a) Curriculum Vitae including contact details, official email and postal address;
 - b) Notarized copy of the diploma or equivalent copy issued by the institutions;
 - c) Notarised or equivalent copy of the documents issued by the institutions which attest conditions provided in Article 6 of this Law in notarized form;
 - ç) Signed document providing for admitting the limitation by the applicant of his right to privacy in telecommunications for the duration of the mandate as a member of the institutions, in accordance with Annex no.1 of this law;
5. Within seven days from the deadline for the submission of applications, after consultation with the International Monitoring Operation, the President of the Republik shall compile a candidate list of applicants who meet the formal criteria for each position and a separate list of applicants who do not meet the formal criteria. This process is monitored by the International Monitoring Operation, which shall have full access to all application documents.
6. The President of the Republic, immediately forwards to the International Monitoring Operation the prepared lists as provided in paragraph 5 of this article and all the individual files of the candidates and publishes the full list of candidates in the official website, categorized according to the position. In case the President of the Republic does not complete the process within 45 days from entry into force of the Annex of the Constitution, this competence shall be carried out by the Ombudsperson.

7. A panel of at least three representatives of the International Monitoring Operation shall assess the candidates, in accordance with the law. Not later than 14 days from the day of submission of the two lists by the President, the panel shall on the basis of its reasoned assessment submit its recommendations concerning the qualification and selection of the candidates to the President, who then forwards them to the Parliament. If the President cannot exercise his competences within five days, the competence shall revert to the Ombudsperson.

Article 8

Parliamentary ad hoc committee for the verification of candidate

1. Within three days of receiving the list of applicants who meet the formal criteria, the list of applicants who do not meet the formal criteria and the list of International Monitoring Operation recommendations, the Assembly shall approve the establishment and composition of an ad hoc committee with six members consisting of equal representatives from the majority and opposition as well as the parliamentary procedures for the functioning of the committees and the conduct of the voting process according to this article and article 9 of this law.

2. The Speaker of the Assembly within the day of submission of the lists provided in paragraph 1 of this article notifies the date and time of the meeting of the plenary session for the establishment and the composition of the candidates' evaluating ad hoc Committee. In this notice, the Speaker of the Assembly requires to the parliamentary groups of the parliamentary majority and the minority to submit within the next day- starting from the day of the notice, their proposals for the members composition of the this ad hoc committee. The Speaker of the Assembly, within the next day starting from the day of establishment of the ad hoc committee, forwards to all its members the documents of all candidates.

3. The committee, after completion of the hearings with the candidates decides:

- a) with at least four votes of its members to move a candidate from the list of those who do not meet formal criteria to the list of those who do.
- b) with at least five votes move an applicant from the International Monitoring Operation's recommendations list to the candidate list for voting.

4. The list for voting includes the candidates who meet the formal criteria without those who have been recommended by the International Monitoring Operation and who have not been approved upon decision of the ad hoc committee according to paragraph 3 of this article.

5. Within ten days of its establishment, the ad hoc committee shall forward the list prepared according to paragraph 4 of this article, to the ad hoc committees for selection. The other two lists shall not be forwarded for voting.

6. The General Secretary of the Assembly takes the necessary measures for establishing the conditions for the exercise of the work activity of the ad hoc committee.

7. The ad hoc committee functions based on the provisions of this law and, as far as it is possible based on the Regulation of the Assembly.

Article 9

Parliamentary ad hoc committees for the selection of the candidates

1. Within ten days of receiving the list of candidates, who meet the formal criteria, the list of applicants who do not meet the formal criteria and the list of International Monitoring

Operation recommendations, the Assembly shall approve the establishment and composition of two ad hoc committees for selection consisting:

a) 12 members, proposed 6 proposed from the parliamentary groups of majority and 6 proposed from the parliamentary groups of minority.

b) 6 members, 3 proposed from the parliamentary groups of majority and 3 proposed from the parliamentary groups of minority.

2. The Speaker of the Assembly, within 3 days from the submission provided in paragraph 1 of this article notifies the date and time of the meeting of the plenary session for the establishment and the composition of the two ad hoc committees. In this notice, the Speaker of the Assembly requires to the parliamentary groups of the parliamentary majority and the minority to submit within two days -starting from the day of the notice, their proposals for the composition of these ad hoc committees.

3. A member of the Assembly may be member of only one of the ad hoc selecting committees. The members of the ad hoc verification committee can be member of one of the ad hoc selecting committees.

4. Within 30 days of its establishment the ad hoc committee shall conduct the procedure for the voting of the candidates. In the first meeting of each ad hoc selecting committee, shall be approved the calendar for the hearings with the candidates and the General Secretary shall be in charge of notifying the candidates.

5. The General Secretary of the Assembly takes the necessary measures for establishing the conditions for the exercise of the work activity of the ad hoc selecting committees.

6. The ad hoc committee functions based on the provisions of this law and, as far as it is possible based on the Regulation of the Assembly.

Article 10

Voting process of the parliamentary ad hoc selecting committees

1. The voting process is done through an electronic system which enables the secret voting where each member votes for one candidate.

2. Each member of the six member committee shall select from the candidate list for voting a candidate for judges of the Appeal Chamber, without debate and in a secret and electronic vote where one member may elect one candidate.

3. The members of the ad hoc committee participate in all voting rounds until the final selection of the 6 judges of the Appeal Chamber. The electronic system enables the implementation of this voting process by generating an electronic report contacting the results of the voting, which guarantee's the impossibility of identifying the vote.

4. Every member of the ad hoc committee is obliged to vote. If one of the members does not vote, the voting process shall be repeated one time. In case also during the two other voting rounds one of the members does not vote, the Speaker of the Assembly is notified for the initiation of the procedures for substituting the member of the ad hoc committee who has not voted. The Assembly appoints a new member in respect of the parliamentary group membership within 3 days.

5. The ad hoc committee then selects the seventh judge from the remaining candidates on the candidate list for voting, using a simple, secret electronic vote where the candidate with the most votes is selected. In case of a tie, a manual lot shall be used between the

candidates who received the highest number of votes. The procedures for drawing the lot are reflected in the minutes which are signed by all members of the ad hoc committee.

6. The procedure foreseen in paragraph 5 of this article shall apply also for the selection of the two substitute members for the position of judge at the Appeal Chamber.

7. Each member of the 12 member committee shall select, from the candidate list for voting, a candidate for commissioner, without debate and in a secret and electronic vote where one member may elect one candidate. The rules foreseen in paragraph 3 and 4 of this article apply also during the voting procedure of the ad hoc selection committee with 12 members. The procedures foreseen in paragraph 5 and 6 of this article shall apply also for the selection of the two substitute members for commissioners at the Commission.

8. The ad hoc selecting committee of 12 members shall then select two candidates from the candidate list for voting for public commissioner, using a simple vote where the two candidates with the most votes are selected. The procedure provided in paragraph 5 of this article applies also for the selection of the two Public Commissioners and the two substitute candidates for Public Commissioner.

9. If a candidate has applied for more than one position, and has been selected in one of the previously voted positions selected in order, his/her name is automatically removed from the electronic system from the lists of candidates for voting which will be voted later on.

10. The General Secretary of the Assembly, within two days from the termination of the voting process, prepares a final list of the selected candidates for commissioner, judge and public commissioner. The list, along with the voting results produced by the electronic system shall be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly, who immediately notifies the date and time of the meeting of the plenary session and forwards to the members of the Assembly the list.

Article 11

Voting in the plenary session

1. Within 10 days, the Assembly approves the list of candidates as a block with 3/5 of votes of all members.

2. If the Assembly does not approve the list of candidates as a block under paragraph 1 of this article, the Speaker of the Assembly shall return it to the ad hoc selecting committees to repeat the selection process and to provide a second list within 10 days. The ad hoc selecting committees shall apply the same rules provided in article 10 of this law.

3. The Assembly, within 10 days after second list is submitted, can reject the list as a block by 2/3 votes of all its members. If the list is not rejected, the selected candidates are considered elected.

4. The decision of the Assembly to approve the list of selected candidates is published in the next publishing of the Official Gazette.

5. If the list is rejected by the Assembly under paragraph 3 of this article, the organs foreseen in this law shall be in charge to initiate the procedures for filling the vacancies in accordance with the procedures foreseen in the Constitution and this law.

**CHAPTER III
ORGANIZATION AND FUNCTIONING OF INSTITUTIONS**

**Article 12
President of the Commission and Appeal Chamber**

1. The activity of the Commission is chaired by its President and in his or her absence, by the oldest member in age, assigned by him or her, except for the cases where the law provides differently.
2. The President of the Commission shall be elected upon secret voting, upon the majority of all members, for a period of 3 years without the right to re-election.
3. The meeting for the election of the President shall be chaired by the oldest member in age. Where more than one candidate is running and during the voting none of them took the foreseen number of votes, a new voting occurs and, following this, voting shall occur among the candidates having obtained the highest number of votes. Where none of the candidates have received the majority of the votes or the votes are divided equally, the President shall be appointed by lot, organized by the International Monitoring Operation.
4. Paragraph 1, 2 and 3 of this article shall apply accordingly for the President of the Appeal Chamber.

**Article 13
Competences of the President of the Commission and Appeal Chamber**

1. The President shall have the competences as follows:
 - a) Prepares, convenes and leads the meeting of the members,
 - b) Represents the Commission or Appeal Chamber to the relations with third parties,
 - c) Ensures the management of the institution;
 - ç) Issues and signs the other acts of the Commission or Appeal Chamber, with the exception of the decisions;
 - d) chairs the lot as provided in article 14, 15, and 18 paragraph 4 of this law.
2. The provisions of paragraph 1 of this article shall apply accordingly for the President of the Appeal Chamber.

**Article 14
Organization of the Commission**

1. The Commission shall be organised in four adjudication panels, composed of 3 members each elected by lot. Substitute members assigned by lot.
2. The distribution of the cases to the panel and the assignment of the rapporteur is done by lot.
3. The panel is led by a chairperson, who is elected among the respective members. In his or her absence, the panel is chaired by the oldest member by age.
4. Tasks of the Chairperson of the panel are:
 - a) to call and to chair the internal meetings and oral hearings.
 - b) to coordinate the work and to ensure in a reasonable time the written decision.
5. The rapporteur of the case shall:
 - a) prepare the file which shall be discussed by the panel;

- b) undertake all procedures for ensuring the evidences which are deemed necessary for the decision making process of the panel;
- c) undertake all necessary steps for drafting the documentation and finalization of the case;
- ç) seek additional information in accordance with the provisions of this law;
- d) proposes a reasoned decision;

Article 15

Organization of the Appeal Chamber

1. The Commission shall be organised in adjudicating panels composed of 5 members, each elected by lot for each case.
2. The Chairperson of the panel and the rapporteur are elected by lot.
3. The Chairperson of the panel and the rapporteur shall carry out the tasks as provided in paragraph 4 and 5 of article 14 of this law.

Article 16

Disciplinary liability of members of the re-evaluation institutions

The member of the re-evaluation institutions shall be disciplinary liability, specifically for the following reasons:

1. failure to submit the resignation from the review of the case, if it exists reasonable doubts of cases of incompatibility for the exercise of his or her function, according to the legislation in force and if the member is aware of such circumstances;
2. behaviours, acts and other actions of the judge, deriving unfair profits or damages for parties to proceedings;
3. failure of the member to inform the Court President or competent authorities according to law, regarding the interventions or exercise of other forms of improper influence by lawyers, political senior officials, public senior officials and other entities;
4. interference or any other improper influence to exercise the duty of another member;
5. unjustified, intentional or repeated non-performance of his or her respective functions;
6. filing a request for resignation and accomplishment of those actions which are not based on grounds provided in law or are done intentionally to derive unfair profits for the litigants and third parties, or with a view of preventing the judge from the legal obligation to examine the case or aiming at its potential review by other judges, or when the resignation has taken place lately, regardless of being aware of the fact for which he or she resigns;
7. repeated or serious breach of the rules of solemnity and rules of conduct in relations with litigants and with the members and personnel of the re-evaluation institutions;
8. repeated and unjustified delays and procrastinations of procedural actions and during the exercise of function;
9. public disclosure of opinions delivered by the member himself or by other member during the process that has not yet become a formally public act;
10. breach of the obligation of confidentiality and non-disclosure of information resulting from the on-going or completed investigation or trial, including the facilitation of

publication and distribution also due to negligence, of confidential or procedural acts, or confidential information resulting from the matters under a process of investigation or trial.

11. public disclosure of statements and in media on matters, except for press communications within the limits of his or her duty;

12. distorted submission of facts on the acts being issued;

13. use of the mandate of the member, with a view of deriving for oneself or for others unjustified profits.

14. being in the company of persons being under criminal prosecution or being subject of a criminal proceeding or of convicts, save the cases of the rehabilitation of convicts or persons who are relatives of blood-related or law-related judges and having improper business relations with these persons;

15. unfair direct or indirect benefit of gifts, favours, promises or preferential treatments of any kind, either by lawful actions, granted due to the function he or she exercises or as a result of his or her use of the magistrate position;

16. improper behaviour to meet obligations in relations and in communication with state institutions and their officials, other cases of improper unjustified behaviour.

17. other cases provided in this law.

Article 17

Dismissal procedures for the members of the re-evaluation institutions

1. Disciplinary investigation may be initiated against institutions members in case of sufficient evidence from reliable sources that they have committed a disciplinary offense.

The initiation of disciplinary investigation can be requested by following persons:

a) Every commissioner against commissioners;

b) Every judge against judges of the Appeal Chamber;

c) Every international observer against the Public Commissioner, the Commissioner and judges of the Appeal Chamber.

2. The request to initiate disciplinary investigation shall be made in writing to the General Secretary of the Commission or the Appeal Chamber, as the case may be. Reporting on disciplinary violations by the public shall be submitted to the international observers.

3. The investigation shall start without reasonable delay after identifying the disciplinary misconduct. Disciplinary proceedings shall be archived without a final decision, if the member of the institution withdraws from duty.

4. The Disciplinary Commission shall be composed of 3 judges of the Appeal Chamber elected by lot, without the participation of the member subject to disciplinary proceedings according to the law. The investigatory judge shall be elected by lot among all members of the Appeal Chamber, without the participation of the member subject to disciplinary proceedings. The lot shall be organised by the Secretary General of the Appeal Chamber.

5. The investigating judge shall draft a report on investigation results of the misconduct and shall immediately present it to the Disciplinary Commission for review.

6. The Disciplinary Commission within 15 days of the date of receipt of the report shall decide as follows:

a) Issuing a disciplinary measure in accordance with the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors.

b) issuing a disciplinary measure and sending the case to the General Prosecution Office or specialized prosecution office according to article 148 paragraph 4 of the Constitution, as the case may be, when it ascertains that the misconduct for which the member is being charged constitutes also a criminal offence.

c) non issuance of a disciplinary measure.

7. The member of the institutions, subject to disciplinary proceedings, has the right to be informed, counselled and heard during disciplinary proceedings. The Disciplinary Commission in assuming its functions must have regard to, and aim to secure the appropriate application and balance of the principle of independence, impartiality and credibility and the principle of confidentiality and the right to privacy. The legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors applies accordingly.

Article 18

Organisation and administration of the institutions

1. The institutions shall have personnel and equipment for assuming the tasks entrusted by this law. The organisational structure, classification of salaries for the personnel of the institutions of re-evaluation shall be approved by the Assembly upon proposal of the relevant institution. The personnel of the re-evaluation institutions shall be composed by the legal service unit and the administrative employees.

2. The Appeal Chamber shall also be assisted by the supporting structures of the Constitutional Court.

3. The employment relationships of the staff shall be regulated in this law and in the Labour Code.

4. The responsible authority for the recruitment of employees shall be the ad hoc committee established near each institution. The ad hoc committee shall be composed of two members of the Commission or Appeal Chamber, respectively elected by lot, as well as the oldest Public Commissioner in age. For the recruitment of the employees of the Public Commissioner, the ad hoc committee shall be composed of the two Public Commissioner and the oldest judge in age of the Appeal Chamber.

Article 19

Budget of the institutions

1. The budget of the institutions shall be financed by the state budget law, where it is mentioned as a separate institution.

2. The institutions shall propose each year the draft budget in the parliamentary commission covering legal issues, which presents it for approval to the Assembly, as integral part of the state budget.

3. The institutions apply their budget independently, as approved by the Assembly.

4. The institutions shall have the right to use secondary incomes, gained by international projects, donations and their publications.

5. Financial audit of the institutions shall be done by the High State Audit.

Article 20 **The Secretary General**

1. Within 30 days after the entry into force of this law, the President of the Republic shall publish the vacancies for the two Secretaries General, on its website and in two of the highest circulation newspapers in the country. All interested persons may apply for these positions within 20 days after the publication in the website. The President of the Republic prepares the files and hands them over to the institutions once they have begun their functioning.
2. The procedure for the recruitment shall be carried out based on a transparent and open procedure of the most qualified candidates. The selection of the candidates shall be carried out by the ad hoc commission established in the respective institutions.
3. Secretary General is the Albanian citizen who fulfils following criteria:
 - a) has completed the second level of university law studies or economic studies with the degree 'master in science' in Albania or law studies or economic studies abroad and has obtained an equivalent degree according to the rules on equivalent diplomas foreseen in the law;
 - b) work experience in management and leading position not less than 10 years;
 - c) no criminal investigation has been initiated against him/her; has not been sentenced by a final court decision for committing a crime as well as a criminal offence, deliberately;
 - ç) be fluent in English;
 - d) no disciplinary measure of dismissal from office or any other effective disciplinary action in compliance with the legislation has been taken against him/her at the time of application;
 - e) has not held a political post in the public administration or a leadership position in a political party for the last 10 years;
4. The ad hoc committee decides on the selected candidate through a file competition.

Article 21 **Duties of the General Secretary**

The duties of the secretary general are:

- a) represents the institution in respect to all relations with third parties, if the relevant President of the re-evaluation institutions is not able to perform this duty;
- b) administers the register of files;
- c) organizes and leads the daily work of the all the staff with the exception of the advisory staff;
- ç) deals with issues related to public relations;
- d) organises the work for the preparation of the annual report on financial expenses.
- dh) recruits the personnel in compliance with the Labour Code
- e) performs any other administrative task assigned by the President of the relevant re-evaluation institution.

Article 22
Legal Service Uni

t

1. The Commission and the Appeal Chamber shall, in its decision-making be assisted by the Legal Service Unit, which carries out advisory and supporting activity in the decision-making process of these institutions. The Legal Service Unit is composed of legal advisors, and economic advisors under the supervision of the meeting of the commissioners or judges.
2. The procedure for the recruitment shall be carried out based on a transparent and open procedure of the most qualified candidates. The selection of the candidates shall be carried out by the ad hoc commission established in the respective institutions
3. Legal advisor is the Albanian citizen who fulfils the following criteria:
 - a) has completed the second level of university law studies with the degree 'master in science' in Albania or law studies abroad and has obtained an equivalent degree according to the rules on equivalent diplomas foreseen in the law;
 - b) Work experience in the justice system or public administration not less than 7 years;
 - c) Has not been sentenced by a final court decision for committing a crime or a criminal offence, deliberately, and no criminal investigation has been initiated against him/her;
 - ç) no disciplinary action of dismissal from office or any other disciplinary action in force in compliance with the legislation has been taken against him/her at the time of application;
 - d) be fluent in English;
4. Financial advisor is the Albanian citizen who fulfils the following criteria of having:
 - a) has completed the second level of university economic or mathematic studies or law studies with the degree 'master in science' in Albania or law studies or economic studies abroad and has obtained an equivalent degree according to the rules on equivalent diplomas foreseen in the law;
 - b) work experience in the financial field non less than 7 years;
 - c) has not been sentenced by a final court decision for committing a crime or a criminal offence, deliberately, and no criminal investigation has been initiated against him/her;
 - ç) no disciplinary action of dismissal from office or any other disciplinary action in force in compliance with the legislation has been taken against him/her at the time of application;
 - d) be fluent in English.

Article 23
Duties of the advisor

1. Duties of the legal advisor are to:
 - a) analyse the file and preparation of the case report;
 - b) perform any other tasks assigned by Rapporteur of the case.
2. Duties of economic advisors are to:
 - a) study the file from the financial/economic point of view and prepare the report on the case, in particular financial assessment of assessee's assets;

b) perform any other tasks assigned by rapporteur of the case.

Article 24
Media Relation

The institutions shall have a responsible person for the public communication relation.

Article 25
Protection of the members of the institutions and local and international staff

If the life, health or property of the members of the institution, their related persons, othe staff of the re-evaluation institutions, as well as the supporting staff of the International Monitoring Operation shall be endanged, the state shall provide protection as defined in the legislation in force on the special protection.

Article 26
Declaration of assets by the members of the institutions

1. The member of the re-evaluation institution, upon initiation of the exercise of the duty, shall have the obligation to submit the annual asset declaration. Inaccurate disclose of this asset declaration shall constitute a ground for dismissal from the duty in accordance with this law.
2. The member of the re-evaluation institution, the general secretary, the financial and legal advisors as well as their related persons, shall submit an annual declaration of assets and up to three years after its termination, within the terms foreseen by Law “On the declaration and audit of assets, financial obligations of elected persons and certain public officials”.
3. The member of the re-evaluation institution shall not be subject of the re-evaluation process in accordance with article 179/b of the Constitution.

Article 27
Guarantees of impartiality

1. The member of the re-evaluation institution shall declare and avoid any situation of conflicts of interests, based on the Law “On prevention of conflicts of interest”. Any decision taken in situations of conflicts of interest, a part form any legal consequences in the decision-making process, shall constitute a serious disciplinary misconduct.
2. In the case a member of the institution is unable to decide an assigned case for reasons mentioned in article 30 of the Administrative Procedure Code or Law “On prevention of conflict of interest in exercising public functions”, he or she shall notify immediately in written form the Panel. The decision on the preclusion of a commissioner, judge or public commissioner shall be taken by another panel designed by lot.
3. Each person who possesses information on the existence of the conflict of interest grounds mentioned in paragraph 1 of this article, shall notify immediately in written form the Panel adjudicating the case, which shall forward the request to another Panel for decision, assigned by lot.

Article 28
Security conditions of trust and confidentiality

1. Telecommunications of members of institutions shall be monitored by the Independent Investigation Unit established in accordance with article 148 paragraph 4 of the Constitution and in their financial records/indicators shall be monitored by the Financial Intelligence Unit upon their approval provided in articles 7, paragraph 3 letter ç) of this law, for the whole duration of their mandate.
2. The member of the re-evaluation institution and their personnel are bound to handle all information related to the re-evaluation procedure in compliance with the principle of confidentiality and data protection. These institutions are exempt from this obligation only when the information is given to the assessee under re-evaluation or to bodies legally entitled to request such information due to legal obligations.

Article 29
Salaries and other benefits of the members and advisors

1. Members of the re-evaluation institutions shall work full time.
2. Commissioners and Public Commissioners shall receive the salary and other financial benefits in accordance with the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors..
3. The judge at the Appeal Chamber shall receive the salary and other financial benefits in accordance with Law "On organization and functioning of the Constitutional Court in the Republic of Albania".
4. The members of the re-evaluation institutions shall receive an additional monthly allowance due to work-related difficulties.
5. The legal/financial advisor shall receive respectively 80% of the monthly salary of the respective member of the re-evaluation institution. They receive an additional payment due to work-related difficulties.
6. Upon termination of the mandate of the re-evaluation institutions, the legal/financial advisor, upon his or her consent, shall have the right to be appointed in functions or public functions which he or she had before its appointment or in positions equivalent to them in the public administration.

CHAPTER IV
ASSET ASSESSMENT

Article 30
Object of asset assessment

The object of asset assessment is the declaration and audit of assets, the legitimacy of the source of their creation, financial obligations, including private interests, for the assessee and persons related to him or her.

Article 31
Initiation of the re-evaluation procedure for asset assessment

1. All assessees shall compile the declaration on asset declaration as per Annex 2 attached to this law, to the official address of HIDAAC, within 30 days from the date of entry into force of this Law.
2. Upon receipt of the asset declarations, HIDAACI shall initiate immediately the procedure described, as provided in articles 4 paragraph 4 and 33 of this law.
3. Within three months after entry into force of this law, the assessees mentioned in 179/b paragraph 4, sentence two of the Constitution, may file a written request addressed to the Commission with the purpose to be re-evaluated. The request shall be accompanied by the filled-in asset declaration as per annex 2 of this Law.

Article 32
Declaration of assets

1. The assessee and his or her related persons along with the declaration of assets shall submit, all the necessary documents justifying the veracity of his or her statements in the declaration regarding legitimacy of their assets and the source of their creation.
2. In case the assessee is objectively not able to present the document which justifies the legitimacy of the creation of the assets, he or she should attest to the re-evaluation institutions that the document has disappeared, has been lost and cannot be remade or cannot be obtained in any other way. The vetting institution decide if the non-presentation of documents is for justified reasons. This rule applies also in case the responsible organ for issuing the justifying documents does not replied in due time.
3. If the assessee or related persons have assets outside the territory of the Republic of Albania, he or she shall submit the bank statement of last years, most current property records, or other documents demonstrating the value of the foreign-located asset.
4. All assessee and his or her related persons or other related persons who have been declared in the capacity of donors, lenders and borrowers, when they confirm these relations, shall bare the obligation to justify the legitimacy of the source of the creation of these assets.
5. All declarations of private interests previously submitted to HIDAACI can be used as evidence by the Commission and the Appeal Chamber.

Article 33
Procedure of re-evaluation of assets

1. HIDAACI based on declarations of assets shall conduct a full audit procedure in compliance with this law, the Law "On the declaration and audit of assets, financial obligations of elected persons and certain public officials, Law "On prevention of conflict of interest in exercising public functions" and Law "Code of Administrative Procedures".
2. The General Inspector of HIDAACI, for the purpose of this assessment, can request through Albanian Financial Intelligent Unit or Ministry of Justice records of assets owned or beneficially used abroad by assessee's or their related persons, or any financial transactions in Albania or abroad according to Law no. 9917/2008 "On prevention of money laundering

and financing of terrorism” or from assesseees or their related persons. Such documents or information can be used as evidence before the Commission.

3. HIDAACI assists and provides full access to international observers, upon their request, whom are in particular entitled to consult, copy or investigate declaration of assets submitted by the assessee or his or her related persons and their accompanying documents.

4. HIDAACI shall conduct a full audit procedure as soon as possible but no longer than 180 days of asset declaration submission.

5. Upon completion of the audit, the General Inspector of HIDAACI shall prepare a reasoned detailed report for each assessee and shall rate his or her declarations as follows:

- (a) accurate declaration /disclosure in compliance with the law, with legitimate financial sources and not found in situation of conflicts of interest;
- (b) lack of legitimate financial sources to justify their assets;
- (c) hiding wealth/ assets;
- (d) false declaration;
- (e) subject founded in situation of conflicts of interests.

CHAPTER V

BACKGROUND ASSESSMENT

Article 34

Object of the background assessment

The object of background assessment shall be the verification of assesseees declarations and other data with the purpose of identifying assesseees with inappropriate contacts with persons involved in the organized crime, in accordance with the principles and conditions provided for in Article DH of the Annex of the Constitution.

Article 35

Initiation of the re-evaluation procedure for Background Assessment

1. Assesseees shall compile the declaration form on background assessment as per Annex no. 3 of this law, and shall sent it within 30 days from the date of entry into force of this Law to the official address of the Classified Information Security Directorate (“National Security Authority”).

2. Upon receipt of background declarations, the National Security Authority shall initiate immediately the procedure described, as provided articles 4 paragraph 4, 37 and 38 of this law.

3. Within six months after entry into force of this law, the assesseees mentioned in article 179/b paragraph 4 sentence two may file a written request addressed to the Commission with the purpose to be re-evaluated. The request shall be accompanied by the filled-in background declaration as per the annex of this Law.

Article 36

The structure responsible for background assessment

1. The re-evaluation institutions in collaboration with the National Security Authority are responsible for administering the background checks. The Authority shall appoint sufficient

officials within the Agency's division responsible for re-evaluation to administer the background check. Persons conducting the background assessment shall comply with all applicable standards of professionalism, ethics, privacy protection and secrecy.

2. The National Security Authority, State Intelligence Service and Internal Intelligence and Complaint Service near the Ministry of Internal Affairs shall establish a working group to carry out the tasks under this law. Personnel shall be seconded from these structures to the task force for no less than a one year period.

3. The National Security Authority, based on the request of the working group or of the institutions shall establish liaisons with foreign countries to obtain information about members and alleged members of organized crime necessary to accomplish the purposes of this law.

Article 37 Tasks of the working group

The working group has to abide by the general requirements of the background assessment, being as follows:

- a) Accurate verification of identity, in the past and present for every individual;
- b) Verification if it has demonstrated criminal tendencies of involvement in organised crime;
- c) General evaluation whether the individual is under the pressure of criminal structures;
- ç) Having been or being or attempting to be involved covertly solely, in complicity or in the composition of a criminal organisation;

Article 38 Standards governing the background assessment

1. The background assessment shall be conducted based upon the most accurate evidence, intelligence and information available.

2. In particular, persons conducting the background assessment shall not make a determination based upon personal relationships, personal animosity or personal favouritism.

3. The background assessment shall include an evaluation of evidence and information that must include conditions that support a finding under paragraphs 4 and 6 and conditions that mitigate against a finding under paragraphs 5 and 7. Any background assessment that does fails to consider supporting and mitigating conditions is incomplete.

4. Conditions that support a finding of inappropriate contact with a person involved with the organized crime are in particular:

- a) The assessee has been photographed or a witness describes a meeting with a person involved with the organized crime.
- b) The assessee or a member of his or her related persons has held a communication with a person involved with the organized crime.
- c) The assessee or a member of his or her related persons exchanges money, favours, gifts or property with a person involved with the organized crime
- ç) The assessee is closely related to a person involved with the organized crime.

d) The assessee participates in or attends meetings, events or activities with one or more persons involved with the organized crime. The person's alleged membership in organized crime is well known, has been publicized, or is a matter of public record.

5. Conditions that mitigate a finding of inappropriate contact with a person involved with the organized crime are in particular:

a) The assessee is believably unaware that the person is a person involved with the organized crime. This condition can be counterbalanced by factors in paragraph 4.

b) The assessee's family relationship with the person involved with the organized crime is distant, or involves rare family contact.

c) The assessee has been public, truthful and complete about the contacts and has distanced himself or herself from them. This condition can be counterbalanced by the timing or perceived motivation of the assessee's actions.

ç) The assessee was aware that the person is a person involved with the organized crime, but was unaware that he or she would attend a meeting or was tricked into attending. This condition can be counterbalanced by factors in paragraph 3 letter a).

d) The assessee's contacts were over five years old and there are no indications that they continued. This condition can be counterbalanced by the degree of seriousness of the contacts or by factors in paragraph 4.

dh) Any other credible factor that mitigates against a finding of inappropriate contact with a person involved with the organized crime. This factor must be explained.

6. Conditions that support a finding that background declaration was not completed fully and truthfully are in particular:

a) The assessee fails to list a contact which is established by relevant and credible evidence.

b) The assessee fails to list a contact which is established by relevant and credible intelligence which is corroborated or deemed reliable.

c) The assessee fails to list a contact which is established by relevant and credible information which is supported by other evidence, and assessee has other contacts which were either listed or established under letter a) of this paragraph, or there is other evidence of a benefit, action or consequence from the contact which creates a reasonable suspicion that the information is the only plausible explanation.

7. Conditions that mitigate a finding that the background declaration was not completed fully and truthfully are in particular:

a) The assessee lists a contact but the date or location is not correct, and this appears to be due to simple error or confusion.

b) The assessee fails to list a contact, but has been truthful and complete about other contacts, and this omission appears to be due to simple error or confusion.

c) The contact occurred at a location with numerous people and it is credible that the contact would not have been memorable or seemed insignificant. This condition can be counterbalanced by the degree of seriousness of the contact or by other factors under this paragraph.

ç) The assessee fails to list a contact which involves a family member, and conditions of that contact would not have been memorable or seemed significant.

d) This condition can be counterbalanced by the degree of seriousness of the contact or by other factors under this article.

The assessee is believably unaware that the person is a person involved with the organized crime. This condition can be counterbalanced by factors in paragraph 6.
dh) Any other credible factor that mitigates against a finding of inappropriate contact with a person involved with the organized crime. This factor must be explained.

Article 39

Procedure of Background Assessment

1. The National Security Authority in collaboration with the working group within 60 days of the formation of the working group, each the background declaration shall review it and verify whether the information is accurate and whether the assessee has any inappropriate contacts with persons involved with the organized crime or alleged members of organized crime. At the end of the 60 days, the National Security Authority may ask the Commission for a 30 days extension in particular if foreign information has been requested.
2. When the review and verification is completed, within 10 days the National Security Authority shall submit to the Commission a public document prepared by the working group. This document/report determines whether an assessee has completed the background declaration fully and truthfully, and whether there is information in the background declaration or elsewhere which indicates that the assessee has inappropriate contacts with persons involved in the organized crime, and a recommendation about the appropriateness for the office. This public document shall provide a description of those contacts and conditions considered under article 38 of this law. Information shall not be disclosed if it endangers the safety of a source or is a result of a condition from a foreign government.

CHAPTER VI

PROFICIENCY ASSESSMENT

Article 40

The object of proficiency assessment

The Proficiency Assessment shall evaluate assesseees according to their ethical and professional activities in compliance with this law and the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors..

Article 41

Initiation of the re-evaluation procedure for the Proficiency Assessment

1. Assesseees shall compile the self-evaluation form as per Annex no.4 attached to this law and shall sent it within 30 days from the date of entry into force of this Law to the proficiency assessment body.
2. Within three months after entry into force of this law, the assesseees mentioned in article 179/b paragraph 4 sentence two of the Constitution may file a written request addressed to the Commission with the purpose to be re-evaluated. The request shall be accompanied by the filled-in self-evaluation form as per annex no.4 of this Law.
3. The proficiency assessment shall be done for the re-evaluation period of the past three calendar years of the exercising the duties from entry into force of this law. In case the

assesse has less than three years in duty, the re-evaluation period shall consist of all years exercising this duty.

4. The re-evaluation period may be extended to the period starting from 1 January 2006 on in particular if relevant information on the ethical and professional performance of the assessee is available. The Commission or Appeal Chamber shall take this information into consideration if the rapporteur or the international observer considers it to be relevant for the re-evaluation.

Article 42 **Sources of re-evaluation of proficiency assessment**

1. The Constitutional Court judges, High Court judges and all judges and prosecutors shall be re-evaluated based on sources provided in the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors. The General Prosecutor shall be evaluated based on the performance of his duties provided in article 8 of the Law nr. 8737/2001 "On the organisation and functioning of the prosecution office in the Republic of Albania", for the last three years starting from the beginning of the mandate.

2. The legal adviser at the Constitutional Court, High Court and legal assistants of administrative courts and Prosecution Office, that are not magistrate, shall be assessed based on:

- (a) prepared reports and legal opinions; and
- (b) results of the exam at the School of Magistrates.

3. The inspector shall be re-evaluated based on decision 36, dated 29.04.2015 "On the criteria and procedures for the proficiency and ethic evaluation of the Chief inspector and the inspectors of the High Council of Justice".

4. The second paragraph of this law shall apply to former advisors of the Constitutional Court and former legal advisors of the High Court with at least 3 years of work experience in this function as well as for the inspectors who are not magistrates.

5. Former judges, prosecutors shall be re-evaluated based on following sources;

- a) Assessment of the work which includes at least 5 legal documents produced by the assessee during the professional work;
- b) Performance evaluation during a professional work;
- c) If sufficient basis for a proficiency assessment of former judges or prosecutors is not available, the assessee shall undergo the exam of the School of Magistrate in accordance with paragraph 2, letter b of this article and the provisions of Law on the School of Magistrates in the Republic of Albania.

Article 43
Procedure for the proficiency assessment

1. The re-evaluation procedure shall be carried out in accordance with the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors, as far as applicable to the re-evaluation procedure.
2. The relevant proficiency assessment body reviews legal documents issued by the assessee during the period subject to re-evaluation. The body, after reviewing the legal documents selected by the assessee according to Annex 4 and the 5 (five) legal documents selected through an objective and random system, shall prepare a detailed and reasoned report. This report shall be submitted to the Commission, immediately, but not later than 90 days of receipt of the self evaluation form.
3. It is the responsibility of every assessee and the relevant organs to ensure that the re-evaluation institutions receive the required documents. If the re-evaluation institutions do not obtain the documents required, the Rapporteur shall send a notice to the assessee or the relevant organ to provide them within 5 days. Failure to cooperate may result for the assessee in an assessment of "inadequate"; The relevant organs are held liable according to article 50 paragraph 6 of this law.
4. If the Rapporteur has obtained reliable examples of the assessee's work in accordance with article 49 of this law from the public or through other means, however, it may continue with the assessment.
5. The Rapporteur, in extraordinary cases where information is complex or difficult to obtain, may request an extension of time from the Commission.

Article 44
Re-evaluation report

The Rapporteur shall issue the proficiency report based on the report of the Inspectorate, the information received from other sources, and on evaluation criteria of the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors, and other legal acts. In the end, the rapporteur shall propose issuance of following rates for the assessee:

- a) "Competent": The assessee has demonstrated an acceptable quality of work, fair judgment, has routinely observed rights of litigants or victims, and is acceptably efficient and effective.
- b) Deficient: The assessee has demonstrated an unacceptable quality of work, poor judgment, has not routinely observed rights of litigants or victims, or is inefficient or ineffective. The Commission shall recommend training program at the School of Magistrates designed to repair these deficiencies within one year; or
- c) Inadequate: The assessee has demonstrated an unacceptable quality of work, poor judgment, has not routinely observed rights of litigants or victims, or is inefficient or ineffective to the extent that the training program at the School of Magistrates, cannot resolve this issue within a year or has not successfully passed the exam at the School of Magistrates.

CHAPTER VII PROCEDURE OF RE-EVALUATION

Article 45 The general rules of the case investigation

1. Members of the Commission, judges at the Appeal Chamber and international observers shall investigate on all facts and assess all necessary circumstances for the re-evaluation procedure.
2. During the administrative investigation, the Commission, the Appeal Chamber and the international observer may request information from any subject of public law according to articles 49 and 50 of this law. They shall administer all documents which ascertain acts, facts, qualities or subjective situation necessary for the realization of the investigation.

Article 46 Notification

1. The notification and any communication during the re-evaluation process shall be made at the electronic e-mail address of the assessee provided in the asset declaration provided in article 31, paragraph 1 of this law.
2. If the assessee is on leave or maternity leave, the notification shall be made at the private email address of the assessee provided in the asset declaration provided in article 31 paragraph 1 of this law.
3. The assessee is entitled and obliged to access and use the official electronic e-mail address during the re-evaluation process.
4. In case of failure of notification according to the provisions mentioned above, other forms of notification foreseen in the Administrative Procedure Code are valid.

Article 47 Rights of the assessee

Rights of the assessee during the re-evaluation process are provided in articles 35- 40 and 45-47 of the Administrative Procedure Code.

Article 48 Cooperation during the investigation process

The assessee is obliged to cooperate with the Commission and the Appeal Chamber. In the decision making process, the Commission or the Appeal Chambers shall take into account the readiness and behaviour of the assessee to cooperate during the re-evaluation process.

Article 49 Tools for collecting evidence

1. The Commission or the Appeal Chamber in order to establish facts and circumstances has the rights as follows:
 - (a) obtains legal documents according to article 3, point 2) of this law;
 - (b) collect declarations from the assessee, witnesses, experts and the public;

- (c) take other written documents according to the forms provided in the law or documents taken through other photographic, recording or other technical means;
- (ç) visit and control movable and immovable asset based on the competent court decision.
2. The testimony of a witness or expert during the process of re-evaluation, may be used as evidence in criminal proceedings.
 3. Facts already know to the Commission or Appeal Chamber or generally known facts and presumed facts from the law, do not need further evidence.
 4. The Commission or the Appeal Chamber shall not base decisions only on documents from unknown sources, or evidence which is not reliable, lacks credibility or is strongly inconsistent with other evidence. It may be taken into account each indicia as a part of the overall evaluation of evidence.
 5. Documents or information obtained from foreign state sources in compliance with this law shall be considered by the Commission or Appeal Chamber.
 6. The request to take evidence shall be rejected by the Commission or the Appeal Chamber if taking such evidence is not allowed by the law or:
 - a) if taking of such evidence is superfluous;
 - b) if taking of such evidence is irrelevant to the decision or has already been proved;
 - c) the evidence is wholly inappropriate or unobtainable;
 - d) the request is made to protract the proceedings;
 - dh) an important allegation which is intended to offer proof in exoneration of the assessee may be treated as if the alleged facts were true.
 7. A request to take evidence by inspection can be rejected by the Commission or Appeal Chamber, if the inspection is deemed to be not necessary for establishing the truth.
 8. The above mentioned paragraph applies also for request to take evidence by examining a witness, if the witness has to be summoned from outside the territory of the Republic of Albania.
 9. The rejection of the request shall be made in reasoned decision of the Commission or Appeal Chamber by providing the arguments for its rejection.
 10. A finding (statement, document, report) by an international observer shall be considered to be a determination that a fact, condition, circumstance or legal standard exists or occurred. The finding shall present the circumstances that provide the basis for that finding. If drafted in compliance with paragraph 5 of this article, the Commission or the Appeal Chamber shall give it the deference of an expert report. The refusal of the findings of the international observer shall be done in reasoned decisions.
 11. A written opinion by an international observer shall be considered to be a conclusion by the latter about the individual application of the re-evaluation process or conclusions to be made from facts in individual cases. The opinion may be persuasive to the Commission or Appeal Chamber, but may not be given evidentiary value.
 12. In case the Commission or Appeal Chamber has not taken into consideration the request of the international observer to collect an evidence, they shall issue a decision by arguing reasons for its rejection.

Article 50
Access to information

1. The Commission, Appeal Chamber, and international observers shall collaborate with state institutions, individuals or legal entities, domestic or foreign, to verify truthfulness and accuracy of statements made by the assessee.
2. The Commission, Appeal Chamber and international observers shall have full access to all data bases like specialized prosecution office according to article 148 paragraph 4 of the Constitution, especially, but not limited to:
 - a) information on the judicial status of the assessee;
 - b) personal files of assessees, statistical data, legal documents and files selected for evaluation, self-assessments, supervisors' opinions, data on training, and complaints against persons subjected to evaluation, results from the verification of complaints, as well as decisions on disciplinary measures against assessees;
 - c) data in immovable properties of the assessee registered with the cadastre or obtained through a notarial act not registered with the Immoveable Properties Registration Office. For this purpose, the Commission or the Appeal Chamber have access and the right to request information from the cadastre and/or the Albanian notarial register;
 - ç) bank accounts, tax information, vehicles database, border entry and exit data;
 - d) data on ownership rights or interests on assets of every kind, moveable or immovable, corporeal or incorporeal, material or immaterial, including those evidenced in electronic or numeric format, including but not limited to instruments such as loans, traveller's cheques, bank cheques, payment orders, all types of securities, standing orders and letters of credits, and any interest, dividends, other income or value deriving thereof.
 - dh) data on possible business relationships, commercial activities or other professional activities.
 - e) data that prove the existence of money in cash or other monetary market means or interests and/or payments, including but not limited to cheques, receipts, certificates of deposits, debit or credit cards, electronic payment cards, securities, and any other document that proves the existence of a monetary obligation or other deposited value and an obligation to pay to the assessee a corresponding amount in cash money or other form;
 - ë) data that prove the existence of trusts or other similar agreements.
3. If the data or information provided in paragraph 2 of this article, is kept and administered electronically or processed and updated through a computer system, the public institution or entity exercising a public function are obliged to provide the Commission and Appeal Chamber with the necessary access codes to fully access the information needed for the evaluation. The levels of access for each case are run through the security level determined based on the function and need for information from the Commission and Appeal Chamber.
4. Upon request from the Commission or Appeal Chamber, secondary level banks and other entities exercising banking and financial activities in the Republic of Albania are obliged to provide any information on deposits, accounts and transactions of the person subjected to evaluation or persons related to them. Private institutions shall be reimbursed by the re-evaluation institutions for each request including for access to database and copies.

5. Data collection, processing and administration as per this article is subjected to rules on personal data protection determined by the legislation in force. The Commission or the Appeal Chamber takes appropriate organizational and technical measures to protect personal data from illegal or accidental destruction, accidental loss, to protect access or disclosure by unauthorized persons, especially when data processing is done electronically, as well as by any other illegal form of processing, in compliance with the data protection legislation.

6. Within 15 days from receipt of the request, any state body or public legal entity is obliged to collaborate with the Commission and Appeal Chamber for the delivery, access to and verification of data, facts or circumstances. Failure or refusal to collaborate, obstruction, delays or misconduct of the verification process shall be reported to the prosecution office as criminal offence (article 248 of the Criminal Code) and shall constitute disciplinary misconduct.

7. The Commission, the Appeal Chamber and international observers have the right to request international cooperation within the framework of international treaties and diplomatic channels. Request are handled by the competent ministry.

Article 51 Conclusions based on Facts

If the assessee does not present evidences in accordance with article 85 of the Administrative Procedure Code and in case of incomplete evidence, the Commission and the Appeal Chamber may make factual conclusions based on the given evidences, the general assessment of the cases and their internal conviction.

Article 52 Burden of Proof

1. The Commission and the Appeal Chamber shall seek to determine an objective and proportionate evaluation of the assessee.

2. If the Commission or the Appeal Chamber concludes that the evidence has reached the standard of proof under article 45 of this Law for its report, the assessee shall have the burden to provide evidence or arguments about evidence against that conclusion.

3. Article 82 of the Code of Administrative Procedure does not apply.

Article 53 Participation of public in denunciation of facts

1. Each person who becomes aware of facts or circumstances which might constitute evidence related to each component of the re-evaluation has the right to inform directly re-evaluation institutions. The institution is obligated to review the information if received by a known or anonymous person.

2. The information shall contain the necessary basis to assess on the misconduct of the re-evaluation components, specifically details on the action or suspected action, legal consequences and circumstances on facts which create the trust that there has been law infringement as well as the contact details of the informant.

3. Withdrawal of the information by the informant does not lead automatically to archiving the investigation if the Commission or the Appeal Chamber considers that allegations provide sufficient grounds for an ex officio investigation in the relevant case.
4. The Commission or Appeal Chamber shall publish a denunciation template in order to facilitate submission of information by the public.
5. The rights and interests of persons who denounce shall be automatically protected in trustable, effective and appropriate manner, according to the same standards provided in Law "On whistle-blower and protection of whistle-blowers".

Article 54 **Justice collaborator**

1. The person who participated in a corruption charge with the assessee is entitled to address the competent prosecution office for investigating corruption charges according to the criminal legislation.
2. The prosecutor can grant to the person the status of justice collaborator if the latest is willing to give sufficient evidence, about a concrete corruption charge which involving him or her and the assessee.
3. The person is entitled to be represented by a defence council.
4. If an agreement is reached, the justice collaborator must give full information, without any reserve or condition, on all the facts, events and circumstances, which serve as evidence for the discovery, investigation, trail or prevention of corruption of assesses. The written statement of a justice collaborator done in front of the prosecutor constitutes a valid evidence for the re-evaluation and all other legal procedures.
5. The justice collaborator is not prosecuted for the corruption activities with assesses which the person confesses in the written statement. The prosecutor shall provide a copy of the statement and the granted status to the justice collaborator, re-evaluation institutions and the international observers.
6. The collaboration agreement can be revoked, if the justice collaborator is not delivering evidence to the institutions or made false statements for which criminal proceedings shall start in accordance with the criminal legislation.
7. The assessee having received a bribe by the justice collaborator shall be obliged to reimburse the bribe to the justice collaborator even if the latter violated the law as well. The assessee cannot claim that the enrichment has been lost in the meantime. The reimbursement can be claimed directly from the related persons of the assessee, if it is asserted that they have obtained from the assessee an amount exceeding 100.000 ALL without legal grounds for the period of time starting from 1.1.2006. Assesseees and related persons have the right to file regress claim before the court against the main recipient of the bribe accordingly.

Article 55 **Hearing**

1. The Commission shall invite the assessee to a hearing in conformity with the rules provided in art. 87 and 88 of Administrative Procedure Code. International observers shall be notified accordingly.

2. The Commission's hearings shall be held in public as provided in article 20 of Law 49/2012 "On the organization and functioning of administrative courts and adjudication of administrative disputes".
3. The Commission shall have the right to ask for the assessee to speak. If the assessee does speak, the international observer and the panel may ask questions. The assessee has the right to refuse to answer questions. Questions can include a test of knowledge and practical skills in the field of law the assessee is currently working or has worked within the last year.
4. The Commission may reasonably limit the time provided for the assessee to speak.
5. All deliberations are held behind closed doors in the presence of the international observer. All decisions by the Commission shall be taken by open vote and by simple majority of the panel member's. In case of dissenting or concurring opinions during the decision making process, the Commissioner which has a dissenting/concurring opinion must present them in writing. International observers are entitled to write a dissenting opinion which shall accompany the final decision. Minutes of deliberations of the case shall be kept by the register staff of the Commission.
6. The decision is announced at the end of the hearing.
7. The written decision shall be notified to the assessee, the public commissioner and international observers within 30 days after the end of the hearing. The decision shall be published on the Commission's website.

Article 56 Resignation of assesses

1. The assessee has the right to resignation not later than three months from the entry into force of this law. The resignation shall be submitted in written form to the President of the Republic and shall be published in its official website. In case of resignation, the Commission shall issue a decision on the cessation of the re-evaluation procedure.
2. If assessee resigns, the assessee shall have the right to receive a transitory payment according to article 7 paragraph 1 of Law "On supplementary state pensions of officials who exercise constitutional functions and other state officials".

Article 57 Decision of the commission

1. The Rapporteur shall write the decision. The decision of the Commission shall be reasoned and in writing.
2. The decision shall contain the introduction, the descriptive justifying and the ordering part.
3. In the introduction of the decision shall be mentioned:
 - a) the official name of the Commission
 - b) the panel which has adjudicated the case and the administrative assistant;
 - c) time and place of the issued decision;
 - ç) name and generalities of the assessee, as well as their representatives;
 - d) opinion of the assessee or his/her representatives;
4. In the descriptive-justifying part shall be mentioned:

- a) circumstances of the case, as they have been assessed during the process, and the conclusions drawn by the Panel;
 - b) evidence and reasons on which the decision is based;
 - c) Report and Recommendation of the Rapporteur.
 - ç) legal provisions on which the decision is based.
5. In the ordering part, among others shall be mentioned:
- a) what has the panel decided;
 - b) if the Panel has decided to issue a disciplinary measure;
 - c) the right of appeal and the time-period for its filling.

Article 58 **Disciplinary measures**

1. At the end of the process, the Commission may decide:
 - a) Confirmation in duty;
 - b) Suspension from duty for a period of one year and the obligation to follow the training program at the School of Magistrates according to the approved curricula's;
 - c) Dismissal from office.
2. In case of the assessee's provided in article 179/b paragraph 4, second sentence who have passed successfully the re-evaluation, the Commission can decide:
 - a) appointment as judge or prosecutor in accordance with the provisions of the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors.;
 - b) refusal of appointment as judge or prosecutor.

Article 59 **Confirmation in duty**

1. The decision on the confirmation in duty may only be issued if the assessee meets all the following conditions together:
 - a) Achieves trustable level of asset assessment;
 - b) Achieves trustable level of background assessments;
 - c) Achieves a minimally qualified score in the proficiency assessment;
2. The above mentioned paragraph is not applicable in case of article 61 paragraph 5 of this law.
3. The Commission may reason in its decision that the assessee is qualified to undertake their position, explaining reasons of not issuing a disciplinary action.
4. Although the Commission decides to issue the decision of confirmation in duty, it has the right to transfer the file to the competent inspecting disciplinary body, if the Commission identifies reasons which constitute disciplinary misconduct in accordance with the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors.or to the competent professional and ethical evaluation body if it identifies reasons to be consider during the periodic evaluation. This decision is not appealable. The disciplinary body begins without delay consideration of reasons in accordance with the legislation that regulates the status of judges or prosecutors..

Article 60

Suspension from duty and the obligation to attend the training program

1. The Commission may order that the assessee be suspended from duties and be ordered to undertake a one year training program if deficiencies have been detected in his or her proficiency that can be remedied.
2. If the assessee completes the training program, the School of Magistrates shall provide the General Secretary of the Commission and international observers with exam scores and a certification that the deficiency has been remedied or not remedied.
3. The Commission shall provide the assessee with 10 days to submit a written explanation why he or she has not successfully completed the suspension with education. A copy of the notification shall be given to the international observer.

Article 61

Dismissal from office

The Commission may order that the assessee is dismissed from office in the following cases:

- 1) If the asset assessment has determined that the assessee has more than twice the amount justified by legitimate income, including persons related to him or her;
- 2) If the background assessment has determined that the assessee presents grave concerns to have inappropriate contacts to persons involved in the organized crime, which makes it impossible for the assessee to hold the position;
- 3) If the assessee lacked full disclosure during the asset assessment or background assessment under article 39 and 33 and of this law;
- 4) If the proficiency assessment has determined that the assessee is inadequate;
- 5) If the overall assessment in the sense of article 4 paragraph 2 of this law finds that the assessee jeopardizes the public trust in the judicial system and the deficiencies cannot be remedied by a training.

CHAPTER VIII APPEAL

Article 62

Rights of the assessee after the decision of the Commission

1. The assessee, who has exercised the right to appeal against the Commission's decision on the disciplinary measure, shall be suspended *ex lege* from his or her duties pending the decision of the Chamber of Appeal. During the suspension period, the assessee shall have the right to receive 75% of the salary in accordance with article F paragraph 5 of the Annex of the Constitution.
2. During the suspension period, the assessee shall not be entitled to examine and adjudicate cases. During the suspension period the assessee is obliged to provide a functioning email address or to nominate an advocate to the whom the notification can be done.

3. If no alternative electronic address is available as provided above, the assessee shall be notified in accordance with article 52 of Law "On the organisation and functioning of administrative court and the adjudication of administrative disputes".

Article 63 Filing the Appeal

1. The decisions of the Commission shall be appealed within 15 days from its notification in the Appeal Chamber by the Assessee and the Public Commissioner.
2. The Appeal shall be submitted to the Commission which has issued the decision according to article 46 of the Law "On the organisation and functioning of administrative court and the adjudication of administrative disputes".
3. The rules on administrative appeal provided in article 128 of the Code of Administrative Procedure are not applicable.

Article 64 Notification of the Appeal

The Appeal shall be notified to the assessee and public commissioner in conformity with the rules provided in article 42 of this law and article 52 of the Law "On the organisation and functioning of administrative court and the adjudication of administrative disputes".

Article 65 Trial proceedings

1. Trial proceedings in the Chamber of Appeal shall be in conformity with rules provided in articles 47, 48 /1; 49, 51, 55 of the Law no 49/2012 "On the organisation and functioning of administrative court and the adjudication of administrative disputes".
2. The international observer shall submit a written recommendation to the Public Commissioner to file an appeal. This recommendation shall be issued by a commission composed of at least 3 representatives of the International Monitoring Operation.
3. In case of appeal by the Public Commissioner, the Appeal Chamber shall adjudicate the case in hearing proceedings.

Article 66 Decision of the Appeal Chamber

1. Following the examination of a case, the Appeal Chamber shall:
 - a) Confirm the decision of the Commission
 - b) Modify the decision of the Commission;
 - c) Overrule the decision of the Commission;
2. The Appeal Chamber, in the reasoning of its decision, may give indication to the Commission helping it to decide on similar cases.
3. The decision of Appeal Chamber ordering dismissal has *ex lege* immediate effect.

Article 67
Reinstatement of time limits

1. When the assessee and public commissioner have lost the right to appeal they may submit a request within 15 days, from the date that the he or she becomes aware of the reason, but not later than the decision taken by the Assembly as provided in article 179/b, paragraph 9 of the Constitution.
2. The request shall be reviewed by the Appeal Chamber and shall be granted only if reasons for the appeal has been lost for legitimate and reasonable grounds.

CHAPTER IX
FINAL AND TRANSITIONAL PROVISIONS

Article 68
Transitory provision

1. Proficiency Assessments completed by the relevant proficiency assessment body at the date of initiation of the functioning of the Commission or Appeal Chamber shall be handed over to the latter. Minutes of the handover of the legal documents, and reports related to proficiency assessments shall be signed by the representative of the proficiency assessment body and one Commissioner selected by lot.
2. The School of Magistrate shall organize an extraordinary exam for 25 candidates for magistrate (divided in judges and prosecutors) respectively for each academic year 2016-2017 and 2017-2018.
3. The Bureau of the Assembly of the Republic of Albania within 5 days from the entry into force of this law, approves in regard to electronic voting system:
 - a) the necessary limit funds;
 - b) terms of reference for the conduct of the electronic system and offering of the system as well as;
 - c) the necessary procurement procedures with the exemption of the rules foreseen by the legislation in force on public procurement;The Assembly of the Republic of Albania, within 25 days from the entry into force of this law, shall guarantee the funds and shall conduct the necessary procurement procedures for the electronic voting system foreseen in article 10 of this law. Each parliamentary group shall appoint its experts for the supervision of the establishment and functioning of the electronic system.
4. The responsible organs shall take immediately upon entry into force of this law, the necessary legal and administrative measures for its implementation.

Article 69
Sublegal acts

1. Within 30 days from entry into force of this law, the Council of Ministers shall be in charge of taking the necessary measures for implementing the obligations related to the initiation of the activity of the re-evaluation institutions within the deadline.

2. Upon entry into force of this law, the School of Magistrates shall be in charge to approve the rules and the procedure for the testing provided in article 42 paragraph 2, letter b) of this law.

3. 30 days after establishment of the re-evaluation institutions, the meeting of the commissioners, or judges or public commissioner shall approve the rules on the activities of the re-evaluation institutions.

4. The procedures on the organization of the lot provided in articles 14 and 15 of this law shall be approved upon decision of the meeting of the commissioners, or judges or public commissioner.

Article 70

Dissolution of institutions

1. The Commission, the Appeal Chamber and Public Commissioner shall cease operations in accordance with articles 179/b paragraph 9 of the Constitution.

2. Unless otherwise authorized by Assembly, the only mandate which shall continue shall be the Secretary General and sufficient staff to complete duties.

Article 71

Entry into force

This law enters into force 15 days after its publication in the Official Gazette.

**SPEAKER
ILIR META**

Approved on 30 08 2016