



CDL-UD(2022)019

Or. Engl.

EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW
(VENICE COMMISSION)

in cooperation with

THE GENERAL PERSONNEL COUNCIL OF PALESTINE*

**Under the auspices of H.E. the Prime Minister
Dr Mohammad SHTAYEH**

Regional seminar for high level civil servants

15th UniDem Med

"PUBLIC SERVICE POLICIES: PARADIGMS FOR CHANGE"

Hybrid format: online and in Palestine*

17-18 May 2022

FINAL REPORT

by

Dr Safa NASSERELDIN

**(Former Minister of Telecommunication and Information Technology,
Presidential Secretary-General at Al-Quds University, Palestine*)**

Funded
by the European Union
and the Council of Europe



COUNCIL OF EUROPE



Implemented
by the Council of Europe

The Unidem Med project is implemented in the framework of the European Union/Council of Europe joint programme
"Regional Support to Reinforce Human Rights, Rule of Law and Democracy in the Southern Mediterranean"
(South Programme IV)

*This document has been produced as part of a programme co-funded by the European Union and the Council of Europe.
The views expressed herein can in no way be taken to reflect the official opinion of either party.*

* This designation shall not be construed as recognition of a State of Palestine and is without prejudice to the individual positions of Council of Europe and European Union member States on this issue.

1. Introduction

The 15th UniDem Med seminar on "Public service policies: paradigms for change" was held from 17-18 May 2022 in Ramallah, Palestine* together with an online participation through Zoom for the other partner countries. It was organized by the Venice Commission in collaboration with Palestinian General Personnel Council (GPC).

Among the participants were senior government officials and experts from the UniDem Med partner countries of the southern Mediterranean (Algeria, Jordan, Egypt, Morocco, Palestine*, and Tunisia) and Europe (France, United Kingdom and Belgium). Senior officials beyond the South Mediterranean region were invited by the General Personnel Council of Palestine*.

The seminar, which lasted for two consecutive days, dealt with several topics including: new models of human resources management and innovative training policies aiming at creating attractive working conditions that respect the rights of public service officers by focusing on the importance of investing in human capital, inclusiveness and quality of life at work. It discussed how human resources management policies and more particularly training policies could be modernized for better governance, greater efficiency and more diversity. It also discussed the major challenges facing the public administration and more particularly the civil service today, notably through the prism of new public management policies and their impact on performance evaluation and risk management. Another challenge discussed was the control of the wage bill and its impact on the quality of social dialogue and the innovations and trends on these issues in the South Mediterranean region and beyond.

All participants agreed that policies should be focusing on the importance of investing in human capital, to improve the quality of work, and updating the laws related to employee training and evaluation as well as developing strategic plans to improve the quality of training. They also emphasized that improving individual and institutional performance leads to contributing to improving the level of service quality, enhancing integrity and controlling spending, thus increasing the satisfaction and confidence of service recipients. This report summarizes the seminar proceedings, discussions, conclusions, and recommendations.

2. Seminar proceedings

The seminar was inaugurated by Mr. Mousa Abu Zaid, President of the General Personnel Council, Palestine*, Ms. Simona Granata-Menghini, Director and Secretary of the Venice Commission. Mr. Sven Khun Von Burgsdorff, Head of Delegation, Representative of the European Union (West Bank and Gaza Strip, UNRWA), Ms. Pilar Morales, Coordinator of the Neighborhood Policy with the Southern Mediterranean and Head of the Council of Europe Office in Tunis, Mr. Sameh Al-Nasser, Head of the Civil Service Office of the Kingdom of Jordan, Mr. Naser Al-Hatlan Al-Qahtani, General director, Arab Organization for Administrative Development (ARADO), League of Arab States and H.E Dr Mohammad Shtayeh, Prime Minister of Palestine*.

Speakers emphasized the importance of the seminar and the need for such forums in light of the enormous challenges that states and governments in the region face, as well as the need for the public sector to keep up with the new models of human resources management and find ways to more modern, efficient and open human resources management (HRM) policies. Mr. Abu Zaid explained how the GPC employees reacted and what they learned during the last two years, and how their reaction was different due to the new policies adopted to face the risks and enhance performance. The aim was to protect their employees and teams, transfer work remotely whenever possible, and take measures to protect them when they are not working remotely, and at the same time do everything possible to provide non-stop public services. In any way, they have maintained general management as well as learned to organize, define priorities and to reorient the workforce to these priorities. Employees were asked to work in new ways, transversely and with agility and it was found that they could be more flexible than expected and able to endure the new working conditions.

* This designation shall not be construed as recognition of a State of Palestine and is without prejudice to the individual positions of Council of Europe and European Union member States on this issue.

Speakers also emphasized the need of exchanging experiences, best practices, success stories, as well as disappointments, mistakes, and lessons learned. For them, the seminar was an opportunity for networking and potential bilateral collaboration among represented nations. Palestinian speakers thanked the Venice Commission for funding the seminar and for their long-standing collaboration. Talks by worldwide and regional specialists on one of the seminar's primary themes were followed by presentations on individual country experiences from officials and professionals from the southern Mediterranean area. This configuration allows for the correct blend of theoretical frameworks and practical experiences. It also allowed practitioners in the region to provide peer input on their peers' experiences.

They all agreed about the importance of the new human resources policies particularly in the area of training and developing employee skills as well as the importance of using the practical tools discussed for the performance management and the risk management.

3. New Models of public service policies focusing on strengthening human capital and improving the quality of working life.

The first session focused on modern, efficient and open human resources management policies. It was emphasized that civil servants are at the heart of the reform process of the public administration and in particular its senior officials. Human resources management plays a strategic role in this process because by improving recruitment, building staff loyalty, individualizing and enhancing career paths, and including minorities, women and people with disabilities, it improves efficiency and enhances its attractiveness. Human resources management is also important in the implementation of the principles of the rule of law and democracy by ensuring greater transparency and equality between its staff, by ensuring a better quality of life at work or attractive working conditions. This session was an opportunity to exchange experiences on human resources management in the South Mediterranean region and beyond in order to inspire the participating senior officials in the implementation of national reforms in this field.

The European expert Mr. Xavier SISTERNAS who is a Senior Policy Adviser at the OECD explained how we had taken advantage of the two years of the pandemic and learnt from them. In spite that there were different measures in the countries, there were three things in common at the same time: first, more focus on protecting employees from corona, second, how to move from work at the office to remote work in a timely manner, and third, how to allow flexibility to do work while ensuring the continuity of the civil service and without interruption in serving citizens despite the pandemic. He discussed the existence of different new ways to manage the civil service, such as the use of remote work and hybrid work, the existence of new ways to follow up on employees, the entry of the humanization of work and focus a lot on the employee's health and the quality of life that the employee lives, stimulating the employee's level of satisfaction, and new ways to work under pressure. He pointed out that organizations that have already invested in digital capabilities and/or in Human resources management were better positioned. He explained the need for efficiency and flexibility at work in order to overcome disasters and maintain the fundamental skills required for risk management and crisis management. This resulted in the development of new Human resources policies, the most important of which are: work independence, working time flexibility, and focusing on work outputs. He suggested ways to build the work force of tomorrow by developing innovative recruitment policies as well as reinforcing the attractiveness of the public service as a career of choice and of our organization as an employer of choice. These new policies should ensure diversity and inclusion by enhancing career paths, reinforcing leadership, communication and learning and development. Managers should be supported and valued as "people developers" which is the only way to build employees engagement and loyalty. Then, Ms. Linda Ait-Ameur from Belgium presented some practical examples of the work environment and the implementation of policies on well-being at work and how to raise awareness on the humanization of work among the various actors in the social and economic world. The result of humanization of work will have an effect to increase the motivation, productivity as well as job satisfaction of the employees. It will decrease stress as well as absenteeism. She also presented several models to measure the quality of the public service through the measurement of the employee engagement.

On the other hand, the Palestinian Expert, Mr. Wael Al-Rimawi, Director General of job planning and classification tables, focused on the development of the civil service in Palestine* over a period of ten years, updating and developing public service law and regulations and working to amend the

structure, enforcing legal policy, increasing transparency, employing people with disabilities, increasing institutional performance competencies, absorbing various scientific disciplines. He also presented the competencies project, and many other projects which the GPC is running. He presented thirteen different policies that the GPC developed to enhance the public services delivery in Palestine* integrating different technological systems to decrease cost, improve efficiency and for better monitoring and auditing.

Mr. Taoufik Azarual, Director of the Civil Service presented the national experience of Morocco and in particular the access to successful and motivating professional public employment in Morocco, based on competencies management, the environment, and a review of the legislative framework. He explained the timeline of the enhancement on the public services law since 1958. He also spoke about the national vision of reviewing and reforming the public service system in order to reach an efficient and stimulating public job through better competency management, restructuring of the senior civil service, aligning the civil service functions with the decentralization policy, reviewing the civil service structure, motivating and improving the working environment. Appropriate laws have been drafted to achieve each of them.

Ms. Laura Dospinescu presented the Egyptian experience on behalf of Ms Ghada Labib, Deputy Minister for Institutional Development at the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MCIT) and outlined the national policies that support the development of human capital and the quality of working life, as well as the technological transformation, which aims to meet citizens' demands in an efficient and effective manner. Egypt have Institutional Development Programs as well as Institutional Development Capacity Building Programs. They also had Institutional Development Initiatives for Digital Inclusion for government employees as well as citizens. She explained their affiliates Human Capacity Building initiatives and programs.

Mr. Mobarak Khalailah, Secretary General of the Civil Service Bureau, presented Jordan's experience and the challenges it faces, such as population growth and the increase in the number of refugees and immigrants despite limited job opportunities, the attractiveness of work in the private sector, and the arrival of new graduates of higher education. He emphasized that the civil and public employment cannot solve the problem of unemployment. He discussed the new modern concepts of planning, development management, and human resources to raise the skills level of the employee and enable him/her to move from one career path to another, as well as the subject of career and succession planning to ensure that no employee replaces those who leave.

The experts in the second session presented new training policies in the public service and discussed how to ensure the right training at the right time for the right agents, and how can we develop effective national training strategies that meet the needs of civil servants while respecting the principles of good governance. Some tools to identify needs and ensure greater efficiency of public services were introduced. Talent retention and investing in human capital to develop an attractive and user-friendly public service were discussed together with some best practices and networking in the field of training for civil servants and managers.

The European expert Ms. Caitriona Mullan, Independent European consultant in public sector governance and capacity building, spoke about developing human capital for good governance and effective administration giving examples from Northern Ireland. She also discussed developing human capital presenting institutional examples, good practices, and important analysis tools available including an analysis of the needs for training: The Council of Europe Training Needs Analysis Toolkit¹. This tool outlines the gaps, the causes of problems and their consequences, and the validity and effectiveness of workshops. Ms. Mullan mentioned different toolboxes that could be used as reference for example: The Quality of Public Administration "Toolbox" which was developed on behalf of the European Commission's Inter-service group on Public Administration Quality and Innovation². She also presented the OECD public governance review project for a civil service review that offered human resource development advice, to identify risks and orientate the risk management framework. This framework aimed at enabling the vision – and control the risk of not achieving it, the environment in which different groups and different staff levels operate, women-inclusive policies,

¹ <https://rm.coe.int/tna-and-nts-training-needs-analysis-and-national-training-strategies-h/1680746e54>

² <https://digital-strategy.ec.europa.eu/en/library/quality-public-administration-toolbox-practitioners>

policies that include employees who live in certain conditions, continuous development over a lifetime, as well as some questions that must be answered in general training strategies. She recommended to be clear on the vision – political buy-in is important but it is ideal when the political and administrative levels are in agreement and work symbiotically. In addition, the system / organisational vision and objectives become the territory on which approaches are mapped to building human capital. She emphasized that investment should be in the skills that really matter, with the right balance of specialist to broader skills, using a mixture of tools to identify and prioritise training. The Human resources plan should identify who you need to empower and how best can they learn and develop their capacity. Risks should be identified, and the risk management framework should be orientated to enable the vision – and control the risk of not achieving it.

The Palestinian expert, Mr. Wajdi Zeiad, Executive Manager of the Palestinian National School of Administration (PNSA), presented the national school as well as the goals of the public administration in terms of providing services and stimulating the economy. He stressed that the focus should not be on public service only, but also on stimulating the economy, and that the emphasis is not only on human resource management, but also on human resource development. PNSA provides training in the administrative field, but also in specialization areas as well as some other common areas needed by all ministries, e.g., public relations. The national school has developed several policies, at least six of which he mentioned, such as localising training, strengthening relationships, and networking with Korea as well as Singapore among others, connecting the employment and training paths, expanding e-learning and e-evaluation, talent management, and focusing on the trainees (90, 20, 8 Method). The PNSA is planning to work on Quality Assurance standard 9001, professionalism for trainees, accreditation for the trainings, as well as working on data driven policies and decisions.

The Moroccan experience presented by Mr. Jawad Sadiq, Head of the Human Resources Development Division focused on the policy of training and skills development in the context of Moroccan public administration. There was real need for skills development because of the different strategies developed such as: the national anti-corruption strategy, the National Strategy for the institutionalization of equality between men and women in the public service, the decentralisation charter, the digital transition, Renewable Energies: Energy Strategy 2030, as well as Port Strategy for 2030. He stated some problems in the recognition of continuous training as a right for civil servants in the general statute of the civil service. He also noted the lack of links between continuous education and the evaluation and promotion system; the lack of a link between continuous education and the professional career of the civil servant; the lack of links between continuing education and forward-looking management of jobs and skills; the fact that management of continuing education remains centralized in the majority of administrations; the lack of evaluation of the impact of continuous education expenditure; and the lack of a system of coaching, leadership development, and talent management. He proposed some perspectives to establish continuous education programs that meet the needs of the various ministerial departments in cross-cutting and vertical areas and use all existing means at the regional level within the framework of the pooling and use of training centers as well as setting up a continuous training evaluation system.

Ms. Khaoula Labidi, Director of the Tunisian National School of Administration (ENA), spoke about the quality of training at the National School in Tunis, the networking, and the training methodological guide presenting the mechanisms and tools for identifying training needs, as well as the publication of a professional reference framework for training managers. She focused on the courses on good governance; the combination of trainees from the public, private, and civil sectors; on soft skills as well as sectorial skills and good governance; and finally on the method in education on creativity and design thinking. She highlighted the results expected from ENA certification: a getting up to speed with practices; the implementation of international standards in training, in a constantly changing, complex and above all competitive world; a better attractiveness and positioning of the ENA at national and international level; clear and consistent processes to increase the efficiency of our structure and the international influence of the ENA; a culture of improvement of the organizational structure and an internal dynamic to create better learning, with special focus on the satisfaction of the different stakeholders.

The Jordanian expert Ms. Siham Alkhaldeh, Director general of the Institute of Public Administration, presented the government leadership center programs for administrative and

supervisory jobs, the stages of training (administrative, specialized as well as “bridging the performance gap” training) for the different levels to enhance the skills of civil servants. She emphasized that raising individual and institutional performance helps to improve the level of service quality, enhance integrity and control expenditure, thus increasing the satisfaction and confidence of service recipients.

The 15th UniDem Med seminar was also the occasion, between the 1st and the 2nd day, to present the follow-up of the reforms in the public administration of the partner countries on a theme addressed in a previous seminar, namely gender equality. In this context, the Moroccan expert, Ms. Latifa Benayad, Coordinator of the Inter-Ministerial Consultation Network (RCI) and Head of Department of the Social Gender Approach, discussed equality between men and women at work. She presented a normative framework where Morocco is committed on National, International and Institutional levels as well as the new development model adopted by the Government. She also presented the Strategy for Institutionalizing Gender Equality composed of three axes: 1) Strengthening of mechanisms to promote the integration of Gender Equality in the public service, 2) Integration of ES principles integrated into the HRM process, and 3) Anchoring of gender equality in the practices, behaviors and organizational culture of the administration. Morocco is committed to it through a national program to develop services, reform public administration, and raise public awareness. Morocco began conducting studies on the interaction between the public and private sectors, issuing a guide on the obstacles faced by women, and setting an important framework for gender equality. She also discussed several areas of work and their outcomes, such as the change in the texts of the different laws to empower women, extending maternal breastfeeding leave for women to a period of 21 months, the work of childcare centers within institutions. They have developed a Toolkit for gender-sensitive Human resources practices anchoring gender equality in the practices, behaviors and organizational culture of the administration. Finally, she presented a comparison of the old and new strategies for institutionalizing gender equality in the public service and showed that there is still a lot to be done to reach equality. She concluded by saying that despite women’s recognized skills in the public service, their qualifications and their career aspirations, they must also rely on women’s networking.

4. New Challenges for Public Service Policies

The third session looked at the new methods of public management, often inspired by the private sector, which emphasize empowerment, autonomy and efficiency, but which also inspire new strategies of performance assessment (individual and collective) and aim to strengthen the capacity of managers to better deal with crises and ensure better risk management. Experts pointed out the impact of these new management methods on good governance, the simplification of administrative procedures or the improvement of services to users.

The European expert, Mr. Jon Barber, Acute Hospital Director, discussed the role of Performance Management and Risk Management in public service providers. He also presented a tool for performance management risk management as well as internal audit. This tool³ developed by the Centre of expertise for good governance of the Council of Europe will lead to better efficiency, effectiveness and value for money in specific services and to improve public service provision generally. These are the keys to the employee's goals. Employees will be pleased if they have been able to evaluate themselves and become aware of where they are now and where they need to go. The approach used is called Objective and Key Results (OKR) which solves the challenge of executing strategy in a way that’s clear to all employees, transparent and measurable. OKRs consist of two parts: 1) Objectives: where you want to go – your goals for a set period (often one-quarter), and 2) Key Results: how far you progressed in the pursuit of these goals. This method has proven to be more efficient than just choosing some Key performance indicators and measuring employees’ performance accordingly. He also emphasized that staff are the most important asset, and they have to know their importance. On the other hand, he explained the use of a new scoring table to evaluate a risk defined as: Negligible, Minor, Moderate, Major, Catastrophic, and having a financial or an

³ <https://rm.coe.int/toolkit-on-performance-management-/168070c09f>

environmental impact as well as its likelihood and frequency of occurrence. These measures ensure the delivery of quality public services and address the challenges associated with the implementation of robust performance and risk management processes.

The Palestinian expert, Dr Samir Baidoun, Director of the MBA Program at Birzeit University in Palestine*, mentioned the criteria for change such as development, diversification, transition, replacement, improvement, and transformation when presenting the outstanding performance programs and the government excellence programs. He indicated that the different models that helped upgrading the performance in the private sector should be applied to the public sector. He also presented the objectives of the Excellence models, which includes assisting institutions in identifying appropriate improvement opportunities and activities that effectively enable them to achieve distinguished results; evaluating and analyzing institutional performance; achieving better results for employee and community satisfaction and spreading positive spirit and constructive values in the institution's culture. He also discussed the objectives of the Palestine* Program for Excellence in Governmental Performance, which included improving the quality of government services provided to customers, increasing workers' satisfaction with government performance and boosting their confidence in government plans and programs, ensuring governance and harmonizing plans, establishing effective government institutional partnerships, enabling the government work environment, and strengthening the government work environment. He emphasized that Excellence is a journey, not a final destination, and it must be continuous.

The Algerian expert Mr Abdelouahab Laouici, Director of Regulations and Status of Public Employment, presented the national performance assessment of employees and mentioned several forms of evaluation, such as monitoring and giving marks to the employee. He spoke about the new evaluation system, which consists of two main points: the performance evaluation criteria and the professional interview. And whose objective is to involve the employee in the performance evaluation process so that the evaluation is free of bias. Employees have the possibility to object to their evaluation report.

Mr. Fayez Moh'd Ismail Alnahr, Advisor to the President of the Civil Service Bureau of Jordan, introduced the job evaluation performance in the civil government and the performance evaluation criteria, which includes 21 criteria. He emphasized that we cannot claim that there is a more appropriate evaluation criterion, but there is a hybrid criterion that combines several evaluation criteria at the same time. He also discussed performance management methodology, which includes sectoral goals, strategic goals, directorate operational goals, department operational goals, and employee performance goals.

The fourth and last session presented the way to control the cost of the wage bill in the public service, especially in times of economic crisis. It addressed ways of reconciling the efficiency of public services and the control of the wage bill while preserving the principles of equity, good governance and responsibility. The implementation of a calm and constructive social dialogue in this context was also discussed.

The European expert, Ms. Eliane Chemla, Vice-President of the European Committee of Social Right of the Council of Europe, focused on the issue of trade unions, the right to join a trade union, trade union rights as well as right of negotiation. Employees have the right to be members of a trade union. She introduced the European Committee of Social Rights that focuses on respect of workers' rights guaranteed by the European Charter of Social Rights. The Charter is closely linked to the European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms: many of the rights protected by the Convention are detailed in the Charter, which is why the Committee usually refers to the European Social Charter as "human rights in everyday life". She began by presenting this Charter, as well as the methods and objectives of the Committee in charge of its protection. The Committee's role is to notify each State for each article of the Charter if it finds a situation of non-compliance. The State thus notified is supposed to reform its texts and/or its practice to bring them into conformity with the rights that it has undertaken to protect. She talked about trade union rights and bargaining rights which are dealt with in Articles 5 and 6 of the Charter. On the one hand, these rights act as "oil in the wheels" to ensure peaceful dialogue and a good working atmosphere, on the other hand, they are an invaluable source of information and initiative to improve good governance and the work efficiency, both in companies and in public services. In order to ensure that these rights contribute

to a fruitful dialogue, the Committee has specified the conditions under which it is desirable to manage them. She emphasized that the concern for good management and efficiency of public services or companies will only progress in close connection with respect for the rights of the workers who ensure their functioning.

The Palestinian expert, Mr. Fareed Ghannam, Deputy Minister at the Ministry of Finance, discussed the employee finances and the method of distributing salaries and quasi-salaries in Palestine*. He detailed the total monthly salary expenditure in Palestine*, which totals 650 million NIS. He also presented the strategy to manage public money according to national priorities. He explained how the Israeli authorities deducts 3% as collection fees as well as other deductions for water, electricity, health and environment. Israel's deductions from Palestinian clearing funds exceeded the one-billion-shekel barrier during the first ten months of 2021. The clearing funds, which are the taxes, customs and excise duties imposed on goods imported from abroad and coming to the Palestinian market, are collected by the Israeli Ministry of Finance staff on a monthly basis. In addition to the previous deductions, 3% will be deducted from the total clearing funds as fees for the staff of Israel's finance staff, according to the Paris Economic Protocol. He presented the policies for the development of local revenues, represented by the expansion of the tax base, as well as the development of collection procedures. The change was noticeable but there is still a gap in the annual budget. Work was done to reduce the salary bill through early retirement or voluntary departure, but there was no difference or clear effect.

The Tunisian expert, Mr. Tarek Haj Salah, Director General of Public Remuneration at the Ministry of Finance, mentioned the difficult economic conditions, where the wage bill contributed to the general increase in the state budget over the period 2010-2021 to represent 37% of the state budget in 2021. He explained how the control of the wage bill, particularly in the public sector, is an essential and crucial topic for economic equilibrium and for the balance of a country's budget. There is no unified and ready-made methodology, which would enable the definition of a single and abstract concept of the "wage bill", quantifiable and comparable regardless of the peculiarities of each country. However, it is possible to achieve convincing results through a fundamental reform backed by a clear and serious political will to control, stabilize and rationalize the mass of wages. He suggested that governance was one of the reasons for the lack of reforms in the public service system, given that there was no relation between performance and the observed goals, or the reduction of the retirement age by two years from 60 to 58. In order to control the payroll and improve the performance of the public service and following what was agreed upon in the Public Employment Law, a 57-year early retirement program was implemented in 2018 which provides that the civil servant receives a pension equivalent to what he/she should have received when he/she should have retired in a few years. However, these measures have not led to satisfactory results, especially as a result of the commitments undertaken by various governments following trade union pressures and in view of the political instability.

The Jordanian expert, Prof. Dr. Abdalla Yousef Awad Al-Ababneh, President of the National Center for Human Resources Development, stated that the most difficult challenge he faces is the recruitment and its sustainability in the face of resource depletion. He suggested that anyone entering the public service must be trained according to the importance of what the job requires, with the help of all educational institutions in order to attract any kind of employee to work in the public sector. He suggested that every country should create a national observatory to monitor future professions, skills and competencies needed for tomorrow. He emphasized the importance of creating a critical mass in every national institution that is responsible for leading the change process. This critical mass must be highly empowered in terms of skills, culture, and intellectual, entrepreneurial and creative mind. In order to ensure that they remain in the public service, there must be substantial incentives in the public service system to retain these skilled people as it exists in the Jordanian public service system. If this issue is not address, it will result in the transfer of these competencies from public service to the other parties that target them with financial incentives. He suggested that this would lead to an imbalance in competencies and thus the service provided by Jordan's institutions. In Jordan, there is a trend to restore the balance between technical, professional, and academic recruitment paths. The Ministry of Education is working on a plan for the national qualifications framework that aims to bridge formal and informal education and the placement all of the skills and competencies that each person possesses according to international

standards. The systems in the public service need to be prepared to deal with this category of young men and women to be positioned in the appropriate scale in the public service.

5. Recommendations

Based upon the different sessions and participants interventions, here are some recommendations that should be followed up in order to enable the desired change in public service policies and their implementation:

- Promote flexibility at work through appropriate regulations and policies.
- Putting health, well-being as well as good working conditions at the heart of public service policies.
- Motivate employees and humanize work to improve productivity as well as job satisfaction of employees. It will also decrease stress and absenteeism.
- Use the Belgium experience which has developed models to measure the quality of the public service through the measurement of the employee engagement.
- Update and develop Laws to better serve employees. The Moroccan expert presented several laws that can be a good reference.
- Employ and integrate people with disabilities.
- Use the Toolkit for gender-sensitive Human resources practices developed by Inter-Ministerial Concertation Network in Morocco.
- Develop human resources policies and identify the risks using the tool presented in the third session by Jon Barber.
- Use the [Council of Europe Toolkit on performance management](#).
- Use the [Council of Europe Training Needs Analysis Toolkit](#).
- Invest in the right kind of training. Adults learn 6/7 times more through practice and feedback, mentoring, learning sets or self-directed learning within robust framework.
- Expand e-learning and technological training.
- Better connect the career path to the training path.
- Support training policies through training and strengthening relationships and networking among institutions in the region.
- Develop and promote policies for innovation and service excellence.
- Emphasize the need for continuous Strategic Planning.
- Focus on Human capital development, local planning, quality of working life, transparency, integrity, and equal opportunity.
- Encourage employee involvement in the evaluation process at all stages.
- Use the best evaluation that takes all factors into account.
- Develop new policies, the most important of which are work independence, flexibility at work, and a focus on work outputs.
- Pay particular attention to the control of the wage bill and its impact on the quality of social life.
- Improve individual and institutional performance to contribute to improving the level of service quality, strengthening integrity and controlling expenditure, thus increasing the satisfaction and confidence of service recipients.
- Performance excellence is a journey, not a final destination, and it must be continuous.
- Create a national observatory to monitor future professions, skills and competencies for tomorrow.

On the other hand, there was a direct recommendation to the Palestinian General Personal Council to create Employees Incentive Prize to increase their productivity and enhance resources. More efforts should be done for the promotion of the achievements of the GPC to the public servants as well as the other citizens.

Moreover, everyone agreed that these seminars are very important for exchange of knowledge and experience, but they should be followed by study visits to get to know the difference experiences and tools used in the different partner countries.

6. Conclusion

Over the two days, the 15th Unidem Med seminar brought together an average of 300 professionals and senior officials from the southern Mediterranean region and beyond, either in the conference room in Ramallah, Palestine* or online via the Zoom platform. The presentations and discussions highlighted a hanging resemblance in the worries and difficulties affecting the public sector in the administrations represented. The presentations and discussions concentrated mainly on the Human resources new models and innovative training policies aiming at creating attractive working conditions that respects the rights of public service officers. The level of relative improvement and precedence plans, on the other hand, varied amongst countries. Several efforts have been made to supply the administration with the capacity to adapt in order to stay up with the evolution of its surroundings while also serving the requirements of its residents.

Participants agreed on the importance of continuing with these meetings. They suggested organizing a future meeting where senior civil servants from each country could participate to exchange experiences and skills needed for better Human resources management and to develop together a general framework on digitization; modernization between the political and administrative levels of government; the improvement of policies and infrastructure, and the exchange of information between the different experts and practitioners by using clear digital presentations to help advance the change. They all approved the need for more than two days to discuss the themes of the seminar and the need for a follow up seminar to discuss the implementation of the recommendations above.